WICKLOW COUNTY COUNCIL



Wicklow County Council COMHAIRLE CHONTAE CHILL MHANTAIN

Transcript of the County Council Special Meeting Held on 26 September 2016 In the County Council Chamber, Wicklow



Telephone	
Fax	(0404) 64354
Email	info@pcr.ie
Website	www.pcr.ie

Text streamed live to the web on www.seewritenow.ie



1	<u>Disclaimer:</u> The following is the transcript of the realtime text transcribed during the meeting.
2	The realtime text service and subsequent transcript are for the purposes of accessibility to the
3	public meetings of the Wicklow County Council, and are not intended or portrayed as an official
4	verbatim note or minutes of the meetings. And while we take care to ensure the service is as
5	accurate as is possible, some errors may and do occur.
6	
7	Wicklow County Council 26th September 2016:
8	
9	CATHAOIRLEACH: Good morning, sorry for, we're five minutes late, so we'll go ahead into
10	the meeting, starting with item number one.
11	
12	"To consider the variation of the basic rate of Local Property Tax and the setting of the local
13	adjustment factor in accordance with the Finance (Local Property Tax) Act 2012 (as amended) to
14	apply for the period of one year, from the next Local Property Tax liability date 1st November
15	2016." And I think Debbie you're going to give us a presentation, is that right?
16	MS CROMIE: Yeah. Good morning everybody. I'm sure everybody knows me, my name is
17	Deborah Cromie, I'm acting Head of Finance, I've just been asked to give a quick presentation in
18	relation to the Local Property Tax, you all have got your report, so I just want to talk about a few
19	points.
20	
21	Okay so Budget 2017 the key tasks, the first one is Local Property Tax variation, which we're
22	considering now this morning. Then we have the Municipal District budgetary plan, this is the
23	general municipal allocation, so this is a pool of discretionary funding made available to
24	Municipal District members, how it's calculated, following the determination of the available
25	number and overall fixed, semi fixed and non-discretionary costs.
26	
27	Then we're going to do our draft and we adopt our statutory annual budget probably towards the
28	end of November, we also have to look at the commercial rates and to determine the date of your
29	adjustment for 2017 and the rates on vacant premises (rates relief) and schedule of Municipal
30	District works level of service for budget provisions will deliver in each MD, that goes out
31	probably early January.
32	
33	So I alluded to this last week, probably at CPG, about this acute financial matters group. So it
34	was established by the CCMA finance committee. Now it was tasked with identifying,

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie documenting and discussing the acute finance matters that are having, or will have, an
 unacceptable impact on the finance of local government.

So they've issued 7 reports to date. So compensation 2016, commercial rates, Haddington
Road/Lansdowne road agreement, non-domestic water billing and collection, Irish Water rates
exemptions, non-HFA related loans, local authority funding of the HAP scheme -- I'm just
saying this, I want to put the whole budget 2017 in context for everybody.

So compensation 2016 looked at the impact of global revaluations on local authority, Irish Water
rates exemptions, looked at pension related deductions and pay and pension. Now we've already
said the impact on global valuations here in Wicklow has affected us last year and the full effect
is taking place now for 2017. Irish Water rates exemptions, Irish Water have been made
exemptions from paying rates, however the Department of Environment actually compensates
Wicklow, we're one of a number of local authorities who had our water network rated. That's
worth 2.1 million to us. Pension related deduction and then pay and pension.

16

3

8

17 The second report they issued was commercial rates. At May 2016 the total revisions on hand 18 with the valuation office for Wicklow were 190, if you take off 10% for delist, i.e. properties that 19 are probably not commercial anymore, that leaves 171. There's an estimated value of rates 20 income based on those 171 properties of €752,400 that we are not able to access at the moment 21 because the valuation office have told us that budget 2017 they will only value 50 of our 22 properties, 26 of those properties will be for the individual rates payer who wants their valuation 23 changed, 24 is what we would prioritise, we prioritise them on the basis that we hope to get 24 income from them.

So then we had Haddington/Lansdowne Road agreement. So the cumulative costs for Wicklow
between 2016 and 2018 is 9.5 million at an average cost of 3.1 million per year. So this acute
financial matters group are lobbying the Department on behalf of all local authorities to say that
Haddington Road, the Lansdowne Road will have an impact on us.

30

25

The fact is in years gone by when we lost -- when we had reduced our staff numbers, our general purpose grant was actually reduced in line with that, now we are saying this is coming back in to force, we need to be compensated. And they've done four other reports, non-domestic billing, for us the fact, as everybody knows, our non-domestic billing migrated over to Irish Water over a week ago, but that is costing us on staffing alone of 250,000, because we're not billing those staff, we can't recoup the costs of those staff. Again as I said earlier on Irish Water rates, we are being compensated by the Department for them at the moment, that's 2.1 million, if the Department ever decided that they weren't going to fund that. The HFA water related loans, non-HFA don't affect us. Then local authority funding of staff for HAP is 231,000 for us, that's 2.6 million. Again as I'm saying, I'm putting into context, we are not sitting down, we're not being quiet about it, there are people out there trying to lobby the Department to highlight how local authorities are funded, or the lack of funding I should say. So budget 2016, the maintenance of LPT, maintenance of the LPT ensured the following, so 150,000 to homeless, 250,000 to community grants, 200,000 to DPG, playgrounds 195,000, recycling centres 250,000, library services 300,000, Rates Incentive Scheme 250,000, economic development 275,000, Municipal District discretionary funding 580,000 and the Bray/Greystones cliff walk 50,000. That was 2.5 million. Now I'm just going to talk myself because I know about it, Rates Incentive Scheme, now we brought that in for Budget 2016, so we're offering 5% discount to rate payers who had properties valued at 10,000 euro or less and who had no arrears, up to a maximum of 250, they got a grant. Now I suppose it's anecdotal at the moment, and we have changed the way -- we've changed the way we do rates, but our collection at the moment is 4% up from this time last year, and that is definitely helped by the Rates Incentive Scheme.

The Local Property Tax is critical, okay? It's a reserved function, we're here today. To resolve to vary the basic rate of LPT within in its functional area by a maximum of plus or minus 15%, we have to make the decision before September 30th, must be notified to the Revenue Commissioners and to the Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government.

31

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Our allocation. So 100% of the LPT income allocation for Wicklow is 17 million, that's what Revenue Commissioners reckon they are going to get for Wicklow. 20% automatically goes to the equalisation fund, we don't see it, feel it, nothing, it's gone. 80% of the LPT to be retained locally is 13.6 million.

The Department say our baseline, i.e. minimum requirement we need for funding is 8.5 million, that's the minimum they reckon Wicklow needs. They say right well you actually have a surplus, a surplus of 5 million, and of that surplus what you have to do is 20% of the total of the 17 million is net discretionary income, you can do with it what you like, basically that's going towards funding all our services. And the difference, the 1.6 million has to be used to self fund housing.

9

1

2

Now this self fund housing we probably would have received it in years gone by in the form of
capital grand, that's gone. We have to fund 1.6 million. So no matter what happens here today
we're funding 1.6 million, 1.68 million towards our housing. So the amount of LPT to be filed in
2017 pending any decision to vary the basic rate is 13.6 million. And every 1% variation is
170,563.

15

So in varying the rate the local authority must have regard to the following matters, the local authority's estimation of the income it will receive and the expenditure it will incur for the period for which the varied rates is to have effect, the financial position of the local authority, the financial effect of the varied rate and feedback from any consultation held. Now this is all in the report, but I'm just highlighting it.

21

So we contacted all the departments, sections in the, in Wicklow here and we asked them to submit your draft budgetary plans and they did so after much cajoling last Friday week. So they have told us, we totted all them out, got the calculator out, we totted everything, we're looking at spending 98.2 million in 2017. Now what I am saying to you is there has been no critical analysis of this done by Finance, this is literally what the departments or sections in Wicklow have returned to us, we reckon our current income is 91.9 million for 2017.

- 28
- So if the rate remains unchanged we are still short 6.35 million. And if we reduce it by 15%
 we're going to be 8.9 million short.
- 31

Now as I said we've done no critical analysis, that's going to happen between the last -- well after
 today and the end of November when we probably will hold our Budget Meeting.

34

5

1 So that's how it's looking at the moment, the draft revenue budget. 18.2 million for housing, 2 18.7 for road transportation and safety, 6.1 for water services, 9.3 for development management, 3 10.8 environmental services, 6.4 recreation and amenity, 1.4 agriculture, education, health and 4 welfare, miscellaneous is 11.5 and then central management costs 15.3. Again I'm emphasising, 5 this is it warts and all, Finance have to get down, look at every section, look at every line and 6 come back to a balanced budget before the end of November.

8 Our income, looking at the moment our income, 21.2 million is going to come from grants and 9 subsidies, 30.8 goods and services, LPT if we maintain the rate 11.9 and rates 27.8.

11 So the financial position of the local authority at the end of December 2015, we have a deficit of 12 3.43 million and we also have capital deficits and we have requested both Auditor and 13 Department undertake a review of unfunded balances and to agree a plan to tackle the deficits. I 14 would also say in relation to revenue deficits it's one of our service indicators that we have to 15 send to the National Oversight Audit Committee every year and we have to report on our deficit. 16 And we are under pressure now to make sure that we address it, if not reduce it, maintain it and 17 in this case we don't want to increase it.

So we had to go out to consultation in relation to LPT and an ad was put in the local newspaper around 20th July, it had until 26th August to come back to us, we did text alert, did the website, we e-mailed yourselves, so we got 23 submissions. 14 were in favour of a 15% reduction, five were in favour of maintaining the basic rate and four were others like abolish it! So now to look at the financial effect of the varied rate on the individual and on the local authority.

There's that great slide there, so Revenue, according to Revenue there's 52,100 properties liable for LPT in the county. And they've broken it down by bands, so there's 12% in valuation bands 0 to 100,000, 18 percent of the properties are 100,000 to 150, 27 of 150 to 200,000 and then towards the end there's 300,000 -- that's slightly wrong it's 300,000 and more, not just up to 350,000, that are 14% of housing in that value band.

30

24

7

10

18

So if we take the top one, 0 to 100,000 the standard rate is ⊕0, if you reduce that by 15% that's a
reduction of €14 per annum, 1.17 per month and 27 cent per week. I won't go down through the
others, you can see, it's actually in the report, there is some analysis done in the report.

34

I suppose I'm going to just jump, if we reduce the LPT by 15% it's going to affect Wicklow
 County Council by 2.5 million. So if I just go back right, so 0 to 100,000, if we reduce it by
 15% it's €14 per annum, if I reduce it by 15% the effect it will have on Wicklow County Council
 is 2.5 million.

5

So the LPT, it's a reserved function of Wicklow County Council, it's an opportunity to provide
targeted investment in services, it's also an opportunity to prevent cuts in services. That's it,
thank you.

9 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thanks Debbie. I'm sure -- I don't see any lights on yet but I'm sure
10 they'll start. Cllr O'Brien.

11 Cllr O'BRIEN: Looking at the report here, I must say it convinces me more than ever that we 12 should reduce it by 15%. When we look at page 4 of it and see the amount of tax that is taken 13 out of the pockets of the people in Wicklow, look at the commercial rates there, then when you 14 consider all the tax going out for the central government, you know what that is, it's an amount, 15 all we're looking for is a reduction of something very small indeed.

16

17 If you look at page 5 there and you look at what is spent last year, now I understand at the 18 moment that we're in a crisis in relation to housing and homelessness and stuff like that, you 19 look at it there and you see 150,000 -- now I wonder if my fellow colleagues are happy that that's 20 the way you spend the Local Property Tax. There are lots of things I see there that I would see 21 in this particular time, emergency housing where you have children and families on waiting lists 22 for ten or 11 years, they are actually inappropriate and I would be suggested we need a major 23 overhaul of the budget, both here in Wicklow and centrally and then set about sorting the major 24 crisis we have, which is housing.

When you go on to look at the liability there, page 8 and if you just point out there that the middle ground 200,000, that it would cost a reduction, 15% is costing €4 a month and 92 cent a week, I was hoping using that mathematical wizardry if you went back far enough that the property tax might disappear altogether, the real figure you need to look at is the first one there, the 90 for the basic and 585, you are looking at the 15%, not the 85% that the ordinary Wicklow people are forced to pay, that's where the focus needs to be put, people -- the 585 for the top there.

33 34

25

There are a lot of people that can do with that 51,100 properties there, mortgages I assume they

are paying, there's a lot of elderly people living in those houses as well, I would like to see those
 factors put into play as well.

3

I was going to state at the start there's probably 13 million reasons why we should reduce the
property tax. When you look at the -- you pointed out 20% of the Local Property Tax goes to
central government funds, yet they can't collect tax of 13 million of their own, there's something
seriously wrong with a situation like that.

8

9 I would say the least we can expect is our colleagues would back the reduction by 15% as I say, I
10 did point out that the budget needs to be looked at overall, thank you very much.

11 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Ryan.

12 Cllr RYAN: Thanks a lot Cathaoirleach. No shock there that Sinn Fein would go for the 13 populist line on this, that's what they do which is fine. I think it's important to recognise straight 14 away that last year the counsellors who made the non-populist decision to actually not reduce the 15 property tax invested money in homelessness, in funding, so you're saying that's not a good idea.

16

In DPG grants, 200,000, in -- there's, in playgrounds 195,000 -- I think the biggest problem I
have here today is I don't think the Council has done a good job in actually talking about these
things. Just putting them up there, I'd like a presentation from the different departments talking
about the impact that our decision last year, not to reduce by 15% has had on people across this
county.

22

23 Because to me that's the story. The people around this table who made the decision and the 24 people across Wicklow who paid that extra amount of money are the ones who have actually 25 delivered on homeless funding, on community grants, on playgrounds, on recycling centres, on 26 library services, on the rate incentive schemes, and given 580,000 to Municipal Districts to 27 spend in their own areas. Since the property tax was brought in, that's above us decisions are 28 made, but the thing is people of Wicklow want to see delivery on the ground. I think the area 29 they want to see it is in the Municipal Districts in civic spaces and making the places we live in 30 better places. I think that's really, really important. So I think before decisions are made like 31 that, just to say let's go populist and let's reduce it, people should think long and hard about the 32 impact that this actually has, this decision we make today has on the people of this county.

- 33
- 34

Just some questions I have that I'd love you to answer, just with regard to, that confuses the hell

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie out of me, that we no longer do non-domestic water billing but we're still being charged, our
 budget is impacted by 250 grand? I really just don't understand that. Can we not just throw that
 back to Irish Water and say you pay this, it's your job to bill, so that just confuses the hell out of
 me.

I agree completely that when we were reducing staff because of the crisis our budget went down from central government because of that, now that we're increasing it, the fact that they don't actually support us in that regard I think is absolutely crazy.

10 And the other thing that drives me nuts is this global revaluation of utilities, can you please tell 11 us -- that's over half a million that that's actually, we get a hit. Last year the decision was made 12 by the government actually supported us in that regard, it doesn't make sense to me, I can't get 13 my head around it. What form -- actually which are the big utilities, I take it it's ESB must be 14 the biggest in the country I know Irish Water is dealt with separately, but in terms of this, what 15 actually drove the decision to reduce the amount of money that those utilities are paying? 16 Because in effect they are taking away funding from local government which make it is 17 incredibly difficult for us to deliver on what we're supposed to do as better things for the people 18 of this county. Thank you.

19 Cllr KENNEDY: Thank you Cathaoirleach and thank you Debbie for the presentation. Just two 20 things Debbie I'd like to ask you. One was the Rates Incentive Scheme, how many businesses 21 got notification of this scheme? And what was the uptake of the incentive scheme and how was 22 it promoted? I know a number of businesses they have told me they got no notification of the 23 incentive scheme. That would be question number one I have.

24

5

6

7

8

9

25 Question number two would be under the homeless funding, with 150,000 put in there, did the 26 government fund this through central funding and if so where did the 150,000 go? Because I 27 was of the understanding last year if central government funded that, 50,000 will come back to 28 the community, cultural and social development department and the five Municipal Districts 29 would get 10,000 each from that fund, that was my understanding last year during the budget. I 30 know definitely in the Arklow Municipal District we did not get that 10,000 back of our share of 31 the money. My understanding is the government did fund that, maybe you can clarify both of 32 those please.

Cllr LAWLESS: Thank you Cathaoirleach. I know it's already been said here today that Sinn
 Fein are taking the populist line by reducing the Local Property Tax by 15%, but the thing is we

don't actually believe in this tax, we want this tax abolished.

3 The Irish people as we although were taxed on absolutely everything and people just don't have any more money. I think asking people in Wicklow to give more is just very, very unfair. I 4 5 know Cllr Ryan was saying well you're taking from the homeless service, there was money given in to it last year, yes that is true, but if there's a shortfall it's not up to the people of 6 7 Wicklow to make up that shortfall, the people of Wicklow are actually paying their taxes. All 8 your tax is going back to central government. It's up to the government then to allocate that 9 accordingly. If there's a shortfall the government have some cheek to come back down to the 10 people of Wicklow and say hang on a second, we haven't got enough money here to help the 11 homeless people, we'll ask you for more money out of people's pockets. And people do not have 12 it. So I'm formally proposing that Sinn Fein are putting forward a proposal for the reduction of 13 the 15%. If we had our own way we would abolish it, but we can't, so the best we can do for the 14 people of Wicklow is reduce it by the 15%.

16 When we were speaking to people on the doors, people do not like this tax, it is a very, very 17 unfair tax. I'm in absolute no denial here that Wicklow is short of income. I can clearly see it. 18 I'm well able to read the figures. But I don't believe in this tax and I cannot, cannot support an 19 increase on the people of Wicklow. We are taxed to the hilt and we are getting absolutely 20 nothing in return from this government. They just take, take, take and take. We need money for 21 this, we need money for that. So let's just tax the people of this country. That's all this 22 government seems to do but we never seem to see anything much in return. They need to stop 23 this, because what's happening is the economy is not going to grow because people don't have 24 money to spend. The money you take off people the less they have to spend back in our local 25 communities.

26

15

1

2

So I will stand very firm and Sinn Fein stands very firm that we'll reduce, we want the property
tax reduced by 15% here today. Thank you.

- 29 CATHAOIRLEACH: You are making a formal proposal, is that it?
- 30 Cllr LAWLESS: I am yes.
- 31 CATHAOIRLEACH: Can I have a seconder for that please? Cllr McDonald.
- 32 Cllr WALSH: Debbie in your presentation there you referred to the draft budgetary plans you
- 33 got from various departments to deliver services, 98 odd million there, you said there would be,
- 34 at the moment you're looking a shortfall of 6.35 million -- if just what are proposed to meet that

shortfall and how does it compare with the previous years? And also the commercial rates
figures you say 171 properties there with the valuation office with an estimated value of 752,400
and only 50 odd being valued at the moment, is there any way we can bring pressure to bear on
the valuation office, I know the staff shortages and stuff there, to address those issues thank you.
Cllr BOURKE: First of all I'd like to call on Sinn Fein to spell out where they're going to make
the cuts because they're taking 2 and a half million out of the budget but the Council will have to
cut services, it's logical the money won't be there.

8 Cllr LAWLESS: That's not my job.

- 9 Cllr BOURKE: It's very disingenuous of Sinn Fein's spokespersons or any member of this
 10 Council to propose cutting it by 15% without coming along with proposals of where those cuts
 11 are going to land and what effect it will have on the people in this county for the next 12 months.
- 12

13 I don't like the property tax any more than anything. But I believe that I should pay my fair 14 share to fund services. And I just think it's very disingenuous to go for the populist catch-all 15 line, reducing the property tax by 15%, it sounds like great people, but you are not going to do 16 this county any service by doing it. And it's putting it back on central government, who are 17 already taxing the people of this country to the hilt, we're paying the highest rates of tax in 18 Europe. You're going to make it worse for the people that are paying all the middle income 19 groups that are paying, that are funding the services in the State, so just think carefully about 20 that. You talk about going after the rich, well the rich people are probably going to disappear, 21 Michael O'Leary has stated the more go after them the more of them that will disappear out of 22 the country. You're chasing an empty promise.

23

24 Just going back to last year, we were told that Councils, I'm not sure if it was Cllr Vance, 25 suggested, or some councillor, maybe the manager, was suggesting Councils who reduce by 15% 26 can go whistle if they want to get extra funding from central government for special projects, 27 was that threat real or empty? Did we get extra funding during the year for any special projects 28 because we were good boys and girls and went for the base rate, by staying on the base rate, 29 have we actually benefited as a county? I'd like to ask the Director of Services, of Finance, have 30 we benefited as a county by holding that line and to what extent? Because that's really important 31 as well, to know what Councils were penalised that did reduce. Were they penalised, did they 32 fail to get extra funding during the year for the special projects? Thank you Cathaoirleach. 33 Cllr MATTHEWS: Thanks Chairman, just a question for Debbie on the presentation, difference 34 from last year and this year is around 7 or 8 million. It seems to be made up of a reduction in

> Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

- confirmation that that's the grants cuts we're looking at and what grants does it refer to and from
 what departments in government? The 2.3 million increase in payroll, is that going to provide us
 with more staff because we've spoken about many times down here the Municipal Districts and
 the staffing problems that we have, staff that are there are currently over worked, they really
 need assistance in that, so if that's to provide more staff I don't have a problem with that. If you
 could just explain what the 0.3 in social benefits expenditure and maybe briefly outline the 4.4.
- 9

1

2

And just I think Cllr Bourke said, I'd like if somebody is proposing to cut property tax that they
also follow that up with the responsibility thing to say, what services they're planning to cut,
because I can't vote for something unless I know the full thing.

- Cllr FOX: Thank you Chairman, first of all, can I say I'm disappointed, a motion that Cllr
 Murphy, Cllr Nolan, Cllr Ruttle and myself put forward supported by all sides of this chamber,
 in relation to the equalisation fund, that the department have dragged their heels on our request
 to meet with them, because it is one of the most unjust elements of the property tax, and I would
 agree with Cllr Lawless insofar as this tax is unfair, it is not an equitable tax, and people in
 Wicklow, because of their close proximity to Dublin, have high house values.
- 20 It's not a real cash value, it's just a value because of their location and therefore are paying more 21 than the rest of the country who are in similar houses but with lower values. So then to take 20% 22 of Wicklow's tax and give it to other local authorities, and I know I'm rehashing this and beating 23 a drum on this for a while as are my three colleagues here beside me, but to say that we have not 24 got any response and it goes back to what Cllr Bourke says, we kept the rate at 100% last year, 25 we were good boys and good girls, and it gave us a bit of leverage to go to the Department and 26 say look we kept the property tax, despite it being high, we kept it at 100% and we need to look 27 at the equalisation end of things. We got no response of any note from the Department on that.
- 28

19

On varying the LPT rate, I fully understand councillors who are looking to reduce it by 15%, I can see where they're coming from. There are people out there who have a lot of financial commitments and are finding it hard to meet those commitments and I have a lot of sympathy for those people. However, the financial reality is that this authority would be totally hamstrung financially with a reduction of 15%. And I can't support a reduction on that principle, because I believe in what Cllr Ryan said at the start, that we do have to provide services and all the various programmes that he outlined, we cannot cut back on these services to a level where we're not
 providing any service at all.

3

4 And sometimes the popular decision is not the right decision and I know by not reducing 15% is an unpopular decision, but I'm prepared to maintain the LPT, because when I go into all the 5 6 various departments in this building and I ask for traffic calming or I ask for housing 7 maintenance, or I ask for central heating funding, I do so knowing that I have provided the 8 funding to do that. I feel I would be a hypocrite to propose to reduce the funding by 15% and 9 then continue at municipal meetings and full council meetings, asking for programmes to be 10 funded, it just doesn't tally. So I certainly will not be supporting the motion to reduce the LPT 11 by 15%. Thank you.

12 CATHAOIRLEACH: That's there's a couple of councillors looking to come back in again but I
 13 want to go to councillor that is haven't. Cllr Winters.

14 Cllr WINTERS: I would agree with Cllr Fox and Cllr Ryan, it would be extremely easy to say 15 let's cut it, but I look at our own Municipal District and see what we've done with the 16 discretionary spend that we as the six councillors have had the option to spend over the last two 17 years, and on both occasions we have chosen to provide projects that wouldn't have funding 18 from anywhere else, they are things that the residents and citizens of this county want. We put in 19 lighting in Newtownmountkennedy, we would never have got that lighting publicly funded only 20 that we have the Local Property Tax, same with the footpaths, we put in a footpath in Rathnew 21 this year, that wouldn't have happened without the discretionary fund, and the fund wouldn't 22 happen without the Local Property Tax. So we have no optional really, except to say we as a 23 Council if we want to provide services to our community, how we fund it is through Local 24 Property Tax and I think a lot of people will actually say yes it's €36 or maybe €48 that I could 25 save, it's 4 euro a month or I can have a library, I can have recycling and for the services they get 26 for that €4 a month, I think people will be happier to pay it and to have the quality of services. 27 The quality of the services could always be improved an that's something that we're going to 28 have to look at in the budget and see what are we providing with the money and are we making it 29 work the best way possible for constituents, but that's a totally different thing. This is about 30 making the decision to provide the services, I believe that we have to not reduce the Local 31 Property Tax, thank you.

Cllr BEHAN: Chairman I don't deny the genuine sense for people who are arguing for
 maintenance of the property tax at the increased rate, which was increased last year by 15%, and
 I don't doubt their goodwill and I don't doubt their good intentions, but I think we have to stand

1 back just for a minute or two and look at what happened with property tax not only in Wicklow 2 but throughout this country. Which is that the rates support grant that used to be paid to 3 Councils was effectively ceased when the property tax began. But the people's tax burden centrally didn't reduce, it increased with the introduction of USC. So the ordinary family in this 4 5 county, their central tax burden has not decreased, it's increased, but the money that would have 6 in the past, the proportion that would have gone to local authorities, was just stopped, and the 7 councillors of the country were then asked to implement or to go with the finance that comes 8 from property tax. And the only element of discretion we're being given is that we can reduce 9 the burden by a maximum of 15%.

11 Now people might say that it doesn't matter and 15% is nothing and people don't mind paying 12 for the service. I don't know who they are talking to, these councillors who say that, because 13 certainly the people I talk to are absolutely incensed about the property tax overall, about the 14 burden that it places on them and they are doubly incensed when local public representatives 15 who have one chance every year to reduce that burden, even by a small amount, they 16 consistently refuse to do it. Sorry not consistently, we did it two years ago, we didn't do it last 17 year and it looks like already we're not going to do it this year and I think it's going to be a 18 major, major disappointment for people of the county.

The reality of it is that according to all the Department rules we have enough money to run this county as it stands without having a 15% additional increase. That's why we're being allowed the opportunity to reduce by 15%, so I reject the argument that's put forward here that there are going to have to be cuts because we might reduce the property tax by 15%. If there were going to be cuts in basic services we wouldn't have been allowed by the Department to cut it in the first place. So that's a myth.

26

19

10

Another myth is councillors who vote for 15% reduction today have in some way to come up with what they are going to cut or replace, that's not the function of this meeting, that's a matter for the estimates meeting when the time comes, councillors should understand, I'm sure they do understand that. The decision we make today is whether we are going to give the people of this county a break, even a small break, even a small reduction, the reduction that we are allowed to make and I personally think we should make it, thank you.

Cllr VANCE: Chairman, thank you very much, as a public rep for a long time people would
 remember that over the years we've always had these problems in regard to water taxes and

various issues like that. And if you go out to the public and ask them do they want to pay tax,
they'll tell you no. Nobody wants to pay taxes. But everyone wants services, and it's amazing
that the main issue in the last general election was not about paying taxes on the various items
that none of us like paying, but was actually in services, people regarded the most important item
in the last general election was improvement of services, and in an awful lot of cases people
were prepared to pay even a little more for the improvement in the services that are necessary
nationally, with health, education, social welfare and various things like that.

8

18

24

9 Now it's the easiest thing in the world for people to come in here and say we'll reduce by 15% 10 and it's up to somebody else to do this. But it's easy enough to say 15%, but that's going to affect 11 everybody. It's very hard for people to come in and vote for something, a reduction of 15% if 12 you actually don't know what that is going to mean and how it's going to affect the budget 13 because it's very significant reduction in what is there at the moment. And effectively I think 14 people have to say they have the responsibility to say, or the executive up there have a 15 responsibility to tell all the other members here that if we're going to vote for something that's 16 been proposed and seconded for a reduction of 15% exactly where the likelihood is that these 17 reductions are going to be made.

Now people have said one of the priorities this Council has, only rightly so I've been saying it for five years before anyone else was saying it in regard to housing, effectively if you're saying you are going to cut by 15% one of the largest budgets that we have in the Council at 19%, I think we said there if memory serves me right, effectively you're going to have to have to look at cutting across the board, there will be significant cuts in this area as well.

25 Really we're talking about and I fully support and have always supported improvement and more 26 finance in regard to housing. I've never ever supported a reduction, and this time if there's a 27 reduction there, people are proposing a reduction of 15%, I will not vote for a reduction in 28 housing as one of the main priorities that this Council have and it's something that we should be 29 prioritising and something we should be agreeing on as well. So as I say, it's very fine for people 30 to say reduce by 15% willy nilly, it's not going to affect anyone and we're going to keep the 31 services as they are or improve services as they are, my attitude to that is that I'd like to hear 32 from either the people who are proposing this, Sinn Fein, or other people, where they expect the 33 money to be saved for this, and certainly I'd be in favour, if they can produce something that can 34 provide all the services and reduce by 15%, I'll certainly give it my consideration in regard to

> Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

voting for a reduction of 15%, I don't know if it can be done or not, I suspect it can't, but I think
 there is an obligation on people who do that, to go down that particular road, and I look forward
 to hearing from them in regard to that. Thank you.

Cllr FORTUNE: I think by any stretch of the imagination a Local Property Tax is totally 4 5 unsustainable, the fact that people cannot afford it, we're charged rates, if you travel 45 miles 6 inland the rates change, that's just crazy and unfair, we're told that there's a 5 million surplus, so 7 a 5 million surplus, I'd like to hear a bit more about that. Also on the grants and subsidies, that's 8 basically reduced by 1.5 million, why is that, what's the make up of that? And also the other 9 income, it's just a figure, I'd like a breakdown of that to see should that be he -- what should it 10 be, how is it made up? Also Debbie said in her presentation that they haven't had a chance yet to 11 do a critical analysis by finance, that being the case, we're kind of playing -- it's possible when 12 Debbie and the team do a critical analysis that the funding will be sufficient.

13

14 I would agree with everything that Cllr Behan said and I think also the emotional bullying that 15 goes on in the chamber when we discuss something like this should stop. Everybody should 16 make a contribution, don't be putting an emotional bully across to people who have a different 17 view, the last time I checked we operated in a democracy. I'm surprised at others coming out 18 with that stuff. I think we have an awful lot of questions, I think looking at it just in the quick 19 snapshot of it, I think there is a logic here to reducing this by 15%, but the key point I would 20 make to it is, I believe this passionately, the Local Property Tax is unsustainable. And it's going 21 to have to be faced up to sooner rather than later, and the fact that every time we put a negative 22 our funding is cut from central government, that's what's going on here, we are more and more 23 asked to fund ourselves, there isn't a proper business approach to this either, which is 24 concerning. They're shooting in the dark. But I think we should be reducing by 15%. 25 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Mitchell, followed by Cllr Tommy Cullen.

Cllr MITCHELL: Thank you Cathaoirleach. Cllr Fox has mentioned again the 20% taken from the fund and spread to other counties, but actually the situation is worse than that. There's another 10% called self-funded housing adjustments, which is taken from the money from Wicklow and goes back essentially to the Department of the Environment, so the total amount that's taken out of ours is 30%, this latter figure, this 10% is something to do with the amount of money that was originally paid to the Council under the old grant system, so about nine counties are affected by this, so it is worse than was said and the unfairest bit is that 10%.

- 33
- 34

The various people here have suggested that the property tax should be reduced, but it is

1 important to remember what we managed to do during the past year with the funding from last 2 year, for instance we spent 600,000 on various municipal projects all over the place to the 3 considerable benefit of public of the county, the cliff walk, library services, playgrounds 200,000, community grants 250,000 and significant amount for homelessness and DPG grants, 4 5 all of these things were funded last year, when they would not have been and all of these things 6 will have to be cut back if the LPT is not kept the same as last year, so each one of those 7 councillors who is supporting a reduction in the property tax from what was raised last year is 8 voting for a very substantial cut in all of these services and I think that's wrong.

Now there are a number of things that I think we should be, a number of funding issues which have been mentioned such as LEO ones and to do with the HAP where various administrative staff seem to be landed on the Council budget which were not landed before, those should be changed. I also think we should pursue more vigorously getting some money for the fact that County Wicklow supplies Dublin with its water, this is a unique feature of the county, one which is if money was granted to the county because of this would not have to be granted to other counties. So that's important.

Also I do have a concern that in the budgeted figures which the other areas are getting 50% more money per resident than Greystones and this is badly affecting the services provided there. Now in this year I'm happy to support keeping the property tax as it was last year, but not prepared to continue to do so unless the funding for Greystones area is increased towards that which other areas get to account for various population, massive population increases which there have been in the area, thank you.

24 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Tommy Cullen followed by Cllr Shay Cullen.

25 Cllr Tommy CULLEN: Thanks Chairman, I want an abolishment of property tax, I don't want a 26 reduction. My own view is to say we're going to vote for 85% of property tax you're still voting 27 for property tax, I want them abolished, I don't want messing around with the fringes saying 28 we'll cut by 15%, if you vote that you're still voting for the principle of property tax, I want 29 property tax abolished I think they are a double taxation and the people in this country are 30 already paying the highest taxes in Europe and a lot of it stealth taxes along with that, that the 31 government are taking from people. This Mickey Mouse and carry on about reducing by 15% is 32 only trying to disguise the fact that people will still be vote willing for property tax, 85% or 33 100% it's still the principle they're voting for, I don't agree with property tax, I want it abolished.

34

9

17

People have been saying here there's property tax, Cllr Behan outlined succinctly, if you look at the rates support grant and all that cut back, Wicklow County Council is running to standstill, there's no advantage to this county from property tax. If the property tax goes up our rate support grant goes down by a similar amount, so when I hear them talking about we're going to spend this money on libraries, we've been spending money on libraries since I was on the Council and it always came from direct funding of the Council. So this nonsense that I hear as excuse that we'll have to cut services if this is not in -- this is an additional tax on the people.

9 Now there would be some argument for a local contribution fund based on community 10 requirement and needs that was guaranteed that every penny was kept in-house in the county of 11 Wicklow based on equalisation, not necessarily capitation principle for local projects of maybe 12 playing fields, public swimming pools, stuff that people otherwise would not necessarily be 13 funded by the Council. But that's not what we're talking about here. We're talking about simple 14 taxes. I looked at the property price index here for Wicklow last week, particularly in the 15 Greystones area, Cllr Mitchell's area, and this in effect will mean 250 to 300% increase in 16 property tax in north Wicklow in the year 2018 and will affect other areas of the county as well. 17 And is that what people are being asked to vote for here today? Whether it's 85% or 100% 18 you're still supporting the principle.

I think we are the only country in Europe that front loads property tax and it's called stamp duty.
People are paying thousands of euro up front, even as we speak today families are paying
thousands of euro property tax on stamp duty, front loaded, no other country is doing that, in
Britain for instance you don't pay stamp duty until the first million and a half.

24

19

8

And what if they do pay rates in Britain they're getting free health service, national health service. They're getting free books, free schools, free meals in schools, bins are collected, you're getting free water, free medicine. We're getting absolutely nothing. Every penny in property tax collected in this county, if it goes up wherever it is, it's then the Department cuts their grant to Wicklow. So we're running to standstill like headless chickens.

30

I have a view that if you keep voting for property tax you're going to get more of it, you're going
to get more and more. I stood for election against property tax. Any form of property tax, Sinn
Fein did the same. Independents did the same -- sorry Chairman I'll just finish, I have been
consistent. I have been coming along here -- in fairness Fine Gael they did say they were for

property taxes, I will give them that, they haven't said one thing at the election box and come in
here in this chamber and do another, like the other parties have done. And other independents
have done. Now it's time people started honouring their commitments that they gave the public
when they went for election in 2014 and not reneging the minute they got in the door when the
ink was hardly dry on the ballot papers.

6 CATHAOIRLEACH: Is that it councillor yes? Cllr Cullen then Cllr Snell. Shay Cullen, the
 7 real Cullen, you're right.

8 Cllr Shay CULLEN: Chairman, the first thing I'd like to say is nobody likes a property charge 9 on their home, but unfortunately we're in a situation where we need this money for services for 10 our county. It's as simple as that. Anyone that says we don't I think they're in cuckoo land, we 11 can't take 2 and a half million out of the budget for 2017 and not have serious effects on services 12 we supply for our county.

14 Now I have a few questions for Debbie, one would be the expenditure, other expenditure in your 15 figures seems to be up by 4 million, I'd like an explanation on where that came from, and also 16 the whole area about the money we supply the 3.4 million we supplied to non-variation of 17 property tax in 2016, I would have certain issues and I know it's probably for budget day, but on 18 value for money. It's something that probably nobody has spoken about here today, there is a 19 question over are we getting value for money with the actual money we're putting into these 20 services? I'll just give a quick example, in our own municipal area we upgraded a footpath, it 21 was mentioned earlier, in Rathnew which was cost in the region of €0,000, we got a private 22 contractor to price that particular job at €15,000, so I have a serious issue with the value we're 23 getting for the money we're spending in this Council. But as was said earlier, improvement of 24 service is paramount for our county, that's what people talk to me -- what are we getting for our 25 property tax? If we can point to items that are done in our municipal areas, in public realm, 26 playgrounds, promotion of tourism, homeless funding, I can go on and on, but these items are 27 important to the citizens of County Wicklow and we need to provide these for value for the 28 property tax, and the two and a half million that we're talking about is essential to this authority 29 and I think we have no choice but to maintain the rate of 15%, thank you.

30 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr John Snell.

13

Cllr SNELL: Thanks Cathaoirleach again it's hard to know where to start really to be honest,
 because I accept the Cathaoirleach's direction, and everyone else should, this is not a budget
 meeting, this section of today's special meeting is exclusively to deal with Local Property Tax
 and our role and our function, and while I listened to Cllr Tommy Cullen in regards to he wants

to get rid of this property tax, I concur with that, as do my colleagues and I'm sure everyone in
 the chamber does, but unfortunately we have to deal in the real world and the real world says
 none of us here today can abolish the Local Property Tax.

What we do have in our remit is to reduce it, leave it as was for last year or increase it. And I
know which I'll be going for Cathaoirleach. I have just a few questions in regards to the overall
Local Property Tax.

9 Debbie's figures are showing that with everyone through all the local directors of each service 10 that if they all had their wish list, that to fund the local authority for Wicklow next year would be 11 98 million and that based on the figures from last year there's 91 million, so there's a deficit there 12 of just under 7 million. If we actually go and look at what's happening here, last year Wicklow 13 County Council, through the citizens of Wicklow paid 17 million in Local Property Tax, but yet 14 3.4 million of that was squirrelled off into an equalisation fund for other local authorities, and 15 here's where I have an issue in regards to other local authorities, and other citizens in other parts 16 of the country, who are benefiting off the backs of the people of Wicklow.

A number of these other local authorities reduced the Local Property Tax, as is their remit, their power, the little power they have, some have reduce it had throughout the state, some are still going to vote on it coming into the future. For example Dublin City Council, Fingal County Council, all reduced it by 15%. Monaghan County Council reduced it by 7.5% of a reduction, so the citizens of Monaghan pay less than the citizens of Wicklow, yet we end up in a situation where 3.4 million of the money that's raised by the people of Wicklow potentially can end up in the coffers of Monaghan County Council, and I find that hard to swallow to be honest.

I feel that we're here haggling about spending money at local level, which will be our job in a month's time when the budget meeting comes up, we're here now, it's my belief that central government should be funding the big infrastructure in County Wicklow. This tax is very unfair as a lot of people have said, because even if the property tax remains, as I have a feeling it probably will be, listening to previous speakers, if it remains the same, there's still a deficit of 6.35 million to be found within this local authority, for to give our directors of services what they believe they need, to function correctly for the next 12 months.

33 34

4

8

17

25

If it was increased, if the members here decided to increase the property tax by 15% there still

would be a shortfall of 2.9 million, even with an increase, yet the government take 3.4 million
 away and give it to other counties who decide to reduce the hardship on their own citizens while
 we're asked to burden the people of County Wicklow with further increases.

4

5 I just want to if I could have the figures on the collection rate, if you have that Debbie? I know it was 94% of people in 2014, throughout the State, but if you have figures exclusively for 6 7 Wicklow in regards of the collection rate of Local Property Tax? And just to bear in mind to all 8 the members here, in 2014, 14 local authorities reduced the Local Property Tax. One of which 9 was our own Council Chambers here in Wicklow and I would remind some of the members who 10 asked the question of my party, Sinn Fein, that in 2014 at the Fine Gael Ard Fheis Enda Kenny 11 said that people going forward to represent Fine Gael in the local elections that they would go in 12 and oppose an increase in the commercial rates and the property tax. So just bear that in mind. 13 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thank you councillor, you have a good memory. Cllr Walsh. 14 Cllr WALSH: Thank you Cathaoirleach, might I just make a point at this stage, we have over 15 4300 Council tenancy homes across the county, who I believe are exempt from paying the LPT 16 tax. So if we agree to cut the tax by 15% as has been suggested then obviously the services that 17 will be cut as a result will affect these people who are, some are in disadvantaged areas in the 18 county, such as the maintenance and repair of our local housing stock. So I think we need to 19 bear that in mind, I don't think we'll be thanked by those particular residents if we do cut their 20 services.

21

Also just on Cllr Snell's last point of the equalisation fund and other counties benefiting from it, I believe if that is the case, I have no reason to doubt him that should not happen, it shouldn't be allowed and steps should be taken to prevent that happen in the future.

Cllr BLAKE: Thanks Chairman and thanks Debbie for the presentation, I too would very much
support Cllr Fox's proposal with regards to the fact that 20% and the 3 and a half million that we
are giving to the equalisation fund is unfair to the people of Wicklow. We do need the services,
certainly I think we need to continue to ensure that that 3 and a half million remains in County
Wicklow to provides the service that is Cllr Vance said, the last election there was people
demanded greater services, this is our opportunity to provide services and that 3 and a half
million could go a long way towards that as well.

32

We must also remember that nearly 7 million of a difference between what the Council and the officials of the Council want to put into the budget for the coming year, a lot of that 98 million is

1 what we looked for, our various different meetings and district meetings when we talk about 2 additional money for housing, for looking after and improving our own local authority houses, 3 looking after roads, improving quality of the roads as well, these are issues we discuss on a monthly basis at our local meetings, demanding additional services to roads, houses and so forth. 4 5 And at the end of the day in order to balance the budget there's still almost 7 million of a difference between what we have been looking for, we are the ones looking for improved 6 7 services, improved roads and housing, obviously at the end of the day we have to balance our 8 budget, there's already 7 million difference in that as well. Equally we have seen the staff over 9 the years cut back in the salaries as well and there is something like 2 million there, just over 2 10 million of increase in cost of salaries based on Lansdowne Road agreement, that's something we 11 have to honour, so if we get additional money from central government well and good, but 12 certainly every meeting I have been at for the last number of years when we cut back in staff, we 13 have been asking for, outdoor staff in particular as well, we have been looking at every meeting 14 for additional outdoor staff, it has to be paid for some way, somebody has to pay and we want those workers out there as well. So there is an increase in there in terms of the cost factor 15 16 towards the local government in that regard.

18 As far as myself is concerned, we need the services, we need to provide those services, I'm 19 delighted that Cllr Snell watched the Fine Gael Ard Fheis anyway, two things in relation to that, 20 we have honoured the aspect of the Local Property Tax, it hasn't been increased, we have also 21 honoured the rates, there has been no increase in rates since 2008 in this county, so we've 22 honoured those particular commitments. But certainly we do need to provide services in the 23 county for the people that we are out there, it is our responsibility. People mightn't say it's not 24 our responsibility to look after the people of Wicklow, it is our responsibility. We don't want to 25 be just spenders of the taxpayer's money, government collect it and hand it to us, there's no need 26 nor us, County Manager can do the same thing, he can take in the money from central 27 government and distribute to various engineers or directors of services, but there is a 28 responsibility on us as local authority members here, to ensure that we play our part in ensuring 29 it. Thanks Chairman.

17

Cllr KAVANAGH: When I look at new taxes I look at what we're supposed to represent,
already we have a very burdened citizenship in this country, we have income tax, we have PRSI,
we have universal social charge, people have to pay very high rates, sometimes people barely
able to keep their heads above water and businesses closing down, we have numerous businesses
around the town in Wicklow itself just to pick one town, that have closed down because they

can't pay exorbitant rates.

1

2

3 On top of that we also have now a situation where people have to pay their own bin charges, they have to pay their own water charges, these used to be all covered by general taxation, so there's 4 5 already a massive burden of tax on the ordinary citizens of the country. We now have something called Local Property Tax, when that was first mooted I looked at it, I work with tax law and 6 7 know a little bit about it, I understood it was going to fund local services. Now all it seems to be 8 doing is subsidising central taxation, we should now for Local Property Tax people should be 9 able to have their bins collected, they should have bins put around the town. I can't even get bins 10 in areas around the town because there's no money for them. So I'm thinking what are we paying 11 Local Property Tax for? It's being used to subsidise something it was never intended to do. So 12 if there's an opportunity to reduce this massive tax burden on people of this county then I would 13 say they wouldn't be offering 15% if they couldn't actually afford to lose 15%, so why not pass it 14 on to the overburdened taxpayer, give them 15% more money in their pockets to go out and 15 spend in their own communities and support their own businesses. Because I think they pay 16 more than their fair share of tax, thank you.

17 CATHAOIRLEACH: Two other people to come back in. Cllr Kennedy.

18 Cllr KENNEDY: Thank you Cathaoirleach I won't hold you up too long, sorry Debbie I asked 19 two questions, I've a further three questions. As Cllr Blake said we do have a responsibility on 20 behalf of the people to ask questions on figures presented to us here today also, on page 6 the 21 national pay agreement, we have to provide 420,000 there, should that not be provided by central 22 government? Because I think it should. That's question number one. On page 10, under water 23 services, is that not being funded through the development contribution scheme? It's my 24 understanding that there is a percentage included there for surplus water that's another 200,000. 25 Maybe you can just clarify something for me. Under the Economic Development Fund we 26 provided 275,000 last year, we've been asked to provide an additional 145,000 for that this year 27 brings to a total of 420,000, I don't see much economic development, certainly not in my area 28 there isn't any, maybe you can clarify that for me as well.

29 ARBITRATOR: Okay thank you councillor. Cllr O'Brien has your light on again.

30 Cllr O'BRIEN: Just two points they were asking where would Sinn Fein get money. I propose

- 31 this Council send a letter to the relevant department demanding that 20% of the robbing us of the
- 32 tax, that be put back in straight away, that would immediately mean that you would be 5% up.
- 33
- 34

The second thing I would like to point out is about the submissions sent in to us, 23 submissions

sent in, that's the people speaking, 14 requested to reduce the rate, 5 requested to leave it
unchanged and four put down to abolish, that seems to be the people talking, I'm wondering
where does that factor come into influencing the Council here at all? Was it a worthwhile
exercise at all? Because obviously it costs money to go through the submissions, if we're going
to ignore it, was it worth while to do at all?

6 Cllr VANCE: Just briefly I'm amazed when you went out for questions in regard to property tax 7 that 23, only 23 submissions out of 129,000 people in Wicklow, it seems extraordinary people 8 are saying there's such huge support for, not reduction but elimination of the property tax. Just a 9 clarification, if I got clarification from Debbie in regard to what Cllr Tommy Cullen said, made a 10 statement that if the property tax was up the rates from government come down, I am not aware 11 this happens, I don't think that's correct. Maybe then when I hear Debbie and various 12 explanations there you'd let me back in, I want to make a proposal, I suspect a lot of the 13 questions that we've answered will not be met by the people proposing the 15% reduction 14 anyway. So I think we should bring this whole system to an end at this stage because there's 15 only a lot of play acting going on here this morning.

- 16 Cllr O'NEILL: Just briefly there, just to go back in on what councillors from Fianna Fáil and 17 Fine Gael have been slagging off Sinn Féin and what would we do, I accept there's a broader 18 issue, we do take our role seriously, Cllr Fox mentioned the equalisation fund, we haven't even 19 had a reply from government on that, to hand out 20% of the property tax in that. Also the, I 20 believe the 6 million due from Irish Water, the other issues there being -- there's plenty of money 21 wasted and misspent in the country, there's millions we spend every year here in legal fees in the 22 course of evictions, there's huge money in salaries, ministerial salaries and also a lot of money 23 after two years as a Minister you're entitled to a pension. In Japan is he moment we're reading 24 news here that the ambassador, the Irish ambassador to Japan, just to rent his house for a month 25 costs 46,000. 46,000 a month to rent your house. That's apart from salary or anything else. So 26 there's plenty of money there -- but Cllr Tommy Cullen is proposing another local way of 27 collecting
- 28 Cllr CULLEN: I didn't make any such proposal.
- 29 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Cullen. Proceed.
- 30 Cllr Tommy CULLEN: Chairman I never made any such proposal, I'll make that clear.

31 Cllr O'NEILL: Listening to Tommy Cullen talking about Sinn Féin, you are the man that walked

- 32 the streets of Blessington in the 80s with Liam Kavanagh asking the people to pay water charges.
- 33 Cllr Tommy CULLEN: I certainly did not.
- 34 CATHAOIRLEACH: You have a good memory. Please just stick to Local Property Tax. Cllr

- 1 Cullen and Cllr O'Neill.
- Cllr Tommy CULLEN: Cllr O'Neill is trying to weasel out of the fact that he's now proposing
 an 85% property tax on the people of Blessington and he can't weasel words out of that.
- 4 CATHAOIRLEACH: Councillor you're finished are you?
- 5 Cllr O'NEILL: I'm being interrupted by Cllr Cullen.
- 6 CATHAOIRLEACH: That's all right then you're finished. I want to just let Debbie -- there's a
 7 lot of...
- 8 Cllr Tommy CULLEN: I want to just respond here. If you don't mind.
- 9 CATHAOIRLEACH: Well if it takes ten minutes I mind. 30 seconds.
- 10 Cllr Tommy CULLEN: Chairman I have a view and I stick to the point, I respect everyone's 11 right to vote which way they want to this, but I have a principled view that we should not be 12 paying property tax when we are already paying stamp duty and I want to make quite clear, I 13 never made any proposal for any property tax in this chamber, never will. But I'm not going to 14 support property tax by the back door via 85% property tax that Sinn Féin is proposing, at least 15 Fianna Fáil have the principle to stand for it.
- 16 CATHAOIRLEACH: Just a second. Just a minute that's it. Thank you councillor. Debbie just
 17 come in there. We're going over to Debbie now.
- MS CROMIE: I hope I got everybody's questions. I'm going to start with Cllr Ryan, Irish Water rates, just in relation to staffing in January 2014 Irish Water came into being and then we entered into a service level agreement with them, up to two weeks ago we issued the non-domestic water bills on their behalf and they actually funded us our staff costs.
- 22

23 Two weeks ago the billing migrated over to Irish Water, therefore for 2017 they are saying to us 24 well we're doing the billing now, so we're not refunding you the cost of the staff and that's where 25 the cost is coming in. Now we are arguing that point with them, because the staff involved just 26 -- didn't just issue bills, because we're keeping the metering within the County Council there is a 27 link between organising the meter reads and uploading into the system in order for Irish Water to 28 bill. So we are arguing that you will still need those staff to do that. But for the moment they 29 are saying they are not funding us in 2017 and that's where the 250,000 is coming from. 30 Cllr RYAN: So are those staff unable to work elsewhere? Just relating to that. 31 MS CROMIE: Oh yeah, absolutely I suppose the chief executive will have his eye on those

- staff, but I am saying to him they are still needed to actually liaise with Irish Water and they still
 need to be funded by Irish Water, that is my argument.
- 34

Just in relation to your other question about the globals, what are the globals, I suppose globals
 are the Telecoms, so 3, Vodafone, Eircom, BT, Meteor, energy, ESB networks, Eirgrid, Gas
 Networks Ireland, Iarnrod Eireann, RTE, so there are 11 national regional public utilities, valued
 every five years, total value in January 2016 of those utilities of 703.68 million, so just going to
 talk about how do they value it.

7 There are no comparisons, between any other rateable property. They use two methods they tell 8 us, contractors method of valuation is that they estimate the replacement cost of the network, 9 depreciation for age and obsolescence, add for site value and then the receipts and expenditure 10 method where they look at the potential revenue and estimate associated costs arising from 11 occupying the relevant property, they use annual accounts, so they'll ask for utilities for their 12 annual reports of the previous four financial years, ask details of their income, their operating 13 expenses, the annual expenditure relating to maintenance of operational network, annual 14 expenditure on renewal and upgrading of existing network, annual expenditure on additions to 15 the network, numbers of subscribers, number of mobile broadband users, percentage market 16 share by subscribers and revenue, the physical assets like masts, exchanges, their land and 17 buildings, their cable network, their acquisitions and disposal and from there then they work out 18 what the valuation is.

Cllr RYAN: But all of those things would have gone up in the last five years, I don't understand
how we're losing out by half a million in terms of valuations.

- MS CROMIE: It's normally the percentage of population in each area relative to population of all areas within the assets, that is -- I'm reading from the presentation they gave us, it's complicated and as you see I don't fully get it myself, all I know is every local authority, it's not just Wicklow, every local authority the global valuations went down.
- Cllr RYAN: I just think it's crazy and we should make representations at the highest level, the idea these utilities get a lower amount and this is shifted on to local authorities to fill the gap is wrong.
- MS CROMIE: I don't disagree. Cllr Kennedy, the Rates Incentive Scheme, so we issued approximately 5,000 rate demands in February this year and attached to all those rate demands was a leaflet in relation to the Rates Incentive Scheme and we explained it and how people would get it. So every rates customer in the county would have received that.
- 32

6

Central funding for homeless section I don't know, Joe, does Joe want to talk about that? I don't
have the answer yet to that. The pay agreement, you mentioned another question about the pay

1	agreement of 420, what was that, Pat, follow on question? Your follow on question about the
2	pay agreement?
3	Cllr KENNEDY: That's a national pay agreement of 420,000 should that not be funded through
4	central government?
5	MS CROMIE: Absolutely, as I just said earlier in the slide presentation it's part of the acute
6	financial reports that we are the CCMA are lobbying the Department in relation to that, but so far
7	there's no word, so prudence would indicate, would tell me that I actually have to include that as
8	an additional cost in my budget until I hear otherwise.
9	Cllr KENNEDY: So technically we may have that 420,000 coming back, am I right in saying
10	that?
11	MS CROMIE: People are lobbying the Department but there's I have heard no word, and as
12	far as I'm concerned I have to include that in my budget as an additional expenditure.
13	Cllr KENNEDY: Just if I get back to the rates for a second, how many people availed of that
14	incentive? That was part of my question.
15	MS CROMIE: I don't have the figures straight off Pat, I can give them to you, no problem there.
16	Cllr KENNEDY: But it's right to say collection rate has only gone up by 4%, is that right?
17	MS CROMIE: Yeah, but I would think 4% is quite good to be honest. But it's anecdotal
18	evidence again, it's hard to measure what the Rates Incentive Scheme, until probably towards the
19	end of the year.
20	
21	The water services funding that through development levies, development levies are normally
22	for new infrastructure, this is just really maintaining old infrastructure. And economic
23	development the 145k would be additional expenditure.
24	
25	Cllr Walsh the draft budget plan 98.9 shortfall of 6.3 this time, yeah it was 4.4, I suppose let's be
26	honest we are a month out from Halloween, I don't want to be going with scare tactics, but at the
27	moment yeah we are 6.35 million, but that's including all the wish lists from all the other
28	departments, and between tomorrow and the end of November we have to, in finance, critically
29	analyse all the submissions we received from the department in relation to their submissions and
30	try and find savings or just say no, that that is not being included.
31	
32	Just in relation to Cllr Bourke you referred maybe to Louth. Louth is one of the examples I sent

out in the e-mail the other day in relation to that they are a net beneficiary from the equalisation
fund, but as I showed in the example they went with the reduced rates and they actually, their

income, their minimum required funding was reduced, the same would be for Monaghan and
 Louth now for 2017 have voted to maintain the rate, so they got punished and they learned their
 lesson.

4

5 Cllr Matthews, yeah the difference in grants and subsidies just in the way we've treated the 6 pension levy, that's what that difference is. And the social benefits, so that table is how the 7 Department want us to report on our finances, so the social benefits, that includes homeless 8 service, community employment scheme, RAS, mortgage allowance and shared

9 ownership/affordable housing subsidy, that's what that figure makes up.

10 Cllr MATTHEWS: Payroll?

11 MS CROMIE: Payroll, sorry. The national pay agreement of 420k we have the pension of 600k 12 and then the additional staff that the directors or divisions would like of 1.2 million, so that 13 really makes up all the figures.

14

I suppose just generally somebody asked about the Department, they recognise we live in a
democracy and they are allowing the members to have some power over how we fund our
county. I think ...

18 CATHAOIRLEACH: Can we just let Joe go ahead there.

19 DIRECTOR LANE: Just on the homeless value, what services, this time last year there was a 20 particular difficulty if you remember, regarding the homeless funds, one of the funds that were 21 available, section 10, the money in Wicklow wasn't available we -- also there was a supported 22 housing officer, on the counter, -- people are very familiar with the service, she has done in 23 supporting the homeless office at the time we were being swamped, we were able to get a little 24 bit of control over that, we also have a number of supported accommodation units, again you are 25 familiar with some of them, where we're contributing to the supported accommodation, 26 particularly challenging cases that needed support in addition to accommodation. So they are the 27 main -- mainly support side, and the Sonas money is what you got available from the monies. 28 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thanks Joe. Obviously all the members that wanted to contribute have 29 contributed. There's just -- you were looking Pat just quickly please?

Cllr VANCE: Chairman just I didn't, can I just say I didn't expect to get answers to a number of those things and certainly I didn't expect the people who were proposing the 15% reduction to come in and say where they were going to make the particular cuts on it, so I think we should bring this charade to an end now at this stage for the simple reason that this is the situation where people who want to reduce by 15% are not prepared to say where they want to make the cuts in regard to this and you've got another group of people who feel that they want to provide the
services and improve the services to people that we represent on the other side and are prepared
to leaving the property tax as it is. I want to formally propose that we leave the property tax as
is, without any reduction or without any increase from last year Chairman. Cllr RYAN: I'll
second that, but I'd like to see a significant amount of that money brought back to the local
districts so that there can be discretion in terms of how its used to improve the civic spaces

- 7 particularly and on capital infrastructure.
- 8 Cllr VANCE: I'd agree with that Chairman.
- 9 CATHAOIRLEACH: Two proposals then.
- 10 Cllr VANCE: That's the second proposal we have one from Sinn Féin.
- 11 CATHAOIRLEACH: This is your third time you're looking to come in, just make it 30 seconds.
- 12 Cllr O'BRIEN: I thought we did explain the money, I made a proposal that every member in the
- 13 house here, send a letter, put your signature and tell the government to give us back the 20%.
- 14 CATHAOIRLEACH: All right we'll go ahead, we have two proposals, take the second one first.
- 15 Cllr BEHAN: There was one proposal first by Cllr Lawless.
- 16 CATHAOIRLEACH: We'll do it however you want.
- 17 Cllr BEHAN: In the order it was made Chairman.
- 18 CATHAOIRLEACH: That's fine. No use losing...
- 19 Cllr BEHAN: No use losing anything, only the people of Wicklow will be losing.
- 20 CATHAOIRLEACH: That's fine, we'll take the first one first then.
- 21 Cllr VANCE: Chairman, I particularly asked Debbie where the likelihood is that cuts would be
- 22 made to make up the 2 and a half million, she didn't address that.
- 23 Cllr FORTUNE: That's not the purpose of this meeting.
- 24 CATHAOIRLEACH: Sorry Cllr Vance that's a budget issue, we're not discussing this.
- Cllr VANCE: But Chairman in the documentation we got today, we got where it was spent last
 year.
- 27 CATHAOIRLEACH: I understand that. But we're...
- 28 Cllr VANCE: I assume if it was spent in those areas last year...
- 29 CATHAOIRLEACH: Look I'm saying we're proceeding with the vote. Cllr Lawless.
- 30 Cllr VANCE: Why would you be taking that first?
- 31 Cllr LAWLESS: Because I proposed it first.
- 32 MS GALLAGHER: They are two different proposals, they are not amendments.
- 33

^{34 (}Vote taken)

1	
2	Cllr CULLEN: It is a proposal to keep 85% of the property tax, I'll abstain Chairman, I have
3	been consistent when others haven't.
4	CATHAOIRLEACH: We'll proceed with the vote.
5	
6	(Vote continues)
7	
8	MS GALLAGHER: That's nine for, 20 against, two not present and one abstaining.
9	
10	So proposal number 2, proposed by Cllr Pat Vance and seconded by Cllr John Ryan to leave the
11	LPT adjustment factor as it is.
12	
13	(Vote taken)
14	
15	MS GALLAGHER: That's 20 for, nine against, two not present and one abstaining.
16	CATHAOIRLEACH: Okay. Just rather than go into the housing presentation, I think if we
17	adjourn now and come back at 2 o'clock.
18	Cllr FOX: Chairman can I ask you to renew your efforts on getting some correspondence back
19	from the Department in relation to the equalisation fund?
20	CATHAOIRLEACH: No problem, I'll do that. I'll sign it. When we come back at 2 o'clock, if
21	that's all right.
22	
23	Luncheon adjournment
24	
25	CATHAOIRLEACH: If the members are ready, we'll go ahead. Item 2 on the agenda, to
26	receive a presentation on housing Wicklow County Council, so I'd ask Mr Joe Lane.
27	DIRECTOR LANE: Okay this presentation is based on the last couple of meetings people
28	wanting to deal with the we're going to concentrate on supply side, weeks ago we concentrated
29	on the work programme and also the estimates to concentrate on maintenance and other
30	schemes, so this is concentrating on supply side of units and some of the demand that drives that.
31	
32	We are as also to going to try and frame in the national context and link to that and see where
33	these programmes are going to come from, they are not just coming from, being pulled out of the
34	sky.

The Rebuilding Ireland was built on five pillars addressing homelessness, accelerate social housing, build more homes, improve rental sector and utilise existing stock. What we'll do is we'll concentrate in the main on accelerate social housing and Jackie will deal with some of the others particularly homelessness and also she'll come across building more housing and improving rental sector and I'll finish up by detailing other schemes not just what we're doing, but also the approved housing body part 5 and acquiring stock.

JACKIE: Good afternoon, what we've outlined on this slide is all the projects that we have
achieved, stage one approval from the Department, and when I put up the flip chart I'll go
through the four separate stages of the Department approval, but in essence this is approval in
principle and some funding to start the process. Basically they've established these projects are
worthy of going forward.

14 So the top two are the ones that you are aware of, Kilbride Lane and Avondale Heights was to 15 your knowledge Brewery Bends, so because we've advanced it so far we need to have a proper 16 address for the location, so this is going to be the title of this estate called Avondale Heights, that 17 was 42 units and 20 units that we were given approval for last year.

19 Over the summer just at the end of July you heard there was 11 further projects announced for 20 Wicklow that was the work in the background where we visited all Municipal Districts trying to 21 establish based on Council land, which projects could be most viable to get moving fastest. So 22 you'll see we have, we actually achieved down at the Arklow Municipal District, we were trying 23 for 17, but achieved stage one approval for 17 units and phase 2 in Arklow for 20 units, on top of 24 that we've got approval again in principle for Sugarloaf in Kilmacanogue for 20 units, I'll just 25 caution on that, when I was out on site myself, I noticed there's a lot of fill material on that site, 26 so when I talk to you about stage approvals from the Department you will see that this is 27 considered an abnormal cost because you can't build normal foundations on this site, it will have 28 to be a pile foundation, but given that we already own the land, the overall cost as opposed to the 29 site in Bray, costs a lot of money and still got approval of consistently 42 units, they may also 30 given approval. Given Kilmacanogue the north end of the county we're stretched in terms of the 31 number of people on the housing list.

32

1

13

18

Farrankelly we had approval for, one of the first on the housing list never understood why we
didn't get it now we have it. Then the FCA hall in Wicklow for eight units, old library in

1 Arklow, take that building and convert to 7 units, Kilmantan place in Bray, this is a four unit 2 development so that will need to go for planning, but it's the top end of Bray. Chapel Lane in 3 Aughrim another four units, Ard na Mara, the others are smaller we decided to use the land, we said to the Department we'll try and get even one or two units to just get them up and running, so 4 5 that's a total, the original programme from 2015 to 2017 we now see that's extended out to 2018, so this is the programme for 2018 only, and as you know the pressure on government and 6 7 housing crisis is such that there will be probably more units delivered by other methods and Joe 8 will fill you in on that.

Now the reason why I brought this chart, as you can see that, you can't really see it, so this is the
biggest I could get to show you what's involved the Department approval process.

Originally this was a 7 stage process and we were given a chart like this, so I'm still challenged as to how this works, but there were 7 stages along here and there was different stuff on this side and this side, so most of the local authorities were complaining in relation to this chart, so the Department prepared this one to reduce down the number of 7 stages down to 4, to be fair to the Department, it was originally coming from the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform, which their remit at that stage was to really control as much public spending as possible. So the more stages they put into the process the longer it would be to get approval.

20

9

12

But at the same time the Department still have to work within it and their reasoning behind this is that they say it's to try and attain cost certainty at a very early stage, so they're not going to be hit with high bills for construction development as the units are in place.

24

However on that, at the moment you'll see there's four stages, stage 1, 2, 3, 4 and this is where our contractors start on site. This is where we're at, at the moment, we've got approval for all 14 projects at present, that's basically approval in principle. The next stage to approval is they ask us to - at least we've got some expenditure for design at this stage, but we have to move it forward and they want this very detailed cost plan going up to them, this is way before it's supposed to go for planning.

31

On the two projects we got last year because we're really keen on getting them expedited as quickly as possible, we went straight to part 8 which is approve both of those, those stage 3 and the Department were not happy with us for doing that, but they wanted us to go through this very detailed analysis before that. That's what we are at.

2

1

So in the meantime let's say for what's now Avondale Heights in Rathdrum we have had to
submit at this stage two cost proposals, the first cost proposal the Department felt was too
expensive, they asked to go back and cut the design. It's gone up again and we are awaiting
stage 2, a lot of people are asking why aren't we seeing stuff on the ground? This is the reason.
We can't proceed until we get the stage 2 approval. Once we have stage approval on those, on
the Bray site and Rathdrum site, because we already have stage 3 through our part 8, we can then
proceed to stage 4, which is to tender.

10

So I just wanted to show to you that there's a lot of work involved in getting through the stages, we were trying to pre-empt it and do as much as we could in advance of the formal process. As you are aware the part 8 process, there's notification, time limits, statutory time limits that need to be put in place, we have to follow the timetable, so for all the other projects we are told from Department we are not to proceed to part 8 until we get stage 2 approval.

16

So on the next slide I will show you where we are with those. We have now sought from the
Department -- all these projects are with the Department at the moment and we're not moving
forward with them, we can't bring them to part 8 until we get this approval, so Avondale Heights
is one, FCA Hall in Wicklow, Kilmantan Place, Chapel Lane, the smaller units, they are fairly
easy to move.

22

23 On the next slide is projects that have yet to be sought, because if you remember Kilbride Lane 24 being an extensive project, that's gone out to outside consultants -- all the other ones we're doing 25 in-house. This one, Kilbride Lane, that has to be prepared, a very detailed cost summary to be 26 sent up to pass this stage, that's the team of consultants will have a team of quantity surveyors 27 who will give them the detail of costs they are looking for, for the units. The same with 28 Emoclew Road these again we are putting out to consultants, we have approval to do that, we'd 29 say it's a little more advanced because all that design is pretty much tied up when we originally 30 got part 8 way back. Sugarloaf, the reason we haven't gone forward with that to seek stage 2 31 approval is because of the ground conditions and I want certainty or reasonable certainty on that 32 of what the extra cost will be to put in the non-standard foundations. And then Farrankelly is a 33 big project that we'll do, big for us in-house, so getting that whole design process up and 34 running. So those are -- out of our 14 those are the only ones we haven't sought approval for, all the other ones are with the Department. I think that might be me, is it. Thank you very much.
 SPEAKER: I'm going to concentrate on the actual demand, social housing need, applicant for
 social housing support, rental accommodation scheme, housing assistance payment, addressing
 homelessness and capital assistance scheme.

6 The first slide there the members are aware that we are in the middle of social housing 7 assessment, there's 3,886 on the Council's list, it's quite sizable as you can see. We're nearly 8 finished the social housing assessment 2016, 3,641 forms and as you can see over 1,000 forms 9 not yet returned. We're actually chasing up these forms, but there is a distinct possibility that a 10 thousand people could lose their place on the list, so it's in everybody's interest to get their forms 11 back in. It's a huge body of work, we end up closing the counter at lunchtime, everybody was 12 working extra hours, but we did manage to maintain.

14 Then the rental sector, the RAS, we have over 500 properties in the scheme at the moment, this 15 is part of the moving from direct provision to (inaudible) delivery, you have to be in receipt of 16 rent supplement for 18 months plus, tenant pays differential rent to the Wicklow County 17 Council, we pay the market value less a percent, standard of accommodation have to be 18 improved, we have an inspection regime and we serve notice if standards have to be improved. 19 There's over 500 properties presently in the scheme. Now when you are housing under RAS 20 your housing needs are deemed to have been met, because you are availing of social housing 21 support, but you are eligible to private transfer, if you lose your house under RAS we do have an 22 obligation towards you.

23

5

13

24 Next, improve the rental sector, Housing Assistance Payment, this is a new form of housing 25 support, we haven't implemented as yet, we are in the final wave and resources permitting we 26 hope to be rolling it out between October and December, so the difference is I suppose that we 27 don't have to be 18 months in receipt of rent supplement, it's instant acceptance once you are on 28 the housing list, basically the mechanism is very much the same, it's the transfer of responsibility 29 to recipients of rent supplement of long-term housing need, it's another form of housing support, 30 they will source their own accommodation and we'll pay the landlord market rent. Tenant will 31 again pay differential rate to the Council, against your housing need is deemed to have been met. 32 We're looking at this possibly as a pilot project in Greystones it would be, we're putting in place 33 extra support work to deal with the families there to assess their needs and see are they eligible 34 for social housing support.

Homelessness is big on the agenda at the moment, there are some stats, it's important for these, what people see is the headlines in the paper, a guy in a tent or all the media attention on one particular individual, this is the reality of what we see every day in the week. From 1st of January to end of August we had 120 individuals and 217 families presenting at Wicklow County Council at risk of homelessness or homeless. And of them we have dealt with all them, offered advice and support and prevented them becoming homeless, that's the reality of those statistics. Emergency accommodation is absolutely last resort.

1

9

18

22

10 We work in partnership with approved housing bodies and Housing First, Housing First as you 11 know is where we provide accommodation and then put in wrap-around supports for the 12 individual. We have a number of properties in Bray and Arklow at the moment which provide 13 low to medium supported accommodation and it's targeted to particular support needs of the 14 clients. Kilmantan Hill, Wicklow, you are all familiar high support transitional unit, ten 15 individuals are housed at any one time. Now there's always an exit strategy with this, of the ten 16 individuals, for example, there originally in May 2015, nine are now to non-supported 17 accommodation or low support, so it shows the success of the model.

Castle Street is our more recent supported units we put in review with Simon on the Capital
Assistance Scheme, so again we have low supported tenancies, four individuals and one family
will now be housed with low support needs.

23 So Capital Assistance Scheme, we recently called for proposals under the Capital Assistance 24 Scheme, this caters for priority groups, so targeted at specific groups that approved housing 25 bodies can't provide accommodation for, for example, homeless, elderly, this year money was 26 ringfenced for particular emphasis on moving people from congregated setting or institutions 27 into community living, so we have received a number of proposals and we're prioritising them 28 on the basis of need at the moment. So hopefully we'll get that as well. So back to Joe then. 29 DIRECTOR LANE: Just another few small things, under the build more homes platforms we 30 have also streamlined recently part 5 policy as people are familiar, there was a change in criteria 31 with the Act in 2015, it went from 20% to 10%, units are preferred and the option of land off site 32 is no longer suitable, no longer available, we have a clear policy agreed with SPC and also 33 approved housing bodies who can operate if people want to work with approved housing bodies 34 rather than local authority, important thing is units and we'll provide units.

> Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

2 Under the utilise existing stock, we are better managing our social housing and turning them 3 over quicker. One of the things from, particularly from purchasing houses, is as we purchase in 4 our case we use transfer list and we have significantly increased the re-letting of vacant housing, 5 people are familiar especially with new standards, a lot of the vacant houses we are bringing 6 back in are not in great condition, and letting them back out is challenging both to municipal 7 areas and ourselves, we'll include that in the budget next year, so I am assuming you'll all pay 8 attention to that particular line.

9

1

As Brid said it's a rolling programme now up to 2021, local authority unit is just the first phase 2016 to 2018 we'll be moving along, most of those units with the exception of in-fills were the priority we all agreed last year, we met with the Department, they went through options for some priorities, including housing bodies, to are all local housing bodies they have an expression of interest process that would satisfy procurement law has been challenging, but we'll be advertising in the near future.

16

Some of the lands the local authority have that we'll be asking approved housing bodies are they
interested in progressing it, because we won't get them for a few years unless they progress
them. People are familiar with the part 8 we did recently in Ballybeg, that was one of those.

20

21 So on top of the local authority supply and the supply through, in conjunction with approved 22 housing bodies, you also have acquisitions, the very bottom, also acquiring properties, there are 23 properties beginning to now come in under part 5 process. We also have PPP, which is the 24 national initiative where they are putting a whole series of units together and they are trying to 25 leverage monies from the private sector to give a 25 to 30 year lease, so there's a whole lot of 26 solutions in the medium term. Short-term will be challenging. Thank you Cathaoirleach. 27 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thank you. I'm sure members have questions to ask? Cllr Blake. 28 Cllr BLAKE: Thanks for the presentation, two quick questions, first of all the number of houses certainly is welcome, but primarily they are on the east coast from Arklow to Bray, where the 29 30 biggest population is, but west of the east coast only four houses proposed for Aughrim, none 31 anywhere else in the west of that particular area, I have on numerous occasions brought up here 32 as well, there's a number of properties out there that are available, to be available to the local 33 authority for purchase at a realistic price, each time I've brought it up I've been told that either 34 the property is unsuitable, a lot of occasions maybe the BER rating of the property was

> Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie
unsuitable as well. Therefore the property wasn't suitable for purchase. They are still out there,
 a lot of those still available to the local authority and still a lot of people in those, that are still
 looking for housing. The officials have another serious look at the possibility of purchasing
 some of those available properties and vacant in some cases.

5

6 The second thing is in regards to the chart here, we had a meeting with the officials from the 7 Department at our one-hour training programme recently, the whole issue of the delay in getting 8 shovels into the ground and certainly the Department officials were lambasted at that meeting 9 from numerous councillors with regards to delay and we felt that the Department were the ones 10 who were holding up the whole process of getting local authority projects off the ground. They 11 rejected it out of hand needless to say, but -- and they did acknowledge the fact that there was a 12 lot of work attached to getting all of the processes and different stages completed. But they said 13 there was no delay on their side in terms of when the local authorities submitted each section, 14 they said four sections or whatever it is, there would be no delay in the Department for 15 processing the projects onto the next stage. There was a lot of discussions, a lot of comments 16 made to the official that is it wasn't in the local authority the delay was, but it was in the 17 Department for funding and actually delaying each particular process of it, but they rejected it, 18 but nevertheless we're there, berating you and the officials in the Department and people out 19 there are berating us for the facts that shovels are not in the ground in terms of providing local 20 authority housing, thank you Chairman.

21 Cllr O'NEILL: Thanks Cathaoirleach, there's 3,939 on the housing list, I'd like to know how 22 many of those are in the Baltinglass Municipal Area? Also what's the progress on the court case 23 with the builder in Glending? There was this one on the illegal occupation of houses, how many 24 housing are illegally occupied and where would we be, in the Municipal District? And again as 25 Cllr Blake pointed out, both himself and myself are the only two of the six councillors from west 26 Wicklow who met Irish Water and we know the problems are with Irish Water for the last, as far 27 as Blessington with the infrastructure for sewerage and then we have, the sewerage is adequate 28 in Dunlavin, but the water is a problem there. But reading there of the 97 units, not one is going 29 to the west, and that's a huge disappointment and frustration. I know even the housing section, 30 I'm dealing with them day in day out, they feel more frustrated about this than anyone, there's 31 nothing happening in the west, it's a dead duck. But could I say too that I asked the question 32 here before about 1,900 houses there, they have been repossessions and are going back to local 33 authorities, about 1,900, how many of those are there in Wicklow? It's a really sad state of 34 affairs too when you think of the people that work hard all their life, that lost their home to the

1 bank and then they are going back onto the market to local authorities. I know people on the 2 scheme will be delighted with any house, but I really feel sorry for those people that have lost 3 out, I know some people who left in the bad times to Australia and elsewhere, now they are back having lost their home, they are back here, trying to get back onto the housing list, back onto the 4 5 ladder, to buy housing and being a second time buyer they're caught with 20% of deposit, which puts it out of reach altogether. It's bad enough a first time buyer with even 10%. So just on 6 7 those, but just you know, I'd like to again point out that there's huge disappointment in west 8 Wicklow, nothing is happening. I know I suggested a letter to the Department on the demands 9 of Irish Water to at least report on the situation in Blessington.

10 Cllr FOX: Thank you Chairman. Thanks to Jackie and Joe and Brid for the update. I think it's 11 fair to say that we would all welcome the fact that the construction of houses is starting to move 12 in the right direction again and I for one and others I know were never a big fan of relying on the 13 private rented sector to solve housing crisis, and certainly there has been a mind shift in the 14 Department and at government level, so we would welcome -- well I would welcome the fact 15 that construction is deemed now to be the appropriate way forward, although obviously the 16 rented sector does still have a role to play when it comes to supply, because with just a little 17 under 4,000 on the housing list we're not going to be able to construct enough houses to deal 18 with that in the short or medium term.

20 Just in relation to RAS, are there any -- what sort of supply is coming in relation to the houses? I 21 know we've had difficulty securing, particularly in the north, houses for the RAS scheme. We're 22 also now taking responsibility for the rent supplement. And people that are in the RAS on these 23 capped schemes, they are deemed -- their housing need is obviously deemed to be met, but are 24 they on the list? Are they removed in both circumstances, both circumstances they are removed 25 from the list? And if it is the case where they are looking to get into their own home and out of 26 those schemes, some people find that that can be a difficulty for them, and perhaps the list is 27 larger than the 3,900 odd people that are on the list.

28

19

And finally, just is affordable sites, affordable housing on the radar in any shape or form? Because I know affordable sites was done in certain parts of the county many years ago and was very successful and it allowed people who are on low incomes, given that we have quite a large land bank, it allowed people to construct their own homes at an affordable rate and while they wouldn't have the income to get a mortgage to buy a house, with assistance through an affordable scheme, particularly on sites they were able to build their own houses and I for one

thought that was a very successful scheme and I wondered is it in the mindset of the housing
 section here at all or is that just a non-runner? Thanks Chairman.

Cllr WALSH: Thanks to Brid and Jackie for the presentations. Just in relation to Jackie mentioned the HAP scheme to be rolled out before the end of the year and there's to be a pilot project in the Greystones areas, as you know there is huge demand for units in Greystones and surrounding areas with difficult to get units, so does this -- is it envisaged this scheme will improve the situation or is it envisaged more units will come on stream? I know it's hard to say, but generally will it improve the situation? Also before I finish up, would it be possible to have a copy of the presentation circulated?

10 Cllr WHITMORE: Thank you chair. Thanks for the presentation and I just have a couple of 11 questions. First with Farrankelly it seems the only one of the projects that is being one of the 12 larger projects done in-house, I would imagine that because of that it's going to take a lot longer 13 to get done because your resources will be going to the first stage projects, so has any 14 consideration been given to actually putting it out to consultants in order to speed the process 15 up? Because as we all know the quicker these houses get built the better.

16

Also in relation to Farrankelly, there's a proposal to use the rocks valley as an infill, as a result that have -- there's only potentially 250,000 tonnes of in-fill going into that site, I would imagine that having, building the houses in Farrankelly and also having that happening, if it does go ahead, what are the impacts on the house build, will it be planned that all this will happen at the same time? Which I think will probably cause and exasperate a very difficult situation. So I was just looking for your opinion on that.

23

Then also in relation to -- it was mentioned that there was going to be a pilot scheme, can we have an update with what's happening with Fairfield Park and the discussions regarding the housing with residents there and what's proposed by the Council?

Cllr BOURKE: Thank you Cathaoirleach, first of all I'd like to pay tribute to the housing section
 for the hard work they are doing, particularly in relation to dealing with the homelessness and
 threats of homelessness that many of our community are experiencing. I think they are doing a
 very good job over the past year and a half or two years since the crisis really developed into
 such a serious situation.

32

Also I'd like to commend our director, Joe Lane, and Brid Kilkenny for the hard work and
 ensuring we have asked for very significant amount of funding and been promised at the stage 2

1 level, as you know already that we're going to get 160 houses up and running in the near future. 2 It's like going back to the good old days when we were elected to the Council first, we were 3 delivering 100 houses per annum, it would be nice to be in a position where over the next number of years we would be handing out the keys to a hundred houses plus per annum to 4 5 people in need of housing in the county. I think it's a shame that this crisis has evolved into what 6 it has become, I really -- being on the housing SPC several years ago with Cllr Nicky Kelly as 7 the chair, we were very concerned, we could see this coming when the previous government, I 8 won't say, it wasn't a Fine Gael government, I think it was Fine Gael brought in the policy of 9 discontinuing funding for social housing nationwide. We could see, and all the members of the 10 SPC could see that this was going to be a major issue for us here in Wicklow particularly, the 11 excuse at the time was there were ghost estates all over the country and housing wasn't needed, 12 but we pleaded the case that Wicklow was an exception, we didn't have ghost estates in Wicklow 13 which was true, but we were ignored, that's the frustration of sometimes being on the Council as 14 a councillor and member of the SPC and probably any SPC, the frustration of not being listened 15 to by officials. I remember being Cathaoirleach of the County Council, probably the last 16 Cathaoirleach to handover keys to new homes in Avoca, I remember pleading publicly with one 17 of the officials who came down from the Department of the Environment, housing directorate, to 18 re-commence funding for construction of social housing projects, as we had in Avoca a beautiful 19 scheme of about 20 or so houses, which are the pride and joy of the Municipal District, 20 unfortunately it fell on deaf ears. Then we had a change of government and the crisis and no 21 more money was available. But I'm glad finally we've turned the corner and we'll be in a 22 position to solve this problem over the next two years I hope, with a significant amount of 23 housing will be delivered between part 5 process and the construction of our own social housing 24 programme and I certainly open that -- and I recall actually, in the past we've had government 25 Ministers here slating officials for not drawing down money, well I hope and extort the 26 directorate here, Joe Lane and Brid Kilkenny not to take their foot off the pedal and accelerate 27 the housing programme to ensure that we don't receive criticism ever again for failing to 28 drawdown. When Minister Roche was in the Department he never stopped criticizing the 29 directorate here for not drawing down money and being inefficient. I reject that, because I see 30 how hard Joe is working and how committed he is and Brid, to ensuring that we deliver for the 31 people of Wicklow, thank you Cathaoirleach.

Cllr McDONALD: Thank you Cathaoirleach, firstly to say it's a snippet of good news, the
 amount of houses countywide is from 97 to 160, albeit we need ten times that amount, just three
 quick questions, general questions. Joe alluded to some of the houses we're getting back into

1 stock following transfers, into other houses, I was just wondering do we have any projects for 2 this, the upcoming budget regarding maintenance of our stock? There's people, the rents, in the 3 majority of cases have been increased since June and the condition of some of the houses is just atrocious. I understand there's not a lot of money going around, but I just want to ask are we 4 5 putting pressure on the Department, are we looking for more money to maintain our housing 6 stock? I know there's a standard that RAS houses and possibly now the HAP houses and houses 7 in receipt of social welfare payments in the rent allowance, there's standards that have to be met, 8 if we are not keeping our own stock up to standard we are going to be facing a bigger problem 9 coming down the line, so just if there's any projects or anything in the budget coming up to put 10 more money into maintenance.

12 The next question is just on the scheme of lettings, I wonder could we be furnished with the 13 actual scheme of lettings or how are the allocations made? I know Bray have their own Housing 14 Department, is their scheme of letting the same as the Wicklow County Council or is there a 15 difference between the two? Is it one scheme for example if you go to Dun Laoghaire/Rathdown 16 Council, you can go in as an applicant and check where you are on the list. It would save a lot of 17 work for a lot of people if an applicant was to come in and say can I see where I am on the list, 18 they were number 321, they could be told it's going to be a number of years before you are 19 housed, they are not going to be ringing up administration every week, every month asking are 20 there houses available, have I gone up the list? So it would save work for the Housing 21 Department as well if we had some sort of consistent allocation system, I understand there are 22 extreme circumstances in some cases and they have to get priority, nobody doubts that at all.

23

11

24 The third question is -- not a question, it's a request, the rolling programme to 2021 Joe talked 25 about, we have a programme in Arklow in the line of the sewage plant we're looking at 2020 or 26 2021 for completion, until that happens we can't lay a brick in Arklow anywhere, of any sizable 27 amount, because we don't have a sewage treatment plant. When we met with Irish Water down 28 on the 5th of September we put to them that if there was a scheme of houses that has been put 29 through all these loops we need to jump through before we can get houses built, if there was a 30 scheme of houses for Arklow that was at the stage of being at the same time the treatment plant 31 was, would that be an option, if we wait till 2021 and then apply to build a substantial amount of 32 housing it will be another two or three years before we get through the loops again before we 33 build a house, so I don't claim to speak for anybody, but I would imagine that everybody in the 34 Arklow area would be grateful of a commitment from the Council that following the completion

of these particular schemes that there will be a scheme looked at to be provided in Arklow that
 will coincide with the opening of the sewage treatment plant. That's it thanks.

- Cllr MATTHEWS: Thank you Chairman, I'm just wondering has the Department expressed any preference for green field sites or larger brown field sites or are they open to in-fill, like imaginative in-fill sites or change of use or living over shop type of initiatives which would probably be slightly more costly and awkward to build, but do provide more, better social benefits as well. So have we actually, will they look at those kind of applications? Thank you Chairman.
- 9 Cllr RUTTLE: First of all I'd like to thank all those for the presentations on the issues, and as 10 the speakers said to compliment the staff over the difficult time we've had over the years, I find 11 them very good and very sympathetic and deal kindly with people in fairly desperate situations 12 on many occasions. It's an indication I suppose of how things go. The situation in the western 13 half of the county would be pretty dreadful considering we're not in a position because of 14 sewerage in one particular town, to even avail of any opportunity from that.
- 15

Now also as regards the meeting with Irish Water, I think that day I was chairing the SPC here, I
met Cllr O'Neill beforehand and I certainly felt that himself and Cllr Blake would represent our
interests very well in that meeting. (Inaudible) In the case of the Blessington sewerage plant or
issues being explored that needed investigation.

20

21 On a broader front, for the county and the country, we are facing a situation unless we get a grip 22 on this housing issue, both public and private, that we could be bringing up a generation, the first 23 generation less well off than the previous one and in a much more precarious position, because 24 they can't get into full-time ownership of houses in many cases, renting is an absolute fortune 25 and the public housing programme is very weak. And that creates huge social problems in 26 society. And we can't allow that to happen, that's a longer thing but it's an awful scenario, it 27 creates a situation, those who have houses and those unable to get them one way or another, it is 28 very bad for society, as it is for the individual.

29

As regards the presentation, this new scheme of 500 million I'd like to know the distribution and allocation of that, how would it be done because depending, is it based on need, is there an allocation per local authority, on figures submitted or what is it? Because we have to use everything we can until we get to an actual building programme to alleviate problems for people, I'd just like more information on that, how it works in terms of what County Wicklow can get 1 out of it. Thank you very much.

2 Cllr O'CONNOR: Thanks Cathaoirleach, first of all I welcome the (inaudible), obviously that's 3 something that we would all welcome, the question is, is there enough, but there's other questions too, I would hope this would signal a move away, hopefully from the notion that, of 4 5 privatisation of social housing. I don't think that's something that serves anybody in the State well. (Inaudible). Joe Lane in his very informative piece there said that the situation in the 6 7 short-term is challenging. Now obviously Joe and everybody here knows that there are families 8 in very difficult situations at the moment in the county, they need housing now, none of the 9 proposed housing is available for these families, obviously I'm not blaming anybody for that, 10 that's just the way these things are, they take a long time to come through.

12 So these families are left with a situation whereby they will be asked to go and look for their 13 own housing to see if they can source their own housing. We've all looked on My Home and 14 Daft, there's hardly anything there. If there is anything there then it might be at the other end of 15 the county. If a family is living in Bray for example and they have kids at school, they might 16 find a house which might be affordable, it might be in Arklow and it needs to be recognised that 17 children have to move schools because of housing issues is absolutely tragic, these kids have a 18 right to be with their friends, to be in their communities and the schools they wish to go to, I 19 would urge the Council to recognise that and I'm sure the absolute centrality of keeping kids in 20 their own communities.

21

11

The HAP scheme, again I recognise that this is another effort to try and sort out difficulties for families, to a certain extent I welcome it, but it's yet another effort at as I said earlier I'd hope to move away from it at the privatisation of social housing (inaudible). I'd like to urge that this is stopped (inaudible).

26 Cllr BEHAN: Thanks Cathaoirleach. It's been a long day, I won't drag it out too much longer, 27 but I do think there are a number of points that need to be made. I fully agree with what Cllr 28 O'Connor said and Cllr Ruttle, who has a lot of experience as a member of the local authority 29 and indeed member of Seanad Eireann. When they both identified the fact that the provision of 30 housing in quantity and in bulk is what we actually need in this country, in order for people who 31 can't house themselves on the social housing list, or young people trying to get in anyway on the 32 housing ladder, so we need a vast increase in supply. I would agree very much with Cllr 33 O'Connor when he talks about the fact that the trend has been for the last 20 years I'm sure and in 34 fact it's been reinforced by this present government, has been to subsidise the provision of

1 private housing by giving rent supplement and HAP and RAS to landlords, but the State never 2 owns the property, they are continually providing rent to landlords, but we the people will never 3 own the houses. If you cast your mind back to the history of this country back in the 40s, there was very little money going, very little finance available, fledgling State and so on, the huge 4 5 house building programme that happened in this country, where estates and there are many of them in this county, talking particularly about Bray, places like Wolfe Tone Square and Palermo, 6 7 huge communities built on slender resources, I can't understand why this government and 8 politicians in Dáil Eireann cannot agree to institute a five-year plan of direct provision of social 9 housing built by local authorities with direct labour schemes where the local authority would 10 employ the building, the block layers, plumbers, electricians, all of the staff that you need to 11 actually build these houses and get them built quickly and allow private developers to build 12 private estates, private developments and so on to allow people that want to go that route. It 13 seems to me completely ridiculous to allow the private sector effectively to dictate what the 14 provision of social housing in this country in the future. It's good that we have the opportunity to 15 discuss it here today and perhaps those who have influence at government level might actually 16 think about this and see is it the right way forward for this country, because I don't think it is.

18 I'd also agree with comments made already, I said this at the SPC meetings, the praise given 19 today to the staff of the housing section, led ably by Joe Lane as director, every single member 20 of that housing office I am concerned are working way over and above the call of duty, they are 21 responding to the emergency situation in the county and responding extremely well and 22 extremely professionally. And in one area in particular and we have all had the experience of it 23 is when they deal with people who are homeless, in very distressed conditions, the humanity, the 24 dignity with which these people are treated is exemplary and I congratulate sincerely everybody 25 for the work done by the Housing Department at the moment. I do think, the chief executive is 26 maybe not listening, but I do think it's important that there should be

27 CE: He can't see you.

Cllr BEHAN: They can do so much, but there's no doubt in my mind they are the busiest department in the Council it's the one that should have highest priority as far as people are concerned and I'd like to see them having adequate staffing levels in the future.

31

17

There's another headline that should come from this discussion, it's a shocking one, which is that at the moment there is a risk that almost one in three people on the housing list will be taken off the housing list within the next couple of weeks. I certainly don't believe that one in three or one

1 third of the people on the housing list have suddenly got housed, I think many of them may have 2 moved address or may not be in contact directly with the Council. I would appeal, obviously 3 Jackie has already done it, but we should all appeal to people out there on the housing list or unaware of this to make sure the Council know where they are living at the moment and the fact 4 5 they want to remain on the list. But I can also say that there are people and I have come across 6 one particular case in west Wicklow, an elderly couple who have been on the housing list for the 7 last ten years, who have been told they are being removed from the housing list. Which I cannot 8 understand, I presume we'll get some kind of response to it, but I would like to see particularly 9 elderly people being treated, particularly carefully when it comes to a decision whether to 10 remove them from the housing list or not. These people are very, very distressed with that 11 situation at the moment. Thank you Cathaoirleach.

- 12 Cllr FORTUNE: Thanks to Joe and Brid and Jackie for the presentation. I agree with the 13 sentiments that the Housing Department do a great job. A lot of the stuff I want to ask has been 14 asked, I won't go over it, where are we in relation to people who find themselves in a situation 15 where all of a sudden they have no home or they are being told by a landlord you're out the door 16 in the next two or three weeks? Are we at this stage able to cope with that or is there still 17 situations where we can't do anything? That's an area in the whole scheme of things that causes 18 a lot of frustration and stress for people. So that's something to add to everything that's been said 19 already.
- 20 Cllr DORAN: Thank you, I'm glad at long last we seem to be getting somewhere, because I've 21 heard at least half a dozen announcements over the last six or seven years of all the houses we're 22 going to build and we haven't built one yet, I'm glad it looks as if we're getting nearer to. I was 23 at the same meeting as Cllr Blake was at the other day and the Department was blaming the 24 County Council and the County Council was blaming the Department, I don't know who it is. 25 But it's nearly time we got a few houses built. I also agree with Cllr O'Neill, west Wicklow 26 hasn't been mentioned for one house. Now I can tell you three or four places, villages in west 27 Wicklow that has all the services there and we don't seem to be getting any house. Thank you. 28 Cllr O'BRIEN: They say good things take time, great things happen overnight. I was very 29 impressed with what the remarks of Cllr Behan and I would say it would be even one day on the 30 housing list is too long. And that we should do something to try and address this problem. I was 31 the one that asked the question -- going on the housing list how long before the 3,886 people will 32 be off the housing list? There's something drastic to be done here, I mentioned the lovely 13 33 billion earlier on, I am saying if the government were collecting that, just think what 13 billion 34 could do for particularly I'm talking about children of this country, I think it's wrong that

1 anybody is any time on a housing list. I think every child deserves equality, we seem to have all 2 forgotten about 2016, this is the year we should make a major change and engage on a massive 3 house building programme, the electricians are there, plumbers are there, all the trades people you need to do it are there lying idle a lot of them, I am saying all we need is a bit of will and 4 5 leadership from our central government and this can be sorted out overnight. I have to thank the staff, I know the wonderful work they do, in very trying circumstances, they do their best, they 6 7 have hearts of gold in trying to sort out the homeless and people like that. It can be done if we 8 just get about doing it, put a proper scheme in place and get it up and running like it was in the 9 40s.

10 Cllr SNELL: I'd like to concur with previous speakers in regard to thanks Brid, Joe and Jackie 11 for their presentations. Just a number of issues I would like to pick up just in regards to the 12 construction programme and part 8, obviously I'm glad to hear that everyone's welcomed the 13 announcement of what's happening, but I would urge a word of caution in regards to the 7 stages 14 have been reduced to four stages through the Department. Four stages are still time consuming 15 and while it's very positive to see this is happening, we also have to depend on other streams, to 16 address the issue overall. While we may not all agree in regards to the approved housing body, 17 it's a fact of life that that's a stream that we also have to depend on.

18

Approving housing bodies, go and talk to the 40 families in Newtownmountkennedy that were housed recently in two different projects, go and talk to the 7 families in Greystones housed recently, another four in Blessington in west Wicklow and four in Rathnew who was purchased through acquisitions. There were 24 acquisitions in the year to date, throughout the whole county, throughout the five Municipal Districts and each and every one of them are a number on the housing list. While it's a small number of allocations, of people turning keys in doors, it's an important number and important fact to them. That they have a roof over their head.

26

I would like to say in regards to the private construction industry, thanks to the members of the Housing SPC that an important piece of documentation has been put in place in regards to part 5, and I think it will have a huge benefit going forward, we all see through the planning section that live applications are on the rise in regards to the building sector.

31

Wicklow County Council will be partaking and receiving their 10% of all these buildings and they will be acquiring their 10% within the developments. Wherever the development is taking place is where the 10% will come from, it won't be first off down into the corner of a field or otherwise or given land in an area which is not sought for, that will start to address some of the
 issues as well, by taking the 10%, to just look from Bray to Arklow, there's a number of projects
 underway as we speak and we look forward to taking our 10% of them housing units.

- 5 I would issue a word of caution in regards to, if we were to listen to everything that was put here 6 today in regards to in parts of the county, Irish Water told members that there's no issue go 7 ahead, get your project together and we'll see, we'll fund it. In other parts of the county the 8 Department of the Environment are saying put your plan together we'll fund it with no issue. 9 But to get your project to that stage it means that you have to put your resources into architects 10 and quantity surveyors in-house here, it means them spending weeks, if not months, putting a 11 project together, such as what happened in Dunlavin where 30 housing units we were told would 12 be built in Dunlavin, occupied the staff's time and resources here, needless to say the waste of 13 funding. Then to be told by Irish Water it wouldn't take place. Same Irish Water told us we 14 couldn't proceed with a small project of four houses in Blessington in west Wicklow. So do you 15 really believe that's a good use of resources for the staff here to go and put their time into 16 projects that we know the end result already? I don't think it makes any sense whatsoever.
- So through the Housing SPC we'll be endorsing, not on a geographical spread, not because of
 favouritism or parochialism, it's based on practicalities of delivering units for people on the
 housing list.
- 22 If I could just say in regards to the housing report up as far as August, was sent out to every 23 member of the Council, and if you want to have a look at that and maybe touch base with some 24 of the housing staff. I know they are very busy, I know they have been assessing the 3,900 25 applications on the housing needs assessment forms, I would at this point put out a call to the 26 thousand people out there that it is through no fault of anyone in here if they don't get back to 27 Wicklow County Council. There may be people who have gone back to other jurisdictions, there 28 may be people who no longer have a housing need. But they still should get in contact with the 29 office here and let people know. But for the thousand people who haven't, maybe through the 30 media sitting up there at the back, if you can put something in the paper to get it out there to let 31 people know that they will be removed if they don't get in touch.
- 32

4

17

21

I'm totally opposed to the HAP scheme, unfortunately it's a national scheme, something that's
 coming in and the something we have no say in. The reason I'm totally opposed is because

1 there's 100,000 families in the State receiving, on the housing list, out of that there's 75,000 in 2 receipt of rent allowance, technically them 75,000 will be removed off the housing list 3 throughout the country, I think that's only playing with figures. But unfortunately it's the scheme that we're left with and I'm glad the previous speakers brought up in regards to the staff of that 4 5 section, we all know the hard work that goes into the housing section here and the huge amount of diversity of issues that they deal with on a daily basis. Now we as a local authority are going 6 7 to have to set up a whole new section and I've already spoken to the chief executive as recently 8 as this morning and raised the issue in regards to the staffing of that section, I don't want to see a 9 situation where we remove three or five staff from the housing section to run a HAP scheme, 10 which is being forced on us by central government, and therefore our own housing section and 11 some of the functions that they run are neglected due to lack of staff. At this moment in time I 12 believe we should have more staff in there, without looking at the HAP scheme.

13

14 But I put it on public record Cathaoirleach, I know you concur with me because you yourself 15 took a huge interest in this section in regards to homelessness, we at this moment in time through 16 the Cathaoirleach of Wicklow County Council, Pat Fitzgerald, housing section and myself as 17 chair of the Housing SPC are in the process of setting up a meeting with the five TDs for 18 Wicklow, we believe that the real negotiations, the real issues will be dealt with in Dáil Eireann, 19 we need the five of our TDs all wearing the one jersey in Dáil Eireann to bring the best back to 20 this county. And when you look at the homeless figures, it's very easy to jump in there and say 21 120 individuals, 217 families are homeless, and that's not the true case. These are people who 22 were given at one stage or another they were in fear of homelessness, given a letter to state that 23 their tenancy is coming to an end or otherwise, given the statutory 112 days notice and through 24 the good work of the people in this building here, a lot of them never actually ended up in a 25 situation of spending a night homeless, because the staff in this Council of which they have 26 come in for a lot of criticism at times in regards to cheap headlines, but came in on a daily basis 27 and sit down and see the reality of what goes on out there. Talk to the people who actually get 28 helped. Thanks Cathaoirleach.

Cllr MURPHY: Just I'd like to say as well, the presentation, it's an eye opener and we need to keep it refreshed in our heads the work behind the scenes. Just like to say, ask a question, on all the proposals on the table, will there be a percentage of those houses allocated to people with disabilities? And also for the last two years there has been a National Disability Strategy for housing for people with disabilities and Wicklow County Council have a committee for that, and I can't, I haven't heard for a while, is that in completion or will that be presented here to the members? Again the funding for the DGBs, are we lobbying for more funding -- I think there's
always a waiting list, there's always lack of funding. Some of the jobs are very minor, but they
mean accessibility and independence for the people who are on that list.

4

5 And you know, maybe we can have a specific breakdown at the next presentation of housing of 6 how many people with disabilities, families are on that housing list? I think it needs to be on the 7 list all the time as a separate section, not just covered in the middle of it. Because I think we as 8 members here all need to know exactly the need out there for that section and that we all have a 9 voice in lobbying for that.

10 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thanks. Cllr Lawless.

11 Cllr LAWLESS: Thanks, I won't keep you too long, a lot of the questions I want to ask have 12 already been asked, thank you as well to the housing staff for the presentation and like Cllr 13 Ruttle I would appreciate a copy sent over to us as well. I want to acknowledge the hard work of 14 the housing staff done under extreme circumstances. Especially around homelessness. I was 15 reading the report, it's great to see the figures and the amount of people supported through in the 16 situation, I want to commend Jackie and her staff on that.

17

18 Joe, I don't know whether you mentioned in the presentation or not, there has been a lot of talk 19 going on, just in regards to CPO and vacant properties, I presume we have been looking at that, 20 do we have any idea how many vacant properties we have in the county and are we able to do it 21 or do we have the funding to do this? Another thing that came up, it's a little more, I don't know 22 whether it is or isn't -- the differential rent scheme, it came to my attention in the Bray area, 23 there's two houses, one sits in Bray housing section, Bray area and the other sits in Wicklow and 24 they are neighbours, both on the same income but paying different rent for the same house, I am 25 just wondering is this a true fact? And I would presume that the differential rent scheme should 26 be cohesive right across the county, or is there a difference between Bray and Wicklow 27 allocation? And that's my two main questions. Thank you Cathaoirleach. 28 CATHAOIRLEACH: Did you want to come in again Cllr O'Connor? 29 Cllr O'CONNOR: An announcement was recently made for expressions of interest (inaudible), 30 how does this fit in the plans of housing section in Wicklow and if money is freed up by this 31 funding from the money that's then saved for the provision of housing. 32 CATHAOIRLEACH: Do you want to come back in there Joe please? 33 DIRECTOR LANE: I'll answer most of them and then Brid and Jackie will answer one or two 34 more, we just won't answer the rest!

2 The list, it has 12 housing schemes, -- we went to the Department with that, that is still our 3 priorities some of those because of the structure of our questions they haven't moved on, but number one and number two, the old Brewery Lane, (inaudible) that's number two, they are 4 5 done, we still have the schemes as our priorities and number 3, which is in Bray, we were told to consider that for an approved housing body, we'll move shortly. Ballinahinch, number 5, 6 7 Mountainview was mentioned by John Snell, we spent time on that at a design, and Irish Water 8 said no. Then we said we're not spending time on building, we can't build and concentrated on 9 build. When we went up to the Department in those schemes they also told us for in-fill or 10 brown field sites we were pushing an open door, that's where those in-fills are coming in from, 11 they are saying also small schemes, so we have the main scheme priority which we all agreed 12 last year, we also have been picking off small schemes becoming available. The one in 13 Kilmacanogue we initially started small in-fill, we now think it could serve more units, that's 14 why it snook up to 20, it may not be able to go depending on the site, but that's where they came 15 from, that's why you have it loaded towards the east, it's what we agreed last year on current 16 priorities and what we think can be built in short-term.

18 We'll look on smaller schemes if we can at all if possible, that's where Aughrim came from, there 19 was an in-fill type unit. Brid will go through again the process, but just to make it clear, April 20 2016 this year we sent up a scheme to the Department, we sent a copy in John, we augmented it 21 with the Arklow one, we got our approvals back in August, late August and we have four or five 22 of them agreed, we went back in in September, so I don't see where the local authority so-called 23 delay is on this one. Again all those are -- we forwarded to you, 29th of April, 6th of June to 24 you, got approval back in August, some back in September, so I don't know where we can look 25 at delays on our side on that one.

26

17

1

Brid will also deal with that -- there are a number of houses within the -- I believe rental market
-- in some cases approved housing bodies or Housing Agency have purchased units that are
suitable, we get queries on a regular basis regarding units that are vacant should they be local
authority, approved bodies and we get back to them as quickly as possible.

31

RAS, we are getting replacement plus 20 or 30 units last year, I can't remember exactly, but there are units out there, as they are social leasing. It's unlikely we'll, we don't have too much land, the Department made it clear affordable housing units will not be an option, they don't see

that as an option. Income related rental scheme will be brought in in the near future and that will, rental houses for a lot of people in the 30 to 350 thousand where they are above the band with social housing, but struggling with houses. Jackie will deal with the next one -- Farrankelly houses, we're going to stick with the work programme we have, if there's another issue that comes in regarding it, we are not going to delay, we'll stick with the programme, seeing the jumps we're pushing -- yeah, look, part of this is there wasn't an investment in the last couple of years, we are only picking that up now, so there will be delays.

9 John stole my thunder, what I was going say, the challenges, there have been a few in 10 Greystones and Newtownmountkennedy, again the support from the homeless unit -- a few 11 people, the sooner people think they are in trouble the sooner they get back to us. We really 12 struggle with people coming in and saying on Friday I'm in trouble, that poses severe difficulty 13 for us. We have lists of people, properties coming back, we have the place in two or three 14 months time that gives us a great opportunity. The sooner people come in and make contact 15 with the homeless section the better, because what's happening is they are coming in in an 16 emergency situation poses a challenge to all of us, and also danger, it takes other units that we 17 have in our head out of sync, so getting people as quickly as possible is better.

18

23

8

In the estimates or the budget we'll have increased provision sought for maintenance, 10%
increase in the budget for housing maintenance and also capital fabric, we'll look for support for
increase of those. Anybody can see -- this is a reserve function what they can't see is -- they can
see where they are, they can't see anybody else, that's private data for everybody else.

Disability action plan, yeah we'll be relooking at it, we have change of staff, it will be re-prioritised and we'll be having a meeting in the near future. There was up to five units, when we talk to people in part 5, that was developers we knew, we had in particular a development -we look for ground floor units of particular demand, we are cognisant but we'll revisit the action plan and keep you up to date.

29

CPO on vacant property, no, sorry but we have priority, we have limited staff, we have priority last year, I'm not starting to see -- we have land, in the short and medium term I don't think we have CPOs, it may or may not yield houses in the short and medium term. But what's included in the part 5 policy, we left it up to the private sector stating that you must provide new units or you bring older units that are not habitable at the moment back into stock, we'll listen to a proposal, but I haven't got resources at the moment to spend on CPOing what may or may not yield units in the near future.

3

1

2

I might have misunderstood the differential rent question, two next door will automatically have
different rent depending on the income of the house, but in the Bray area there is a new
differential rent scheme is part A, part B. Part A is all the county, part B -- because Bray is so
inherently different there would be massive winners and losers, part B is people formally in
Bray, so nobody lost in that regard, but there is part of Bray that is part B of the scheme, I think
that might be the answer to the question. But all rents are different.

10 Cllr LAWLESS: I know all rents are different. Yeah.

11 DIRECTOR LANE: Okay, Brid is going to deal with the scheme and Jackie will deal... 12 SPEAKER: I'll stand over here. I suppose the first thing I will say is the last thing people of 13 Wicklow want (inaudible). The purpose of showing the chart is that there is an approval system 14 that needs to go forward and to highlight delays associated with that. All that being said, just to 15 give you an indication of where we were with Rathdrum, as soon as we got our part 8 approval 16 on the 13th of June we applied, that was our stage 1, once we got part 8 we applied for stage 2 17 approval. The next week we got a whole new set of forms to reapply, which we did, in two 18 weeks we had submitted to the Department on the 29th of June, we got our non-approval on the 19 25th of July, because basically what they were saying was the cost was too high. The 20 Department have an overall county figure of a ceiling of what they think each unit should cost, 21 we are in a rural area, it's a sloping site, there's enabling works to be done, they look at the 22 overall cost, from their point of view it was too high, so they gave them non-approval for stage 23 two and told us to go back and make cuts.

It went out again and the detail required and the next submission for stage 2, this is what I talked about, detail on the cost plan, they wanted size and widths of the doors indicated on drawings, that's the level of detail of the costs that we had to submit. But we rose to the occasion, it went in on the 8th of September and we are awaiting approvals at stage 2.

29

24

Just on stage 1, we met the Department in April, all those projects that we set up, we made our submissions for stage 1 on the 28th of April and got approval on the 22nd of August, four months, and some of those projects were one and two-bed units. So again as I say the Department are working in constraints of the Department of Expenditure and Reform, they have come up with this chart, but to me it is a bit unwieldy and putting in delays that are not 1 2

3

12

necessary. I think stage two and stage three could be compiled in some form or another to quickly move us down to getting it out to contractors.

The other thing is the level of detail as I indicated, needing the actual dimension of doors before 4 5 planning before any aspect of that when it will be the market who determine the price of these 6 things, the longer we delay and the upturn of the economy, it will be such a waste of exercise 7 because it becomes more expensive, we won't have the people. That's all I'll say in terms of the 8 approval, but we just want to park that, we're not interested in the spat with the Department, I 9 can see where they're coming from, we just want to get on with the job. But these stage 10 approvals are putting in an extra delay. We cannot go for part 8, we can't even advertise it until 11 we get stage 2, we've got no stage 2 at the moment.

13 On Glending, the situation is there that anyone that's been involved in the proceedings, as soon 14 as the legal people get their hands on stuff it just goes on and on. Despite all of that, we've 15 parked that and we're working with that in the background, but we're still moving on remediating 16 the houses in Glending. We are now on the fourth phase of this work, 1 to 12 on Glending Road, 17 that's the next stage. Once we have got those done, we have close to 60% of the houses 18 remediated to a pretty good standard, I don't know if anyone has been out there recently, from 19 what I originally started with in 2011 to that estate, it's a much nicer place to drive into now. 20 And as I was saying to some of the legal people involved, when I started on Glending I didn't 21 need glasses and now I do need glasses, that's how long it's going on. Thank you very much. 22 SPEAKER: There's a few particular questions about social housing assessment, as regards the 23 1,000 applicants that haven't sent in their forms, we are making every effort to contact them, it's 24 in our interests as well not to let them slip off the list, they are going to lose their years on the list 25 and it will take us longer to put them back on the list and interview them, we don't have the 26 resources, so it's in everyone's interest.

27

Baltinglass Municipal District, again credit to the staff that ran out and got the figures for me, so in that particular district overall one-bed need 230, two-bedroom 252, 3-bedroom need 165 and four-bed need 41, so anyone else that needs figures for the county they can come to me.

31

As regards HAP and RAS, we're depending on the rental sector, unfortunately that's where we're at, the whole rental sector has changed (inaudible). It was mentioned about how we're going to house 3,886, we're never going to house 3,886 because I would say two thirds of those availing of housing support will never look for social housing, they are never going to want a Council
house or go into the category, that's the difference of demand versus need, we need to look at
that in the context of the list, need isn't necessarily what the demand is, so that's how we look at
that, but we'll chase up the forms outstanding.

6 RAS and HAP, yes if you go on to My Home and Daft -- we have relationships with landlords 7 that don't advertise, we move people on all the time, there is progression throughout RAS, we get 8 RAS vacancy and we have lists waiting for social RAS houses, so there is good movement there 9 at the moment. HAP, it's unknown to us, we're going in the final wave of another group of 10 authorities in December, 1st of December is the launch date. We'll have a special HAP unit 11 working hand in hand with RAS.

12

5

As regards Greystones, I said about the scheme, I was saying this is a particular project that we can use for pilot for rolling out of HAP, just to clarify that. We'll be looking at the support worker (inaudible), their main job is to source properties and build up relationships with estate agents and landlords, they have homeless (inaudible).

17 Cllr FORTUNE: Just a quick question. When you do all the trawling on the list and say you 18 give it two months grace and people still don't respond, if a person was to come back after that 19 time, in the future and could establish that they were, they do need a house and were genuinely 20 in need of a house, could they not just be put back on the list?

- SPEAKER: Generally if we've given them six months grace, if we've rang them, e-mailed them,
 spoken to councillors which we do, they can lose their years, they are in danger of losing their
 years on the list, no doubt about that, but obviously we'll look at each application.
- 24 Cllr FORTUNE: That's my point.
- SPEAKER: Someone ten years on the list and hasn't returned their form, that's the problem, they
 are in danger of losing the ten years on the list.
- 27 Cllr FORTUNE: If they come to us and make a case.
- 28 SPEAKER: We'll certainly talk to them, we're not in the business of making it harder for them.
- 29 CATHAOIRLEACH: All right. Can I just say something myself as Chairman of the County
- 30 Council, as Cathaoirleach. I have the height of admiration for the work that's happening in the
- 31 housing section over many years and particularly in the last few years with the difficulties we
- 32 have encountered, and I want to thank the SPC and housing for their efforts. I live in an area that
- has been decimated by unemployment and other matters, as Cllr McDonald said we've no
- 34 sewage treatment plant, a lot of our private houses are being rented or bought by people not from

1 Wicklow, because there seems to be a movement from south county Dublin down to Wicklow, 2 but I was just thinking there, there was an announcement about Emoclew, a man more famous 3 than me announced it in 2007, a politician, and nine years later we're going to get an announcement for 54, I think back in 2007 when we were opening the recycling centre in 4 5 Arklow, a former colleague, but anyway, look this time it's going to happen. I'm realistic enough that Wicklow County Council can't provide the number of houses themselves, we are going to 6 7 have to get support from the approved housing bodies, from the Housing Assistance Payment, 8 it's ironic that in 2013 there was one social house provided in Wicklow, I don't think there is any 9 going to happen this year, none last year, not our fault I might add, none in 2014. There is 65 10 social houses being built in Ireland this year to date, that's the fact of the matter. So I think we 11 went out in 2011, so five years later it hasn't improved.

13 So look, I have no doubt that we're on the right road, 140 houses, it's 140 families being housed 14 and it's very hard to see that that's going up to 2019, so great efforts have been made, and as I say 15 I want to thank everyone, because there's not a day that I'm not onto the housing section, as some 16 of you may know Jackie, but I'm on every single day with problems, every time you get a 17 response, you mightn't like the response, but certainly there's a lot of hard work going on in that 18 department, as there is in other areas of Wicklow County Council. If we work together, please 19 God this time next year we'll be here in a better situation, there will be some of the developments 20 on stream and I want to thank, I think Cllr Fortune brought it to our attention in the last meeting 21 looking for debate, maybe it's something we should have on in a few months time, maybe after 22 Christmas, things move on. So if there's no other comments or inquiries I think we'll move on to 23 item 3, discuss Wicklow Council data protection protocol. Do you want to come in Cllr 24 Lawless?

25 Cllr LAWLESS: Thanks Cathaoirleach and thanks for allowing this on the agenda today for the 26 Special Meeting, just in regards to the data protection, it's the data protection waiver forms, we 27 have had them for quite some time as councillors, I'm not sure how other councillors feel about 28 them, they are providing quite a difficulty trying to get them to people, get them back, get them 29 signed, get them down to Wicklow, it's more work on everyone's behalf. On this, we contacted 30 the Data Protection Commission on it and they have actually -- I got an e-mail back, which 31 actually says Wicklow is doing more than is required under, having these waivers that they are 32 not actually necessary for us as representatives to have them.

33

12

34

Now I'm not in dispute in any way, shape or form with the data protection protocols put in place

here in Wicklow, I feel it's very appropriate, I don't think it is right that any councillor or
 anybody can just walk into any office and access any file without permission. And I do
 acknowledge that. The issue that I would have is with the actual waiver forms we have to get
 sent.

So I would like to put a proposal if that was okay today, and the proposal I would like is that 6 7 Wicklow County Council seize the requirement of the data protection waiver forms from all 8 public representatives making a representation on behalf of constituents in line with the 9 conditions laid down in the guidance note for data controllers on the release of personal data to 10 the public representatives, which states where a public representative makes a written 11 representation on behalf of a constituent, the organisation can generally assume that the 12 constituent has given consent for the release of the personal data necessary to respond to the 13 representation.

So I'm hoping, I don't know what the feeling is from my fellow councillors here today, how they
feel about the actual forms, and it really is just the forms I would like reviewed please. I will
give you a copy of the proposal.

18 CATHAOIRLEACH: We just want to circulate it to members.

19 Cllr LAWLESS: Absolutely thanks.

20 CATHAOIRLEACH: Just in the meantime if Christine can come in there please.

CHRISTINE: If I could preface my remarks by saying I was asked to chair a committee
 reviewing the data protection procedures in 2014, this is following the Local Government
 Reform Act and generally in the interest of good governance. There was a committee formed
 which represented all of the sections within the local authority, we reviewed the suite of
 documents based on legal advice, and procedures and protocols were legally vetted, if you like,
 and we also introduced a comprehensive training programme.

27

5

14

The happening -- I want to stress that this is in no way intended to undermine the representational role of the councillors, or to make their lot any more difficult than it actually is, I fully appreciate the part-time nature of the role of the elected member and realise how difficult it is and this is another layer of bureaucracy if you like. I also refer to the guidance note circulated by Cllr Lawless and would like to say that the -- under data controllers, the second paragraph goes on to say as the organisation is accountable for the personal data it has chosen to release, it should be satisfied that it's reasonable to assume that the individual whose personal

data is being released would have no objection to the release to a public representative. And it
further goes on to say, however there will be cases where it would be appropriate for the
organisation to check with the public representative or the individual whose personal data is
being released that such release is not going to give rise to later complaints.

6 And then on under the role of the public representatives, it stresses the need to be satisfied that 7 they are acting with consent of the individual and that the representative should understand the 8 obligations on the organisation to keep personal data confidential. Particularly in the area of 9 housing and planning, we're dealing with sensitive data, while I totally accept it is a pain in the 10 neck to have these forms filled in, I think it is a requirement that we as custodians of the personal 11 data of so many, if you add that to the tenants and all of the other classes of records in housing 12 alone -- it's significant. Similarly there are quite a lot of sensitive data in the area of planning 13 and again we would have significant records going into the tens of thousands, if not hundreds of 14 thousands of records. So there is an onus on us to protect that data, but if we can find a more 15 streamlined way, but we must be satisfied that the actual applicant or data subject has consented 16 to the representations and unfortunately in some instances, for example in planning, people have 17 expressed surprise when they have been contacted by Planning Department to find an elected 18 representative has accessed the file, similarly there have been issues where a number of 19 councillors -- I know this is not intended to cause confusion, but it has happened where a number 20 of people would make representations on behalf of an individual.

21

5

So it's really thinking of our clients and how best we can manage their data. I'd also like to add in relation to housing, if you look at the housing application form, we undertake to mind that data, and indeed with our privacy statements, our statements up on our website, we undertake to our clients that we're going to mind that data to the best of our ability and within the requirements of the data protection laws, so we do take that responsibility.

27

I'm advised by the director of housing that it is an issue nationally and the directors of housing
 are meeting with the Data Protection Commissioner or have requested a meeting with the Data
 Protection Commissioner to address this issue.

31

And finally if I can just alert the councillors to the fact that there's new data protection legislation due to come into force, actually on foot of EU directives which came into force in April of last year, and it becomes new law in 2018, that puts further requirements on the local authority and

indeed on all organisations dealing with data and deals with things like sharing data between
 organisations, mandatory breach notifications and things like the right to compensation and
 financial penalties. So sorry to say it could get worse before it gets better. Thank you
 Cathaoirleach.

5 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Shay Cullen.

13

17

6 Cllr Shay CULLEN: Thanks Chairman. I would certainly have issues with the whole data 7 protection forms that we have to get filled out, I accept protocols are important for data, but 8 particularly for sensitive data, obviously this is new to the public as well, we have applicants 9 looking for planning permissions or looking for reps on housing, but they even ask why do I 10 need these forms? And you go through the rigmarole, but I suppose as was alluded to earlier, 11 this is effectively a part-time job and travelling the four corners of the county to get forms 12 signed, I think there could be easier ways to deal with this issue.

14 There is certainly issues, I've had it myself where we've had multiple applications by a particular 15 applicant with regards to planning proposals and you have to get multiple forms signed, which to 16 my mind is a bit ludicrous.

There is also issues surrounding if there's controversial projects in a particular area and maybe the public would like to know what is happening, we as public representatives can't officially look at those projects unless you have consent by the actual applicant of the project, and maybe it's something that we would like to relay to our constituents, so again there's issues there. So I would be asking that we would have a look at the whole area around the procedure of this, I think we can improve it, I think we can make it easier on public representatives and I think it's important we have a full look, full and thorough look at it. Thank you.

25 Cllr RUTTLE: Certainly I can see where Cllr Lawless is coming from on this, as Cllr Cullen has 26 outlined it's becoming a very arduous and difficult thing, particularly if you live in a big rural 27 constituency where you are dealing with people that can't scan stuff in, don't do this, you could 28 drive a solid 70 or 80 mile round trip to get a form signed and or something else, it creates a lot 29 of hassle. There is another way of dealing with this, which is probably simpler even than this 30 way, I know of one local authority that does that. The person when they make a planning 31 application, they put in writing that they authorise Cllr X to be on the file, that's from them, and 32 then when Cllr X's name is put on there's no further need after that. But the applicant put that in 33 with his or her application. I know of a another authority adjoining this one, that works on that 34 basis. So I think that makes it simpler again. You don't have to get involved -- you can be in

1 that position.

2

But something has to be done I certainly find it very frustrating, and as Cllr Cullen said for multiple applications people think you are on anyway, but you are not, you may catch up with that, you are not on the next one -- it becomes, it annoys people. And certainly -- but that's another way around it, but the applicant places it on file.

- CATHAOIRLEACH: It would be better than what happened here previously where people were
 putting their names on files without being asked. Or ringing people that they got them planning
 permission when they were never asked and we don't know where it came from.
- 10 Cllr RUTTLE: But Cathaoirleach this is where the applicant...
- 11 CATHAOIRLEACH: I know, but people were writing their name on the file and they were12 fairly good at it.
- 13 Cllr RUTTLE: Sometimes two days before a favourable decision.

14 CATHAOIRLEACH: Which was overturned! Sorry, Cllr O'Connor.

- 15 Cllr O'CONNOR: Thanks. In requiring these forms to be filled is one way of protecting data, 16 that's the way that the Council has decided its data should be protected, as Nicola said earlier we 17 recognise that the data has to be protected everybody understand that, it's just about how it's 18 done. We also know that this is by no means an effort to try and get in the way of councillors 19 making representations. The point is that this level of bureaucracy is not necessarily required, 20 and that's our difficulty with it. I think that Cllr Ruttle pointed out the difficulty in trying to 21 make round trips to far flung areas in the county to try and get these forms filled in, that's not 22 helping anybody out, not helping us, not helping constituents or councillors, it's very clear from 23 the guidance note for data controllers, on the release of personal data to public representatives, 24 that we advise our public representatives that make a written representation on behalf of the 25 constituent, the organisation can generally assume the constituent has given consent of release of 26 personal data necessary. Now I think it says there "generally assume", unless the Council 27 officials in question have some sort of feeling that there mightn't have been or there might be 28 something missed there, they can look further into it, but this is the legal advice from the office and I think that really is what the councillors should be going along with, unless they think 29 30 there's something untoward about it.
- 31

The forms basically are not necessary, if they were necessary we'll just have to put up with it, and the issue of EU regs coming down the line is something we'll have to deal with in the future. Cllr LAWLESS: Just to come back in, thanks for that, I do appreciate the work you have done

1 on it, but I do feel that there has to be a better and easier way to do this without these forms, I do 2 strongly believe it. I know for a fact if I do representation for housing for example, I've never 3 once went in and asked to look at anybody's actual file, I've no need to look at anybody's file, that's just my personal view, I would send in my representation and if there's correspondence 4 5 come back that's fine. If you really insist that we need something, we need to look at some form 6 of an e-mail or something that's more streamlined, but the forms really, really are a hindrance 7 rather than a help. As I say data protection, it does -- we need it, we're not denying that, but I 8 really think the forms need to go at the moment, and what the Data Commissioner has said in the 9 e-mail is it's not -- it's also not a requirement under the data protection legislation is what I got 10 back, that was one of the lines in the e-mail. So I'm only going by what I have been told from 11 that office themselves in and around that. So I'll leave it to my fellow councillors here if they 12 want to support my proposal or somebody else wants to suggest something else. 13 Cllr RUTTLE: And this letter still costs us all €20 a shot.

- 14 CATHAOIRLEACH: Christine wants to come in here. When you're finished. I think Cllr15 Behan is next.
- 16 Cllr BEHAN: I don't think I was, I think Cllr Annesley and Cllr Matthews were before me.
 17 Cllr ANNESLEY: Thank you very much Cllr Behan.
- 18 CATHAOIRLEACH: That's not what the technology says Cllr Behan, sorry about that.

19 MS GALLAGHER: Now you're gone.

20 CATHAOIRLEACH: If you snooze you lose. Press it again Joe. Cllr Annesley.

21 Cllr ANNESLEY: Thank you Cathaoirleach, I can see for and against this form, first of all I 22 think because my name's Annesley I'm top of the list, I get a phone call from Bray, a person 23 looking for a house, obviously she's contacting the 32 councillors. Now I'm not going to drive to 24 Bray, but I say I have to send out a form before I speak to you, I send a form in the post, nine 25 times out of ten that doesn't come back, so he or she's phoned 32 councillors, so they don't send 26 back the form, that's how I get the forms out to people, I post them. The second point I make is 27 that on Friday evening half past 3 and someone comes in, in a desperate state I ring the office 28 and nobody ever asked me Tommy have you signed a protection data form, nobody, it's never 29 been said when it's an emergency. The final point I will make, two points to make, two of them 30 happened on Saturday, first of all 10 o'clock a gentleman came to see me, asked could he speak 31 to me for example with a problem, he was applying for a Council mortgage, he had a file this 32 thick, if anyone applied the paperwork is unbelievable, you have to be turned down by the bank 33 you have to -- there's a heap of things you have to have, but salary, his wife's salary, his own 34 salary, rent and bank, I said hold on, I have to get you to sign this form. He said for what? He

1 couldn't believe it, he was giving me the information to look through, I said no I have to get to 2 you sign it, he signed it and I advised him on the matter. Then later on Saturday afternoon a 3 woman rang me, she wanted me to bring up in housing today about she is sick her husband had a serious operation, she had a letter from the doctor and in rented accommodation and it's not 4 5 suitable. I said I have to get to you sign a form. Them two people said why, we want to give you this information, they couldn't believe that I had to get them to sign this form. So I can see 6 7 the for and against, definitely Nicola, Cllr Lawless I would agree with you, sometimes getting 8 the form out to people and getting it back is a problem, but there is ways and means around it. 9 As Cllr Ruttle said if you're living in the far west it is hard to see people, but 55 or 70 pence 10 stamp will solve a lot of problems as well. Thank you.

Cllr BEHAN: First of all can I say to Cllr Annesley just tell her to go to the next one on the list
for the next person on the list, save you the price of a stamp.

13

I think it's very important and I compliment Cllr Lawless for bringing this up for discussion, because it's something that didn't apply in the time when I was a member of the Council in the past, I'm sure other members who were here from the 80s would be quite surprised that this new rule was brought in, but I do see that data protection is a huge issue now for people who work in any organisation and it's the same in school, the same in any commercial organisation, as well as any public body. So as Cllr Annesley said there are two sides to the argument.

20

I think what's important is the spirit in which the rules are implemented and I was impressed in Christine's approach, I do believe for once there isn't a conspiracy by the management against the members that in this case it's a requirement put on the management of the Council and we have to genuinely recognise that. But I think we should work together to try and find a solution that will satisfy the law, but will also allow us to do our fundamental job of representing the public.

27

Now one starting point might be to ascertain what is the practice in the other local authorities in
the country because one of the difficulties is that in different areas there are different
requirements, so I welcome the fact that the director of housing is going to be meeting with the
Data Protection Commissioner to discuss this issue and I think before we make any definite
decision on this today we should at the very least find out what is the general practice on all local
authorities. I don't think so we should be disadvantaged in how we are treated but, I also feel we
should be consistent with other local authorities.

2 But I'd also make the point, if you look carefully at the form we're asking people to sign, and 3 Cllr Lawless mentioned this point, it's people giving permission to the Council officials to give us access to detailed reports and so on that are on the file. I don't remember ever having seen 4 5 that it's actually required in order for us to make representations though. There's one side of the story is getting information that's confidential, that's personal data, but if we're only making a 6 7 representation as in writing a letter to the housing officer recommending that somebody's case 8 should be considered for housing, I don't see how we're getting any information from that, and I 9 don't see how that would in any way effect the person's right to have their data kept confidential. 10 So that might be one way around it.

1

11

12 The other issue Cllr Ruttle mentioned about planning matters, and the fact that in the past and 13 he'll remember this, in the good old days, Cllr Fox's late father Johnny Fox would certainly have 14 been a past master at this particular situation, that we had planning committee meetings, area 15 meetings every month where every member of the local authority in the particular area could 16 request a planning file of people they wanted to support and they were discussed at a meeting 17 and discussed very effectively by people like the late Johnny Fox and others, in order to have a 18 discussion of the planners that might bring up a point that may or may not be known by the 19 planners, it was probably a nightmare for officials and planners, but certainly was helpful from 20 the point of view of public representatives. No data protection issue in that and I know the law 21 has been introduced since. I do think as part of this review if councillors want to make 22 representations in relation to a planning file, there should be a mechanism for us to be able to do 23 that, that's a streamlined mechanism, whether it's writing in, or having an appointment with the 24 planner to discuss it, or to have a protocol in place that we understand clearly what our rights are 25 in relation to that issue, because I think that's also part of the whole discussion, or should be 26 anyway Cathaoirleach.

27 Cllr MATTHEWS: Thanks Chairman. Cllr Behan has said most of what I was going to say 28 about levels of access to information and to ring up and make representations probably doesn't 29 need consent, but to look at data does, so if we can have clarification on that, but also I would be 30 concerned you would be putting an official in a position where they have to make an assumption 31 and that assumption might come back to bite them at some stage. I think they will be happy to 32 have a piece of paper or some other verifiable way of confirming that permission was given, so 33 could it be done through a texting system, through an e-mail system? We would have e-mails 34 and mobile numbers probably of the person that we were making representations for, it could be

1 streamlined in that way to certainly reduce the burden on people travelling around the county 2 with a piece of paper in the hand. I'm wondering if the executive have suggestions on how to 3 streamline it, I'm sure we're willing to go along with it, to make it more streamlined I suppose. Cllr SNELL: Thanks Cathaoirleach, I suppose it's quite simple in regard to the proposal, just to 4 5 have the requirement of the data protection waiver form, we could be here all day discussing 6 whether it's a housing issue, plannings, roads, whatever, it covers every section of Wicklow 7 County Council. The data, there's a rule there for the Data Protection Commissioner, local 8 authority is the controller, there's also a section too in the Act for public representatives, which I 9 know each and every person here takes it very seriously, and I really feel that it's being taken out 10 of our hands to a certain degree in regards to not being trusted with the information that our 11 constituents are giving to us, because in a lot of the cases we're giving the information to the 12 local authority, we're inserting information, we're bringing forward what I would call public 13 representatives reps to put in on files. I don't believe that any person in this chamber is entitled 14 to look at a housing file in the housing section, under no shape or form do I believe that anyone 15 should take out a housing file, nor do I believe they should have a waiver form to put in 16 representation to support that application, the same with planning.

17

18 I feel that we need to go back to the basics and look at the legal advice coming from the 19 organisation, which represents each and every one of us, LAMA is stating the legal opinion 20 received indicates strongly that elected members are entitled to information on housing policy, 21 housing provision and housing allocation, irrespective of data protection. Now that poses a 22 bigger question for Christine and her staff in regards to information that we were given here 12 23 months ago, and again I have no real issue with regards to the information we were given, but 24 this is contradicting what was given there. This local authority back in 2010, Labour tried to 25 introduce a thing through the chambers here where we want to keep people off the housing list 26 who had convictions for various different crimes and the then Tanaiste, Eamon Gilmore, 27 reprimanded them individual Labour Party members, along with this Council Chamber and it 28 brought up the whole issue of public representatives getting the information on the allocation of 29 housing, and Cllr Behan touched on it there earlier in regards to what used to happen, in the past 30 you would get representation showing you that people were being considered in a particular area 31 and if you had concerns you could raise it with officials. That was in the old days when 32 councillors could work with officials, it seems all that is taken out of our hands. That's why I say 33 I don't want to get into a housing issue or planning issue, it's a waiver form. I get phone calls 34 from all over the county in regards to making representations, and I think it's impractical to

1 expect us to drive around the county to get a form signed. I would point out the form can be 2 signed, but officials in here who are actually the data controllers don't know who signed that 3 form. Joe Blogs down the road can sign that form in the name of the person and you as the data controller don't know that, I don't want to put any more obstacles in the way, but that's why I 4 5 believe that the evidence produced throughout the State shows we as a local authority are 6 overdoing it, in comparison to our colleagues throughout the country. I feel that we should vote 7 on this today and therefore if evidence comes forward through your negotiations with LAMA or 8 their legal advice or the Department, then we can readdress it, but I think we need to take the 9 hurdles out of our way at this moment, and the waiver form I don't believe is adding, I don't 10 know one member who goes into the housing section and asks to look at files, they wouldn't be 11 given them, and in regards to the planning section, a member of the public can come in and 12 request to look at the planning file, a member of the public can get it quite easily and we can't, 13 but I do accept there is sections of the planning file which can be kept back, I agree with that, it 14 should be kept back from public representatives as well.

15 Cllr KAVANAGH: I wanted to suggest on Cllr Lawless's proposal today, if there are a number 16 or a lot of County Councils up and down the country who aren't using these data protection 17 forms, why don't we get the facts before we vote. Why don't we find out if we are in the 18 minority. It should be a simple enough exercise and then we can be fairly sure we're covered if 19 we decide to do away with them, because they really are an absolute nuisance factor when it 20 comes to dealing with the public, trying to get forms to them, forms back from them, as Cllr 21 Snell said the next-door neighbour could have signed then, we don't know. Why are we making 22 things difficult for everybody, let's get the figures on the table and take it from there. 23 Cllr FOX: Thank you Chairman. Certainly it's my experience that the data protection forms 24 have created difficulties, now I am also realistic insofar as data protection is now a very live 25 issue and the climate that we're in I think the officials can actually be charged under data 26 protection, but I can never understand, there is a housing application form to get on the housing 27 list, there's also a planning application form when you apply for planning, can these application 28 forms not be adjusted to include a line do you wish your information to be given to a public 29 representative if he or she requests it? And a simple yes or no. So when the planning 30 application is made, it's quite clear that if the public rep wants to make a representation on it, 31 they have indicated yes or no, because in planning anyway there are privileges to a person who 32 applies that has a public representative on their file. They are given the option of a time 33 extension, they are given the recommendation of the planner, so it is actually a very helpful thing 34 to have a public representative on your file, and a lot of people don't realise that until they

actually apply for planning, but I can't see why it can't be put onto the actual application form,
 because going to the planning office with this desk with nothing on it and a seat that has three
 legs is just a farce, an absolute farce.

Cllr WALSH: Thanks Cathaoirleach, it's obvious has been stated the Council are custodians of 4 5 sensitive data, it's obvious from comments we've heard so far that the data protection form system is not working and we need another mechanism to replace it, such as Cllr Fox's 6 7 suggestion, so maybe we should wait until after the meeting with the Data Protection 8 Commissioner, I don't know, but we need to come up with a new formula to address this issue, 9 but the forms need to go, I think we are all in agreement with that. There is examples there 10 where who knows who signs the form, I think it was Cllr Snell mentioned it, he said anyone 11 could sign that form. You have a situation where people are ringing every councillor in the 12 chamber in relation to a particular issue, so it's not working.

- 13 Cllr THORNHILL: Cathaoirleach, in relation to these forms I personally, I have no problem 14 because as some of the councillors mentioned earlier on, we are living in a climate now of data 15 protection and it's very important that we're seen to be serious and when you are dealing with 16 something sensitive and people will say well this has been taken up seriously and they are going 17 through protocol, but by the same token I appreciate what other speakers have said about going 18 around the country and getting signatures or whichever, as Cllr Snell said, a signature could be 19 signed by someone else. But maybe I haven't got too many of these cases on my hands, but 20 when I do meet the person and speak to them, you can have it there on hand, so maybe we 21 should look at the situation, what pertaining -- what happens in other areas, definitely it's 22 something that should be seriously looked at.
- 23 CATHAOIRLEACH: Can I just say myself I contacted 7 counties, Carlow, Kilkenny, Wexford, 24 Monaghan, Louth and different -- there's different things happening in different counties, one of 25 them is now concerned taking what you are suggesting Cllr Behan, they want to find out, County 26 Monaghan, what's happening in the other counties. I think really the housing directors are 27 meeting later this year with the Data Commissioner, and I think really we should find out what's 28 happening elsewhere to be honest about it, to be consistent. I know what Cllr Snell is saying there, I mean I take the point that anyone can sign a form and write a name on it, I can write 29 30 left-handed or right-handed, that's neither here nor there, we don't know who is signing some of 31 the forms.

32 Cllr DORAN: And two Biros yeah.

CATHAOIRLEACH: But I really think, look it does need a review. I think we should have a
 review and I take on board what Cllr Behan has said and we should contact other counties and

leave it maybe to Christine to do some further work on it, because she's done work on it
 previously. I know Cllr Snell you are looking for a vote today, I don't know what Cllr Lawless
 thinks, I want to see what is happening elsewhere. Cllr Fortune?

Cllr FORTUNE: Thanks Cathaoirleach, I think the whole thing is a mess, in simple language I 4 5 think it's silly, it's basically all it really is, is a barrier for public reps to do their job properly, I 6 can't understand why if someone contacts you, you send an e-mail and say Joe Blogs contacted 7 me, that should be good enough. I think in principle we should take a vote on it today, because 8 at least by doing that, we're taking a stand and as someone said earlier, depending if we have to 9 change that in the future we can still do it inside here in the chamber, but taking a stand on this 10 as public reps, if we don't we're letting ourselves down, we should take a vote and put it up to 11 them, because to me there doesn't seem to be any uniformity across the country at all. Perhaps 12 maybe here in Wicklow we're more, how will I put it, we're more paranoid -- I really think we 13 should take a vote on it.

14 CATHAOIRLEACH: So we've seconder for -- you're seconding Cllr Snell's proposal are you,
 15 Cllr Lawless, whichever?

16 Cllr LAWLESS: Can I just come back in, I would agree, I would like a vote today, just that the 17 forms are gone. I mean certainly if we feel we need some form of other data protection we can 18 also have a look at it in protocol, we can look at different ways of streamlining it, but all I'm 19 asking today is that the waivers are gone now. Because I know history from being here, these 20 things take a long time, we say we'll do it at such and such a date, we have budgets coming up, 21 the County Development Plan, we have motions sitting on the agenda, I don't want this to get 22 lost, so I would appreciate a vote today whether it's passed or not, just as I say it is only the 23 waiver forms I'm asking for today. Thanks very much.

24 CATHAOIRLEACH: Christine you want to come in again please?

CHRISTINE: Thank you Cathaoirleach. Just to, a general response, obviously we're very happy
to work with the elected members to come up with a more streamlined approach. And the
solution proposed by Cllr Fox and Cllr Ruttle may be workable, certainly I'm more than happy,
we have actually contacted some of the other local authorities and I'm more than happy to come
back to the members with the results of that survey.

30

I have a problem with this guidance document and I think Des probably wants to come in from a planning point of view, but this statement that the organisation can generally assume that a constituent has given consent, I think it's very dangerous to refer to that as a legal document, it's simply guidance, it goes on to qualify that statement, so whether we have the forms or whether we don't have forms, we still as officials have to satisfy ourselves that it's okay to release the
data. Now I fully accept there's a difference between information and records and there's various
things that can be released and the general pro forma letter can probably be released without data
protection, but we have to look at that in more detail, but as I said I'm more than happy to work
with the elected members. I think Des wants to say something.

6 DIRECTOR O'BRIEN: I didn't really want to say anything!

7 CATHAOIRLEACH: I thought you were anxious to come up.

8 DIRECTOR O'BRIEN: All I will say about planning, I think Joe is right, whoever said it, if you 9 want to make a rep on a file you can make a rep on a file, the deal in Wicklow used to be 10 members would come in they would see the planner's report before anyone else would, they can 11 discuss the entire file with them. Our advice is that when someone makes an application for a 12 service in the Council, the results of that are their business and no-one else's business, so we can 13 go out and tell people this is what's happening with the application, they are in trouble here, they 14 are not there. This is why we asked for it to be signed off, because councillors now get the 15 information in advance of the applicant, that's the only reason. You can actually put your name 16 on a file that's no problem, you can come in and see a file like anyone else can. We can try and 17 make it easy for you as possible, give you your own office and desk and people bring the file to 18 you, that's the only difficulty we have. That's why we look for it. If we can streamline it by 19 e-mail or some other way, if we take time extensions we'll take that by e-mail, we normally ask 20 the agent whose signature we have on file to witness the signature, so we have a chain of 21 signatures that we can recognise, because that can end up a High Court case, so there must be 22 some way around this, but that's our bottom line, that you aren't entitled to get information ahead 23 of the applicant. The applicant has, avails of a service from us and they are entitled to it, that's 24 the advice we got all along, not -- even that is protected data. That's where we're coming from. 25 Any way around that, yeah we'll go for it. Councillors in Wicklow have always had probably 26 much more access to files than anyone else in the country in fact. At any stage in the process, 27 we worked together on it, there was no problem, there is a problem now, but we want that level 28 of knowledge and I don't think you get that in a lot of counties, that members used to actually see 29 proposals in the past. But if you want that we have to sign them, that's the basis. 30 Cllr FOX: Very quickly, thanks Chairman. The system we do have in place allows for 31 minimum contact between the planner and applicant, the public representatives are trying to help 32 in the process, trying to work with the planner's recommendation, so other counties have a 33 different system where there is much more access to planners from the applicants, we have a 34 more restrained system, there is not as much engagement between applicants and planners, that's

why public representatives have a bigger role in Wicklow, because of that we are now frozen out
of that a little bit, and I feel strongly about this. I have a very good working relationship with all
the planners and the senior planners, but I do feel that before we were playing our part to help
the system, now it has become more difficult and part of the problem is that the applicants don't
have that access to the planners. That's part of the -- maybe that's part of the solution.

- 6 CATHAOIRLEACH: Okay.
- Cllr MATTHEWS: Chairman, could I ask are we voting to remove a legal requirement from
 data protection here? Would it not be wiser to defer this or amend the proposal to say we'll cease
 the requirement when a more streamlined acceptable approach is adopted and give ourselves a
 month or two months breathing space, put it before protocol, we don't want to leave a gap in the
 system, if someone is leaving themselves open to not complying with data protection, I would be
 concerned we're removing a legal requirement...
- Cllr LAWLESS: The data protection office said it's not required under data protection
 legislation to have what we have. I don't know whether that satisfies.
- 15 Cllr MATTHEWS: Would you accept the amendment to say we cease the requirement for forms 16 when we adopt and we do that within 60 days?
- 17 CATHAOIRLEACH: Just a second, let the director back in again please.

18 DIRECTOR O'BRIEN: Cllr Lawless, if you read down that thing it says that quite boldly yeah,

- 19 if you read down then it basically says it's up to you to be sure, basically I'm responsible, you
- 20 can pass whatever motion you like here today, but I am going to have to follow the law. We got
- 21 legal advice, the same person gave you all training on it, you can ask them questions every time.
- But at the end of the day, if there's a legal requirement, I'm not going to go out, because there's a motion, that's not going to stand for me in court.
- 24 Cllr LAWLESS: This is the e-mail I received, it's not this, this is actually from...
- DIRECTOR O'BRIEN: Maybe if you give me the email we can write back, because I find when
 you ask these people very set questions.
- 27 Cllr LAWLESS: I am only relaying the information I have. Obviously if there is legalities
- around it we don't want anybody getting in trouble, but Steve what was the amendment...
- CATHAOIRLEACH: Just a second we are going around here again. Cllr Blake is looking to
 come in for a while.
- 31 Cllr BLAKE: When we had a presentation from a girl here a while, a year or so ago...
- 32 MS GALLAGHER: No, that was lobbying Cllr BLAKE: Sorry, somebody gave us one, some
- 33 girl gave us -- somebody gave us a presentation back about a year ago, we got a presentation, it
- 34 was a very serious issue at the time, and maybe the system we have in place at the moment isn't

1 the best system, now I asked a number of occasions in the past that the form would be included 2 in the pack that's going out to an applicant for an application. I thought it was still part it have. I 3 thought it did go out with the pack. Equally so when somebody is applying to go on the housing list it should be included in the pack as well. That's what Christine is saying, in some form or 4 5 another, whether coming in by e-mail or in the pack itself, we need to actually do that. But to 6 abandon the whole thing I think is probably a retrograde step, maybe illegal as well, I don't know 7 if we can do it legally or not in this case. So I think we need to tease it out in the long-term. Not 8 do something that's illegal, but do something that's beneficial to the applicant and beneficial to 9 the officials in here as well, that we have -- and beneficial to the public reps that we have 10 something in place that can satisfy all of us.

11 Cllr MATTHEWS: I was going to suggest along the lines of that, that we'll amend to say when 12 we have a more suitable system, adopt it, and do that within an acceptable time period, so 13 maintain the system until we do find something that's easier for councillors and applicants, but 14 we have to put some sort of timeframe to address it.

- 15 MS GALLAGHER: Are you proposing that as an amendment?
- Cllr MATTHEWS: I like the spirit of it, I just don't want to leave a gap here for data protection.
 CATHAOIRLEACH: Can I let Cllr Shay Cullen in, he is there for a while.

Cllr Shay CULLEN: The sense I'm getting from the members is that there's merits to the form, but it's the unnecessary hassle that it causes public representatives having to go around the county getting these forms signed. So I think if we come up with some sort of a system that maybe Cllr Fox was suggesting that it's included in the pack from the point of view of planning or housing reps that we come at it a slightly different way, it's the unnecessary hassle that it's putting on members, I get that's the sense that's the issue here.

- Cllr SNELL: Cathaoirleach, we have members in the chambers who represent us on LAMA and can I suggest we get, maybe get them to touch base with senior management, because the legal opinion received from them indicates strongly that elected members are entitled to information irrespective of data protection, that's legal opinion. So we want to know where do we get the legal opinion, who from, but they are people who represent each and every one of the 32 here.
- 29 Just in regards to if there was an issue, this is not a requirement for the Data Protection
- 30 Commissioner, it's a requirement by Wicklow County Council, Steve.
- 31 Cllr MATTHEWS: Does that protect officials though?
- 32 Cllr SNELL: The third section of the data controllers, third paragraph states "However there
- 33 will be cases where it would be appropriate for the organisation to check with the public
- 34 representative or the individual whose personal data is being released, that such release is not

1 going to give rise to later complaints about breach of the Data Protection Act." Now I am not for 2 one second insinuating that every single representation made that the staff have to ring up and 3 check, but maybe if a public representative is asking for something which would be disclosing information, I imagine 99% is just submitting information, in that case the data controller has the 4 5 option to ring the individual and also check with the public representative are they sure that they have consent of the individual? I think it's quite clear there, paragraph 3 of data controllers. 6 7 Cllr WALSH: As there appears to be some uncertainty about the legalities of the proposal of 8 what we have just heard, can I suggest the matter be referred to Protocol Committee at next 9 month's meeting in order to come up with a solution or compromise and we all agree the system 10 is not workable, so we can refer to protocol to come up with a solution to be brought forward to 11 the following month's meeting.

12 CATHAOIRLEACH: Thanks. Cllr Ruttle.

13 Cllr RUTTLE: We have to bring it to some sort of conclusion, what Cllr Walsh said would have 14 a lot to recommend it, speedily, but I still think that the proposal that I made earlier on, close to

- 15 what Cllr Fox said when it comes in and the applicant sends a letter that they authorise such a
- 16 body to operate on a file, it's simpler for us, it comes in in the application, it's in the pack.
- There's an architect on it, it's verifiable. It's straightforward. We are not running around thecountry or scanning letters or anything like that.

19 Cllr FORTUNE: Clarification on that, are you saying that that file entitles any public rep?

- 20 Cllr RUTTLE: No the one nominated by the person.
- 21 Cllr LAWLESS: That only lasts five years.
- CATHAOIRLEACH: Look, we're going around in circles here. Cllr Lawless proposed, you are going ahead with the proposal?
- 24 Cllr LAWLESS: Yeah, I would like a vote on the proposal here today as I put it forward, I am

25 very happy then for any further discussions to go to protocol.

- MS GALLAGHER: That's seconded by Cllr Fortune and then Cllr Matthews amended when we have a more suitable and verifiable system adopted. Is that all right?
- 28 CATHAOIRLEACH: Cllr Matthews?
- 29 Cllr MATTHEWS: Yeah, more or less.
- 30 Cllr WINTERS: I'll second that.
- 31 CATHAOIRLEACH: All right.
- 32 Cllr BLAKE: So going to protocol meeting next Monday as well.
- 33 Cllr CULLEN: What is Cllr Matthews' proposal there?
- 34 Cllr MATTHEWS: If we proceed with this the way it's worded we are actually voting to cease

1	the requirement for the form, therefore leaving a gap in the system.
2	Cllr LAWLESS: We're not.
3	Cllr MATTHEWS: It might be we are, and I don't have any advice, I appreciate you have legal
4	advice, but I want everybody to be covered legally here. So I am just saying we would cease the
5	requirement of the data protection forms when a more suitable and verifiable system was
6	adopted, so we still remain with the forms until
7	Cllr Shay CULLEN: Is there a timeframe?
8	Cllr MATTHEWS: I think to be fair to the proposer we should put some sort of timeframe
9	MS GALLAGHER: That's
10	Cllr MATTHEWS: Would you let it go to protocol and then?
11	Cllr SNELL: If it was put to the members and voted on, the proposal that was passed, it can still
12	go to protocol next Monday as suggested by Cllr Walsh, I do believe officials will come back
13	with their homework done and legal advice if we're proven to be wrong, quicker than if we don't,
14	this could go on for six months.
15	Cllr FOX: I think Cllr Matthews and Cllr Walsh's proposals are pretty much one and the same, I
16	think they are compatible, Cllr Matthews and Cllr Walsh's proposals are compatible.
17	Cllr MATTHEWS: I'll agree to my amendment being incorporated with Cllr Walsh's.
18	CATHAOIRLEACH: You are seconding his proposal are you? Sorry Cllr Winters. We'll go
19	ahead with that again.
20	MS GALLAGHER: Okay we're voting on the proposal as circulated with the amendment first,
21	when we have a more suitable and verifiable
22	Cllr LAWLESS: Can my proposal not be taken first?
23	MS GALLAGHER: The amendment first. So that's what we're voting on.
24	
25	(Vote taken)
26	
27	MS GALLAGHER: That's 14 for, four against 11 not present and three abstaining.
28	CATHAOIRLEACH: Motion passed. Could I just say the next meeting is next Monday, the
29	Ordinary Meeting.
30	MS GALLAGHER: Yes, that's the first Monday.
31	CATHAOIRLEACH: It's proposed to hold the meeting on the 7th starting at 11am sorry
32	meeting on the 7th of November will be discussions on County Development Plan and starting at
33	11 o'clock. That's next Monday and then the 7th of November, is that all right?
34	

1 <u>Meeting concluded at 5pm</u>

2
10:5.14.18

abandon 68:6 ability 56:25 able 2:20 9:18 21:33 22:9 27:23 37:17.34 44:16 48:20 49:14 61:22 ably 43:19 abnormal 30:27 abolish 5:22 9:13 19:3 23:2 abolished 9:1 16:27.29.33 abolishment 16:25 about 1:18,33 3:10,19 6:23 7:18,20,31 10:19,20 11:5 12:29 13:13 14:3,25 15:7,31 16:31 17:4.13 18:16.18.28 19:26 21:1 22:7.34 23:31 25:1,5,33,34 26:1 27:15 30:26 36:30.32.33 39:19 40:25 42:33 43:6,16 44:34 45:2,8 51:26 52:22,33 53:13,23 54.2.27 55.16 58.17 above 7:27 21:33 43:20 50:2 absolute 9:17 41:24 42:19 63:19 64:3 abstain 29:2 abstaining 29:8,15 70:27 accelerate 30:2,4 39:26 accept 18:32 23:17 56:9 57:7 63:13 66:2 67:15 acceptable 67:9 68:12 acceptance 33:27 access 2:20 55:2 61:4,28 66:26.33 67:5 accessed 56:18 accessibility 1:2 48:3 accommodation 27:24,25,26 33:3,17,30 34:8,11,13,17,25 60:4 accordance 1:13 according 5:25 13:20 accordingly 9:9 account 16:22 accountable 55:33 accounts 25:11 accurate 1:5 achieved 30:9,22,23 acknowledge 36:11 48:13 55:3 acquiring 30:7 35:22 45:33 acquisitions 25:17 35:22 45:22 across 7:20,24 14:23 15:16 20:15 30:5 44:5 48:26 65:11 acting 1:17 23:15 56:7 action 50:24.27 actual 18:19 33:2 40:13 41:33 52:4 55:3,16 56:15 57:20 59:3 64:1 actually 2:13,32 4:4 5:33 6:22 7:14,18,24,32 8:8.11.12.13.15 9:1.7 10:29 12:24 14:4.12 15:27 19:12 22:13 24:21,32 26:7,34 30:22 33:9 36:17 38:14 39:24 41:7 42:30 43:11.15 47:24.27 54:30.31.32 55:29 56:33 61:5 63:2,25,33 64:1 65:28 66:15,28 67:24 68:5 69:3 acute 1:33 2:1,27 26:5 add 25:9 44:18 54:9 56.11.22 adding 63:9

Α

addition 27.26 additional 13:21 17:7 21:2,4,11,14 22:26 26:8,12,23 27:12 additions 25:14 address 5:16 10:4 28:22 30:16 44:2,30 45:16 46:1 56:30 64:8 68:14 addressing 30:2 33:3 adequate 36:27 43:30 adjoining 57:33 adjourn 29:17 adjournment 29:23 adjusted 63:28 adjustment 1:13,29 29.11adjustments 15:28 administration 40:19 administrative 16:11 admiration 53:30 adopt 1:27 67:16 68:12 adopted 67:9 69:27 70:6 advance 32:12 66:15 advanced 30:15 32:29 advantage 17:3 advertise 52:10 53:7 advertising 35:15 advice 34:7 55:25 58:28 62:18 63:8 66:11,24 67:21 70:3,4,13 advise 58:24 advised 56:28 60:2 affairs 36:34 affect 3:6 6:1 14:10,12,30 17:16 20:17 affected 2:11 15:32 affecting 16:19 afford 15:5 22:13 affordable 27:9 37:29,30,32,34 42:16 49:34 after 4:23,32 10:20,21 21:2,3,24 23:23 53:18 54.21 57.32 64.7 afternoon 30:8 60:2 again 3:4,9 5:4 12:12 15:26 18:31 22:29 26:18 27:24 30:24 32:5,28 33:31 34:20 36:24 37:7,12 39:27 40:32 42:22 48:1,28 49.19 23 50.10 51.25 32 52.28 56.13 57:21.34 59:20 62:23 65:24 67:17,29 70:19 against 17:32 29:8,15 33:31 59:21 60:7,22 70:27 age 25:9 agenda 29:25 34:2 54:25 65:21 agent 66:20 agents 53:16 ago 3:1 13:16 24:20,23 29:28 37:30 39:6 62:23 67:31,33 agree 5:13 8:6 11:17 12:14 15:14 16:33 20:16 28:8 42:27.32 43:8,18 44:12,25 45:16 60:7 63:13 65:16 69:9 70:17 agreed 34:32 35:12 49:11,15,22 agreeing 14:29 agreement 2:5,26 21:10 22:21 24:20 25:34 26:1,2,3 27:11 64:9 agriculture 5:3 ahead 1:9 27:18 28:14 29:25 38:20 46:7 66:22 69:23 70:19 albeit 39:33 alert 5:20 56:32 all 1:18 2:28 4:7.19.22.24 5:5 6:14,15 9:7,21

11:13.14.34 12:2.5 13:20 14:15.34 16:2,5,8 17:2 19:9,10,21 20:7 22:4,7 23:3,4,5 24:6 25:19,22,23,29 26:27.29 27:13.28 28:14 29:21 30:8.20 31:26 32:14.18.24.29 33:34 34:3.6.14 35:7,12,13,28 36:12,34 alleviate 41:33 allocate 9:8 allocated 47:31 allocation 1:23 3:32 40:21 41:31,32 48:27 62:21.28 allocations 40:13 45:24 allow 41:26 43:11,12,13 60:25 allowance 27:8 40:7 47:2 allowed 13:21.24.31 20:24 37:31.32 allowing 27:16 54:25 allows 66:30 alluded 1:33 39:34 57:10 almost 21:5 43:33 alone 3:1 56:12 along 10:10 16:30 17:34 31:14 35:11 58:29 62:3.27 66:24 68:11 already 2:10 8:33 10:17 13:17 16:30 21:8,31 22:5 24:12 30:28 32:8 39:1 43:18 44:3,19 46:16 47:7 48.12also 1:28 5:12.14 6:7 10:1 11:11 15:7,8,10,14 16:13,18 18:15 20:22,33 21:20 22:3,20 23:19,22 27:21,24 29:29,32 30:5,7,29 34:30,32 35:22.23 36:22 37:22 38:8,17,19,24,33 41:16 43:18 44:5.25 45:15,17 47:32 49:9,11,12,27 50:16,20 55:26,31 56:22 57:18 58:18 59 although 9:3 37:15 altogether 6:29 37:6 always 12:27 13:34 14:25 17:6 34:15 48.2 66.25 amazed 23:6 amazing 14:2 ambassador 23:24 amend 67:8 68:11 amended 1:13 69:26 amendment 67:15.28 68:15 70:17,20,23 amendments 28:32 amenity 5:3 amount 4:12 6:12,14 7:24 8:15 13:15 15:29.30 16:4 17:4 25:26 28:5 38:34 39:22,33 40:27,31 47:5 48:15 analyse 26:29 analysis 4:26,32 5:33 15:11,12 32:1 and 1:2,3,4,5,12,15,25,27, 28.29 2:1,5,10,11,15,27,33 3:16,21,22,23,29 4:5,7,13,17,19,22,23, 29,33 5:2.3.4.5.8.9.12.13.15 ,16,19,22,23,26,27,28 .32 6:12,17,18,19,21,22,2 3.26.27.30

7:23.26.29.31 8:3.10.19.21.26.28 9:3.10.11.18.19.20.27 10:1.3.4.6.11.14.16.2 8.3 anecdotal 3:22 26:17 announced 30:19 54:3 announcement 45:13 48.29 54.2 4 announcements 44:21 annovs 58:5 annual 1:27 25:11,12,13,14 annum 5:32 6:3 39:3,4 another 13:27 15:28 18:2 22.24 23.26 25.34 28:1 31:3 33:29 34:29 36:3 40:32 41:27 42:22,23 43:32 45:21 47:22 48:21 50:4 52:1 53:9 55:31 57:29,33 58:6 64:6 68.5 answer 7:34 25:34 48:33.34 51:9 answered 23:13 answers 27:30 anxious 66:7 any 4:13,19 6:9 9:4 10:3,9,13,16,27 11:24.27 12:2 15:4 17:32 22:28 23:28.30 24:13 25:7 28:4 34:15 37:2.20.29 38:13 39:14 40:1,9,26 41:3,14 44:27 45:1 46:16 48:20 52:5 54:8.34 55:1.2.29 60.18 19 31 61.8 9 62.13 63.4 65.11 66:25,26 69:19,25 70:3 anybody's 59:3 anybody 40:33 42:5,9 45:1 50:21,22 55:2 58:22 67:28 anymore 2:19 anyone 14:20,30 18:10 36:30 46:26 52:13,18,30 59:32 62:14 64:10,29 66:10,16,26 anything 9:22 10:13 23.25 28.19 40.9 42:14 44:17 66:6 69:18 anyway 21:19 23:14 42:31 54:5 58:4 61:26 63:31 anywhere 12:18 35:31 40.26apart 23:25 appeal 44:2,3 appears 69:7 applicant 33:2 40:16,17 56:15 57:15,20,32 58:6,10 66:15,23,31 68:2,8 69:15 applicants 52:23 57:8 66:33.34 67:4 68:13 application 53:23 56:23 57:31.33 62:16 63:26,27,30 64:1 66:11,13 68:2 69:16 applications 41:7 45:30 46:25 57:14 58:4 applied 51:16 59:32 applies 63:32 apply 1:14 40:31 60:15 63:27 64:1 applying 59:31 68:3 appointment 61:23 appreciate 48:13 55:30 58:34 64:17 65:22 70:3 approach 15:23 60:22 65:26 67:9

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

appropriate 37:15 55:1 56:2 68:33 approval 30:9,10,17,23,24,29,3 0,33 31:11,19,26,27 32:7,15,19,28,31,34 49:24 51:13.15.17.18.22.31 52:8 approvals 30:26 49:21 51:28 52:10 approve 31:33 approved 30:7 34:10,24,33 35:17,21 45:16 49:6,28,30 54:7 approximately 25:29 architect 69:17 architects 46:9 arduous 57:26 are 1:2,3 2:1,19,20,28,32 3:4,9,10,11,33 4:29 5:16,27,29 6:19,20,22,30,31,34 7:1.24.27.30 8:13,15,16,34 9:7.12.19.29.34 10:11,15,16,18,19,20 11:6,20,21,23,29,30,3 1 12:18,28,32 13:12,13,14,22,28,30, 31 14:6,17,21,27,31,32 15:22.32 16:10.18.29.31 17:17,20,21 area 3:27 7:28 14:23 16:21,23 17:15 18:16,20 22:27 25:21 35:31 36:22 40:34 43.22 44.17 46.1 48:22,23 51:5,21 53:32 56:8,12 57:18,22 61:14,15 62:30 areas 7:27 16:18,22 17:16 18:25 20:17 22.10 25.22 28.28 35:7 38:5.6 54:18 58:21 60:29 64:21 aren't 32:6 63:16 66:22 arguing 12:32 24:25,28 argument 13:22 17:9 24:33 60:19 arising 25:10 around 5:20 7:23 8:13 10:34 16:27 21:34 22:9,10 34:11 40:4 48:14 57:22 58:6 59:11 60:8 61:10 62:1 63:1 64:18 66:22.25 67:28.29 68:19 69:17.22 arrears 3:21 ascertain 60:28 ask 8:20 9:11 10:29 12:6,7 14:1 22:20 25:11,12 29:18,26 31:27 35:27 40:4 44:13 47:30 48:11 57:9 66:19 67:7,21,26 asked 1:17 4:22 13:7 15:23 17:17 20:3.10 22:18,26 27:15 28:21 32:5 36:31 38:34 42:12 44:14,31 48:12 55:21 58:8.9 59:3.28.30 66:14 68:1 asking 9:4 12:9 21:13 22:30 23:32 32:6 35:17 40:19 57:22 61:2 65:19,23 69:3 asks 63:10 aspect 21:20 52:5 assess 33:33 assessing 46:24 assessment 33:7,8 46:25 52:22 assets 25:16,22

associated 25:10 51:14 assume 6:34 28:28 55:11.34 58:25.26 65:32 assuming 35:7 assumption 61:30,31 atrocious 40:4 attached 25:29 36:12 attain 31:22 attention 34:3 35:8 48:22 54:20 attitude 14:31 augmented 49:20 authorise 57:31 69:15 authorities 2:14,28 3:11 11.22 13.6 19:14,15,18 20:8 25:26 31:15 36:13,33 37:1 43:9 53:10 60:28,33,34 65:28 authority's 4:17 authority 2:6,9 3:6 4:16,18 5:11,23 11:32 18:28 19:10.31 21:2,28 25:23,24 34:34 35:10.17.21.33 36:2,10,16,20 41:32 42:28 43:9 47:6 49:22,30 55:24 56:34 57:30,33 61:15 62:8.12.24 63:5 automatically 3:33 51:4 avail 41:14 available 1:23.24 27:21,27 34:32 35:32 36:2.4 39:21 40:20 42:9 43:4 49:12 availed 26:13 availing 33:20 53:34 avails 66:23 average 2:27 awaiting 32:5 51:28 aware 23:10 30:14 32:13 33:6 away 7:14 8:16 20:2 22:32 42:4.24 63:19 awful 14:5 15:18 41:26 awkward 41:6 Absolutely 8:8 9:3,19 13:13 17:27 24:31 26:5 34:8 42:17 55:19 Act 1:13 34:31 55:23 62:8 69:1 Agency 49:28 Anneslev 59:16,17,20,21,22 60:11,19 Approving 45:19 April 49:19,23 51:30,31 56:33 Ard 20:10 21:19 31:3 Arklow 8:30 30:22,23 31:1 34:12 35:29 40:25,26,30,34 41:1 42:16 46:2 49:21 54:5 ARBITRATOR 22:29 Assistance 11:7 33:3,4,24 34:20,23 37:33 54:7 Audit 5:15 Auditor 5:12 Aughrim 31:3 35:30 49:18 August 5:20 34:5 46:22 49:21.24 51:31 Australia 37:3 Avoca 39:16.18 Avondale 30:14,16 32:3,19 B back 2:32 5:6,20 6:2,28 7:9 8:3,27,30 9:8,9,24 10:16,24 11:24 12:1.12 13:1 15:29 16:6 17:2 21:9.12

22:17,32 23:12,16

24:14 26:9.13 28:5.13 29:17.18.20 32:5.30 33:11 34:28 35:6 36:32 37:1,3,4 39:2,34 43:3 46:26,27,30 47:19 48:32 49:21,22,24,30 50.11 13 34 background 30:20 52:15 backs 19:16 bad 37:3.6 41:28 badly 16:19 balance 21:5,7 balanced 5:6 balances 5:13 ballot 18.5 band 5:29 50:2 bands 5:26 bank 37:1,32 59:32,34 barely 21:32 barrier 65:5 base 10:28 46:23 68:25 based 2:20 17:9.11 19:11 21:10 29:27 30:21 41:31 46:19 55:25 baseline 4:3 basic 1:12 3:27 4:13 5:22 6:30 13:24 basically 4:6 15:8 30:11 31:27 33:28 51:19 58:32 65:5 67:19 basics 62:18 basis 2:23 21:4 34:28 47:6,26 49:29 57:34 66:29 bear 10:3 20:7,12,19 beating 11:22 beautiful 39:18 because 2:21 3:1.19 7:23 8:6,7,16,26 9:23 10:6.28.30 11:5,12,16,18,20,33 12:5 13:12,23 14:13 16:15 18:32 19:29 21:34 22:10,15,22 23:4.14 24:25.26 28:31 30:15.27 31:32 32:8,23,29,31 33:20 35:18 37:16.30 38:12,13,15 39:29 40:27 41:13,23,31,32 42:17 43:16 44 become 39:6 67:4 becomes 52:7 56:34 58:5 becoming 34:7 49:12 57:26 bed 51:32 52:29,30 bedroom 52:29 been 1:17 2:12 4:25 8:33 13:24 14:16,19 16:5.11.22 17:1.5.33.34 20:16 21:6,12,13,20,21 22:26 23:17 29:3 33:20,31 35:14,33 36:32 37:13 38:14,34 40:3,28 42:26,33,34 44:6,7,13,18,26 45:14.28 46:24 47:32 48:12,18,19 49:12 50:9 52:13.18 53:33 54:14 56:17.18 58 **before** 3:28 5:6 7:30 14:20 16:12 31:29 32:1 36:32 38:4,8 40:18.29.32 44:31 52:4.5 57:3 58:13 59:16,24 60:31 63:17 66:10 67:3.10 beforehand 41:17 began 13:3 beginning 35:23 behalf 2:28 22:20 24:21 54:29 55:8,11 56:20 58.24 behind 31:21 47:30 being 3:4,9 8:1 10:3 11:26 13:8,21 15:11

17.17 22.11 23 23.20 24:5.19 26:30 27:23 29:33 32:24 37:5 38:11 39:6,13,14,15,29 40:30 41:19 44:7,9,15 47:10 51:14 53:34 54:10,13 56:1,4 58:8 62:9.10.30 65:19 68:34 70:17 **belief** 19:27 believe 9:1,18 10:13 11:34 12:30 15:20 19:32 20:15,23 23:20 43:34 46:15 47:12,18 49:27 59:2 60:1.6.22 62:13,14,15 63:5,9 70:12 beneficial 68:8,9 beneficiary 26:33 benefit 16:3 45:29 benefited 10:29,30 benefiting 19:16 20:22 benefits 11:2,8 27:6,7 41:7 berating 36:18,19 beside 11:23 best 9:13 12:29 45:6 47:19 56:22,25 68:1 better 7:30 8:17 35:2 38:15 41:6 50:15,17 54:19 57:3 58:7 59:1 between 2:27 4:32 20:33 21:6 24:27 25:7 26:28 33:26 39:23 40:15 48:26 57:1 66:2,31,34 big 8:13 19:28 32:33 34:2 37:12 57:26 bigger 40:8 62:22 67:1 biggest 7:17 8:14 31:11 35:30 bill 8:3 24:28 billing 2:5,33,34 3:1 8:1 24:23,24 billion 44:33 bills 24:21.26 31:23 bin 22:3 bins 17:26 22:9 bit 11:25 15:7,32 22:7 27:24 45:4 51:34 57:16 67:2 bite 61:31 blaming 42:9 44:23,24 block 43:10 board 14:23 64:34 bodies 34:10,25,33 35:13,17,22 45:19 49:28,30 54:7 body 30:7 33:11 45:16 49:6 60:19 69:16 boldly 67:18 books 17:26 both 5:12 6:23 8:31 12:17 31:33 35:6 36:25 37:24 41:22 42:29 48:24 bottom 35:22 66:22 bought 53:34 box 18:1 boys 10:28 11:25 breach 57:2 69:1 break 13:31 breakdown 15:9 48:5 breathing 67:10 brick 40:26 briefly 11:8 23:6,16 bring 10:3 23:14 27:33 32:19 47:19 50:34 60:3 61:18 66:17 69:13 bringing 35:5 41:22 60:14 62:12 brings 22:27 broadband 25:15 broader 23:17 41:21 broken 5:26

brought 3:20 7:27 28:5 31:10 35:31.33 39:8 47:4 50:1 54:20 60:17 62:28 69:10 brown 41:4 49:10 budget 1:21,27,30 2:7,21 3:13,20 4:33 5:1,6 6:23 7:10 8:2.6.29 10:6 12:28 14:12 16:12 18:11.17.32 19:27 20:34 21:5.8 26:8,12,25 28:24 35:7 40:2,9 50:19,20 budgetary 1:22 4:23 9:32 budgeted 16:18 budgets 14:21 65:20 build 30:3.27 34:29 37:34 38:20 40:31,33 41:6 43:11 44:22 49:8,9 53:15 builder 36:23 building 12:6 30:5 31:1 38:19 41:33 43:5.10 45:3.30 47:24 49:8 buildings 25:17 45:32 built 30:2 38:15 40:29 43:7,9,11 44:22,25 46:12 49:16 54:10 bulk 42:30 bully 15:16 bullying 15:14 burden 13:3,5,9,14,15 20:3 22:5,12 62:1 burdened 21:31 bureaucracy 55:31 58:19 busiest 43:28 business 15:23 53:28 66.12 businesses 8:20,22 21:33 22:15 busy 46:24 but 3:1,23 4:20 6:9 7:28 8:1,14,34 9:6,13,18,22 10:6,13,15 11:21,23 12:5,12,15,29,34 13:2,3,5 14:2,4,10 15:1.19.24.27.34 16:20 17:13 18:9,17,23,26,29 19:2,13 20:6 21:11,22,27 23:8,26 24:11.13.28.32 25:19 26:6,11,16,17,26,27,3 4 28:5.25.27 30:7,10,23,28 31: buy 37:5,33 buyer 37:5,6 Ballinahinch 49:6 Ballybeg 35:19 Baltinglass 36:22 52:28 Behan 12:32 15:14 17:1 28:15.17.19 42:26 43:28 44:29 59:15,16,17,18 60:11 61:27 62:29 64:25,34 Bends 30:15 BER 35.34 Biros 64:32 Blessington 23:32 24:3 36:27 37:9 41:18 45:21 46:14 Blogs 63:3 65:6 BLAKE 20:25 22:19 35:27,28 36:25 41:17 44:23 67:29.31.32 69:32 BOURKE 10:5.9 11:10,24 26:32 38:27 Bray 3:17 30:29 31:1,2 32:8 34:12 35:29 40:13 42:15 43:6 46:2 48:22.23.26 49:5 51:5,6,8 59:22,24 Brewery 30:15 49:4

Brid 35.10 37.10 38.3 33 39.26 30 44.12 45.10 48:33 49:19.27 51:11 Britain 17:23,25 cable 25:17 cajoling 4:23 calculated 1:24 calculator 4:24 call 10:5 43:20 46:25 59:22 62:12 called 15:28 17:20 22:6 30:16 34:23 49:22 calls 62:33 calming 12:6 came 17:6 18:15 24:19 39:17 47:26 48:21,22 49:14,18 56:33 58:9 59.30 can't 3:2 7:6 8:12 9:13 11:12,33 15:1 18:11 22:1,9 24:3 30:27 31:10 32:7,19 34:25 40:26 41:24,26 42:31 43:7,27 44:17 47:34 49:8.32 50:21.22 52.10 54.6 57.19 27 63:12 64:1 65:6 cannot 9:18 12:1 15:5 43:8 44:7 52:10 capital 4:11 5:12 28:7 33:4 34:19,23 50:20 capitation 17:11 capped 37:23 care 1:4 carefully 10:19 44:9 61:2 carry 16:31 case 5:17 15:11 20:23 35:4 36:22 37:25 39:12 41:18 44:6 47:21 53:27 60:23 61:7 66:21 68:7 69:4 cases 14:5 27:26 36:4 40:3,22 41:24 49:28 56:2 62:11 64:19 68:33 cash 11:20 cast 43:3 catch 10:14 58:4 category 53:2 caters 34:24 caught 37:5 cause 38:21 56:19 causes 44:17 68:19 caution 30:25 45:13 46:5 cease 67:8,15 70:34,4 ceased 13:3 ceiling 51:20 cent 5:32 6:27 central 5:4 6:14 7:6 8:7,26,27 9:8 10:16,26 12:7 13:5 15:22 19:27 21:11,26 22:8.21 25:33 26:4 45:5 47:10 centrality 42:19 centrally 6:23 13:4 centre 54:4 centres 3:15 7:25 certain 18:17 37:30 42:23 62:10 certainly 12:10 13:13 14:33.34 20:28 21:12,22 22:27 23:33 27:31 35:29 36:8 37:13 39:24 41:17 43:34 53:28 54:17 57:6,14,25 58:3,5 61:13,19 62:1 63:23 65:17.27 certainty 31:22 32:31 chain 66:20 chair 38:10 39:7 47:17 55:21 chairing 41:16 challenge 50:16 challenged 31:13

| challenges 50:9 Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

challenging 27:26 35:6.14.26 42:7 chamber 11:14 15:15 18:2 19:2 24:13 62:13,27 64:12 65:9 chambers 20:9 62:25 68:24 chance 13:15 15:10 change 15:6 34:30 39:20 41:5 45:2 50:24 65:9 changed 2:23 3:22 16:13 52:33 charade 27:33 charge 18:8 21:32 charged 8:1 15:5 63:25 charges 22:3,4 23:32 chart 30:9 31:10,13,15 36:6 51:13.34 chase 53:4 chasing 10:22 33:9 **cheap** 47:26 check 40:16 56:3 68:33 69.35 checked 15:17 cheek 9:9 chickens 17:29 chief 24:31 43:25 47:7 child 45:1 children 6:21 42:17 44:34 choice 18:29 chosen 12:17 55:33 circles 69:22 circulate 55:18 circulated 38:9 55:32 70:20 circumstances 37:24 40:22 45:6 48:14 citizens 12:18 18:27 19:13.15.22 20:2 22:5 citizenship 21:31 civic 7:29 28:6 claim 40:33 clarify 8:31 22:25,28 53:14 classes 56:11 clear 23:30 24:12 34:32 49:19,34 58:22 63:30 69:6 clearly 9:17 61:24 clients 34:14 56:22,25 cliff 3:17 16:3 climate 63:25 64:14 close 11:18 52:17 69:14 closed 21:34 closing 21:33 33:11 coast 35:29,30 coffers 19:24 cognisant 50:27 cohesive 48:26 coincide 41:2 colleague 54:5 colleagues 6:19 7:9 11:23 19:1 63:6 collect 7:6 21:25 collected 17:26,28 22:9 collecting 23:27 44:33 collection 2:5 3:23 20:5,7 26.16come 5:6,8,20 8:27 9:9 12:12 13:27 14:9,11 18:1 22:17 23:3,10 24:17 27:32 28:11 29:17,20,33 30:5 35:23 38:7 40:17 42:10 43:32 44:5 45:34 47:26 48:28.32 50:14 51:34 52:30 53:18,27 54:23 55:20 56:33 58:34 59:5,14,25 61:31 63:11 64:8 65:16,24,26,28,31 66:7.1 comes 13:7.29 19:27 37:16 44:9 50:5 59:27 63:7,20 69:15,16

coming 2:32 10:10 11:30 15:17 17:34 19:20 20:34 24:25.29 26:9 29:33 31:17 37:20 39:7 40:9 46:34 47:23 49:10 50:12,13,15 52:9 57:25 58:33 62:18 65:20 66:24 68:5 commence 39:18 commend 38:33 48:16 comments 36:15 43:18 54:22 64:5 commercial 1:28 2:4,17,19 6:13 10:1 20:12 60:18 commitment 40:34 commitments 11:31 18:3 21:22 committed 39:30 communities 9:25 22:15 42:18,20 43:7 community 3:14,29 7:25 8:28 12:23 16:4 17:9 27:8 34:27 38:29 compare 10:1 comparison 63:6 comparisons 25:7 compatible 70:16 compensated 2:33 3:4 compensates 2:13 compensation 2:4,9 57:2 compiled 52:1 complaining 31:15 complaints 56:4 69:1 completed 36:12 completely 8:6 43:13 completion 40:26 41:34 47.34complicated 25:23 compliment 41:10 60:14 complying 67:11 comprehensive 55:26 compromise 69:9 concentrate 29:28,29 30.4 33.2 concentrated 29:28 49:8 concentrating 29:30 concern 16:18 concerned 21:18 26:12 39:7 43:20,30 61:30 64:25 67:12 concerning 15:24 concerns 62:31 concluded 71:1 conclusion 69:13 concur 19:1 45:10 47:14 condition 35:6 40:3 conditions 32:31 43:23 55:9 confidential 56:8 61:6,9 confirmation 11:3 confirming 61:32 confuses 7:34 8:3 confusion 56:19 congratulate 43:24 congregated 34:26 conjunction 35:21 consent 55:12 56:7 57:20 58:25 61:29 65:33 69:6 consented 56:15 consider 1:12 6:14 49:6 considerable 16:3 consideration 14:34 38:14 considered 30:27 61:8 62:30 considering 1:22 41:13 consistent 17:34 29:3 40:21 60:34 64:28 consistently 13:16 30:29 conspiracy 60:22 constituency 57:27 constituent 55:11,12 58:25 65:33 constituents 12:29 55:8

57:21 58:22 62:11

constraints 51.33 construct 37:17.32 construction 31:23 37:11.15 39:18.23 45.12.27 consultants 32:24,26,28 38:14 consultation 4:19 5:19 consuming 45:14 contact 44:2 46:28 50:14 52:23 64:34 66:31 contacted 4:22 54:29 56:17 64:23 65:6,28 contacting 59:23 contacts 65:6 context 2:7 3:9 29:32 53.3 continually 43:2 continue 12:9 16:21 20.28continues 29:6 contractor 18:22 contractors 25:8 31:26 52.2 contradicting 62:24 contribute 27:28 contributed 27:29 contributing 27:25 contribution 15:16 17:9 22:23 control 27.24 31.18 controller 62:8 63:4 69:4 controllers 55:9.32 58:23 63:2 68:32 69:6 controversial 57:18 convert 31:1 convictions 62:26 convinces 6:11 **cope** 44:16 сору 38:9 48:13 49:20 55:17 corner 39:21 45:34 corners 57:11 correct 23:11 correctly 19:32 correspondence 29:18 59.4cost 2:27 6:27 18:21 21:10,15 24:24,25 25:8 26:8 30:27,28 31:22,29 32:4,25,32 51:19,20,22,26 costing 3:1 6:27 costly 41:6 costs 1:25 2:26 3:2 5:4 23:4.25 24:21 25:10 30:29 32:27 51:27 59:13 couldn't 22:13 46:14 60:1,6 councillor 10:25 12:13 18:6 20:13 22:29 24:4,16 39:14 55:1 64:11 councillors 11:29 12:12,16 13:7,12,27,29 16:7 23:16 36:9,25 53:22 54.27 55.15 29 56:19.32 58:18.22.29 59:11.23.25 61:21 62:32 64:14 66:14,25 68:13 counsellors 7:14 counter 27:22 33:11 counties 15:27,31 16:16 20.2.2264:23,24,26,34 66:28.32 country 8:14 9:21 10:17,22 11:21 13:2,7 16:29 17:20,22 19:16 21:31 22:5 23:21 39:11 41:21 42:30 43:3,5,14,16 44:34 47:3 60:29 63:6.16 64:18 65:11 66:26 69.18

countywide 39:33 couple 12:12 29:27 38:10 43:34 44:6 50:6 course 23:22 court 36:22 66:21 67:23 covered 22:4 48:7 63:18 70:4 covers 62:6 crazy 8:8 15:6 25:25 created 63:24 creates 41:25,27 57:28 credit 52:28 crimes 62:26 crisis 6:18,24 8:6 31:7 37:13 38:30 39:5,20 criteria 34:30 critical 3:26 4:25,32 15:11.12 critically 26:28 criticism 39:27 47:26 criticizing 39:28 cuckoo 18:10 cultural 8:28 cumulative 2:26 current 4:27 49:15 currently 11:6 custodians 56:10 64:4 customer 25:31 cut 10:7 11:10,11 12:1,15 13:24,28 14:21 15:22 16:6.8.28 17:2.7 20:16,17,19 21:9,12 32:5 cuts 6:7 10:6,10 11:3 13:23,24 14:23 17:28 27:32,34 28:21 51:23 cutting 10:10 14:23 Can 4:6 5:33 6:34 7:9 8:2.10.31 9:13.17.31 10:3.26 11:13.30 12:25 13:8 14:33 15:1 18:25,26 19:3,23 21:26 22:25,28 26:15 27:18,30 28:6 29:18 31:10 32:8 33:7,8 34:33 37:26 38:24 40:16.17.29 41:33.34 42:13 43:28 44:5,26 45:5.7 46:30 48:5 49:16,18,24 50:21 52 Carlow 64:23 Castle 34:19 Cathaoirleach's 18:32 CATHAOIRLEACH 1:9 6:9 7:11.12 8:19,33 9:29,31 10:32 12:12 15:25,26 16:24 18:6,30,31 19:6 20:13,14 22:17,18 23:29,34 24:4,6,9,16 27.182828:9,11,14,16,18,20,2 4,27,29 29:4,16,20,25 35:26,27 36:21 38:27 39:15,16,31,32 42:2,26 44:11 47:14,16,28 48:10,27,28,3 CCMA 1:34 26:6 Chairman 10:33 11:13 12:32 13:33 16:25 17:33 18:8 20:25 21:29 23:30 24:10 27:30 28:4,8,17,21,25 29:2,18 36:20 37:10 38:2 41:3.8 53:29 57.6 61.27 63.23 66:30 67:7 Chapel 31:2 32:20 Christine's 60:22 Christine 55:20,21 59:14 62:22 65:1,24,25 68:4 Christmas 54:22 City 19:20 Clarification 23:9 61:29 69:19 Cllr 6:10,11 7:11,12 8:19,33 9:5,30,31,32

10:5.8.9.24.33 11:10,13,14,17,24,34 12:13.14.32 13:33 15:4,14,25,26 16:24,25 17:1,15 18:6,8,30,31,34 20:13,14,22,25,26,29 21:19.30 22:17.18.19.29.30 23:6,9,16,18,26,28,29 .30.31.33 24:34,1,2,5,8,10,18,3 0 25:19,25,2 Commission 54:30 Commissioner 56:29,30 59.8 60.31 62.7 64:8.27 68:30 Commissioners 3:29.33 Committee 1:34 5:15 47:33 55:21,23 61:14 69:8 Could 11:8 12:24,27 20:5.31 30:21 31:11 32:12 33:10 36:31 39:7.9.10 40:12.18 41:22 44:34 46:22 49:13 52:1 53:19,20 55:21 57:3,12,27 59:30 61:15,33,34 62:5,31,32 63:21 64:11.18 67:7 70:14.28 Council's 33:7 Council 1:3.7 6:2.3.6 7:18 10:6,10 12:9,23 14:19,21,28 15:31 16:12 17:2,6,13 18:23 19:13,20,21,24 20:9.15.33.34 22:31 23:3 24:26 29:26 30:21 33:17.31 34:6 38:26 39:2,13,15 40:14,16,34 42:19 43:29 44:2,4,24 45:32 46:23,27 47:16,25,33 53:1,30 54:6,18,23 55. Councils 10:24,25,31 13:3 63:16 County 1:3,7 5:26 6:2,3,6 7:21,32 8:18 10:11,16,29,30 12:18 13:5,18,21,31 16:3.14.15 17:2.3.10.16.28 18:10,12,24,27 19:13,20,21,24,28 20:3,15,18,28 21:21,23,26 22:12 24:26 25:31 27:17 29:26 30:30 33:16 34:6 37:30 39:5.15 40:14 41:13.21.34 42:8.15 43:6.21 CPG 1:33 CPO 48:19 50:30 CPOing 51:1 CPOs 50:32 **CROMIE** 1:16.17 24:18,31 25:21,28 26:5,11,15,17 27:11 **CULLEN 15:25** 16:24,25 18:6,7,8,34 23:9,26,28,29,30,31,3 3 24:1,2,5,8,10 29:2 57:5.6.25 58:3 68:17.18 69:33 70:7 D daily 47:6,26 danger 50:16 53:22,26 dangerous 65:33 dark 15:24 data 50:22 54:23,26,30,34 55:7,9,12,22,32,33 56:1.3.8.9.11.12.14.1 5,22,24,25,26,29,32 57:1.6.7.8

58:15,16,17,23,26 59:7.8.9.28 60:17.31 61:6.9.20.29 62:5.7.21 63:2,3,16,23,24,25 64:5,7,14,27 65:17 66:2,3,24 67:8,11,13 68:16.27.29.32.34 69:1.4.6 70:5 date 1:14.28 2:4 45:22 50:28 53:10 54:10 65:20 day 18:17 21:5,7 26:33 34:4 36:30 41:16 42:26 44:23,29 54:15.16 62:5 67:22 days 39:2 47:23 58:13 61:13 62:31 67:16 dead 36:31 deaf 39:20 deal 18:33 19:2 29:28 30:4 33:33 37:17 41:11 43:23 47:6 49:27 50:3 51:11 57:12 58:33 66:9 dealing 36:30 38:28 56:9 57:1,27,29 63:20 64:15 deals 57:1 dealt 8:14 34:6 47:18 debate 54:21 decide 20:2 63:19 decided 3:5 19:34 31:3 58:16 decimated 53:33 decision 3:28 4:13 7:14,20,23,32 8:11,15 12:4.5.30 13:30 44:9 58.13 60.32 decisions 7:27.30 decreased 13:5 deduction 2:15 deductions 2:10 deemed 33:20,31 37:15,23 defer 67:8 deficit 5:11.15 19:11.30 deficits 5:12.13.14 definite 11:2 60:31 definitely 3:24 8:30 60:7 64:21 degree 62:10 delay 36:7,9,13,14,16 49:23 50:5 52:6.10 delaying 36:17 **delays** 49:25 50:7 51:14,34 delighted 21:19 37:2 delist 2:18 deliver 1:30 8:17 9:33 39:30 delivered 7:25 31:7 39:23 delivering 39:3 46:19 delivery 7:28 33:15 demand 29:30 33:2 38:5 50:27 53:2,3 demanded 20:30 demanding 21:4 22:31 demands 25:29 37:8 democracy 15:17 27:16 denial 9:17 deny 12:32 denying 59:7 departments 4:22,26 7:19 9:33 11:4 12:6 26.28depend 45:15.17 depending 41:31 49:14 51:5 52:32 65:8 deposit 37:5 depreciation 25:9 deserves 45:1 design 31:28 32:5,29,33 49.7desk 64:2 66:17 desperate 41:11 59:27

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

detail 32:27 51:25.26.27 52.4 66.4 detailed 31:29 32:1.25 61:4 detailing 30:6 details 25:12 determination 1:24 determine 1:28 52:5 developed 38:30 developers 43:11 50:26 developments 43:12 45:33 54:19 dictate 43:13 did 4:23 5:20 7:10 8:25,26,30,31 10:27.31 13:16 17:33.34 23:33 28:12 33:12 35:19 36:11 48:28 51:17 68:3 didn't 13:4,16 23:28 24:26 27:30,31 28:22 30:34 39:12 52:20 60:15 66:6 difference 4:7 10:33 20:33 21:6.8 27:5.6 33:26 40:15 48:26 53:2 66:2 different 7:19 12:29 15:16 21:1 28:32 31:14 36:12 45:20 48:24 51:5.7.9.10 60:29 62:26 64:24 65:18 66:33 68:22 differential 33:16.31 48:22,25 51:4,6 difficult 8:17 38:6,21 41:10 42:8 55:29,30 57:26 63:22 67:4 difficulties 42:22 53:31 60.2963.24difficulty 27:20 37:21,26 50:12 54:28 58:20 66:18 dignity 43:24 dimension 52:4 direct 17:6 33:15 43:8.9 direction 18:32 37:12 directives 56:33 directly 44:2 directorate 39:17,26,29 directors 19:9,31 21:27 27:12 56:28 64:26 disabilities 47:32,33 48:6 disadvantaged 20:17 60:33 disagree 25:28 disappear 6:29 10:20,21 disappointed 11:13 disappointment 13:18 36:29 37:7 disclosing 69:3 discontinuing 39:9 discount 3:20 discretion 13:8 28:6 discretionary 1:23,25 3:16 4:6 12:16,21 discuss 15:15 21:3 43:15 54:23 60:31 61:24 66.11 discussed 61:16.17 discussing 2:1 28:24 62:5 discussion 43:32 60:14 61:18,25 discussions 36:15 38:25 69:25 70:32 disguise 16:32 disingenuous 10:9,14 disposal 25:17 dispute 54:34 distinct 33:9 distressed 43:23 44:10 distribute 21:27 distribution 41:30 district 1:22.24.30 3:16 8:30 12:15 21:1 30:22 36:24 39:19 52:28.29

diversity 47:6

divisions 27.12 doctor 60:4 document 65:31.33 documentation 28:25 45.28 documenting 2:1 documents 55:25 doesn't 8:12 12:10 13:11 59:25 61:28 65:11 doing 10:16 17:22 22:8 24:24 30:6 31:34 32:24 38:28,29 45:8 54:31 65:8 domestic 2:5,33,34 8:1 24:20 don't 3:6.34 5:17 6:9 7:18 8:2,7 9:1,3,18,23 10:13 11:7 12:32,34 13:11.12 14:12 15:1,16 16:25,27,33 17:23 18:10 20:19 21:24 22:27 23:11 24:8 25:19.23.28.33 26:15,26 33:27 39:27 40:27,33 42:5 43:16,34 44:24,27 46:16,26,31 47:8 48:18,21 49:22,24,33,34 50:31 done 2:33 4:26,32 5:33 7:18 12:15 15:1 18:2.3.25 27:22 37:30 38:12.13 41:31 43:25 44:3.32 45:7 48:14 49:5 51:21 52:17 58:3,18 59:34 61:33 65:1 70:13 door 18:4 24:14 44:15 49.10 51.4 63.21 doors 9:16 45:24 51:26 52:4 double 16:29 doubly 13:14 doubt 12:34 20:23 43:28 53:23 54:13 doubts 40:22 down 3:9 5:5.26.32 8:6 9:9 11:1,5 15:2 17:4 21:33,34 23:2,10 25:24 30:22 31:16 39:17,25,29 40:9,27 45:34 47:27 52:2 54:1,29 55:9 58:33 59:32 63:3.16 65:10 67.18 19 dozen 44:21 draft 1:27 4:23 5:1 9:32 26:25 drag 42:26 dragged 11:15 drastic 44:32 drawdown 39:28 drawing 39:25,29 drawings 51:26 dreadful 41:13 drive 52:19 57:28 59:23 63:1 drives 8:10 29:30 drove 8:15 drum 11:23 dry 18:5 duck 36:31 due 23:20 47:11 56:33 during 1:1 8:29 10:27,32 16:1 duty 17:20,22,23 24:12 43.20Daft 42:14 53:6 Dáil 43:8 47:18,19 Debbie's 19:9 Debbie 1:15 6:9 8:19,20 9:32 10:33 15:10,12 18:14 20:5,25 22:18 23:9.11 24:6.16.17 28.21Deborah 1:17 December 5:11 33:26 53:10

50.22 58.17 63.22

Department 2:13.28 3:4.5.10.29 4:3 5:13 8:28 11:15.25.27 13:20,24 15:29 17:28 22:31 26:6,11,29 27:7,15 29:19 30:9,10,26 31:4.11.16.17.21.34 32:4.15.18 33:1 35:12 36:7,8,9,14,17,18 37:8.14 39:17.28 40:5,14,21 41:3 43:25,29 44:13,23,24 45:14 46:8 49:2,9,20, Des 65:31 66:5 Despite 11:26 52:14 Development 3:16 5:2 8:28 22:23.25.27 26:21,23 31:2,23 45:33 50:26 65:21 70:32 DGBs 48:1 Disability 47:32 50:24 Disclaimer 1:1 Districts 7:26,29 8:28 11:5 28:6 30:20 45.23 DIRECTOR 10:29 27:19 29:27 34:29 38:33 43:19 48:33 51:11 56:28 60:30 66:6.8 67:17.18.25 Does 10:1 11:3 19:2 23:3 25:33 37:16 38:6.19 48:30 57:30 59:7 61:29 64:33 68:31 DORAN 44:20 64:32 DPG 3:14 7:17 16:4 Dublin 11.18 16.14 19:20 54:1 Dun 40:15 Dunlavin 36:28 46:11,12 E each 1:30 8:29 16:6 19:9 25:21 35:33 36:13,17 45:23 51:20 53:23 62:9,19 68:28 earlier 3:4 18:21,23 26:5 42:23 44:33 57:10 58:16 62:29 64:14 65:8 69:14 early 1:31 31:22 ears 39:20 easier 57:12,23 59:1 68:13 easiest 14:9 easily 63:12 east 35:29.30 49:15 easy 12:14 14:10 32:21 47:20 66:17 economic 3:15 22:25,27 26:22 economy 9:23 52:6 education 5:3 14:7 effect 2:11 4:18.19 5:23 6:3 8:16 10:11 17:15 61:9 effectively 13:3 14:13,20,22 43:13 57:11 61:17 effects 18:11 effort 42:22,23 52:23 58:18 efforts 29:18 53:32 54:14 eight 30:34 either 14:32 15:23 35:33 elderly 7:1 34:25 44:6,9 elected 39:2 55:30 56:17 62:20 65:26 66:5 68:26 election 14:3,5 17:32 18:1,4 20:29 elections 20:11 electricians 43:10 45:3 element 13:8 elements 11:16 eligible 33:21,33 elimination 23:8

else's 66.12 else 12:18 14:10.20 18:32 23:25 35:31 50:22 52:30 57:28 59:12 64:19 66:10,16,26 elsewhere 24:30 37:3 64:28 65:3 email 67.25 emergency 6:21 34:8 43:21 50:16 59:29 emotional 15:14.16 emphasis 34:26 emphasising 5:4 employ 43:10 employment 27:8 empt 32:12 empty 10:22,27 enabling 51:21 encountered 53:32 end 1:28 4:33 5:6,11,28 11:27 19:22,23 21:5,7 23:14 26:19,28 27:33 30:19.30 31:2 33:11 34:5 38:4 42:14 46:16 47:23 66:21 67:22 ended 47:24 endorsing 46:18 energy 25:2 engage 45:2 engagement 66:34 engineers 21:27 enough 6:28 9:10 13:20 14:10 37:6,17 42:3 54:5 63:18 65:7 ensure 1:4 20:28 21:28 39:27 ensured 3:13 ensuring 21:28 38:34 39:30 entered 24:19 entire 66:11 entitled 23:23 62:13,20 66:22,23 68:26 entitles 69:19 environmental 5:3 envisaged 38:6,7 equalisation 3:34 11:15,27 17:11 19:14 20:22,27 23:18 26:33 29:19 equality 45:1 equitable 11:17 errors 1:5 essence 30:10 essential 18:28 essentially 15:29 establish 30:21 53:19 established 1:34 30:11 estate 30:16 52:19 53:15 estates 39:11,12 43:5,12 estimate 25:8.10 estimated 2:19 10:2 estimates 13:29 29:29 50:19 estimation 4:17 euro 3:21 12:25 17:21,22 even 13:15,31 14:6 17:21 19:29 20:1 22:9 23:18 31:4 36:29 37:6 41:14 44:29 52:10 57:9,29 66:24 evening 59:27 ever 3:5 6:11 14:26 39:27 59:28 61:4 every 4:13 5:5,15 13:15 15:21 17:10,27 21:12,13 23:21 25:4,23,24,31 28:12 34:4 40:19 43:19 45:1,23 46:22 52:23 54:16 61:15 62:6,9,19 64:11 67:21 68:28 69.2 everybody's 24:18 33:10 everybody 1:16 2:7,34 14:11 15:15 33:11 40:33 42:7 43:24

70.4everyone's 24:10 45:12 52:26 54:29 everyone 14:2 18:32 19:1,9 54:15 everything 4:24 9:3 15:14 41:33 44:18 46.5evictions 23:22 evidence 26:18 63:5.7 evolved 39:5 exactly 14:16 48:8 49:32 example 18:20 19:20 26:34 34:16,25 40:15 42:15 56:16 59:2.31 examples 26:32 64:9 exasperate 38:21 except 12:22 exception 35:11 39:12 exchanges 25:16 exclusively 18:33 20:6 excuse 17:7 39:11 executive 14:14 24:31 43:25 47:7 62:2 exemplary 43:24 exempt 20:15 exemptions 2:6,10,12,13 exercise 23:4 52:6 63:18 existing 25:14 30:3 35:2 exit 34:15 exorbitant 22:1 expect 7:9 14:32 27:30,31 63:1 expedited 31:32 expenses 25:13 expensive 32:5 52:7 experience 42:28 43:22 63.23 experiencing 38:29 explain 11:8 28:12 explained 25:30 explanation 18:15 explanations 23:12 explored 41:19 expressed 41:3 56:17 expression 35:13 expressions 48:29 extended 31:5 extension 63:33 extensions 66:19 extensive 32:24 extent 10:30 42:23 extort 39:25 extra 7:24 10:26.27.32 32:32 33:12.33 52:10 extraordinary 23:7 extreme 40:22 48:14 extremely 12:14 43:21,22 eve 24:31 47:29 Eamon 62:26 Eircom 25:2 Eireann 25:3 42:29 43:8 47:18.19 Eirgrid 25:2 Emoclew 32:28 54:2 Enda 20:10 Environment 2:13 15:29 39:17 46:8 Equally 21:8 68:3 **Especially** 35:5 48:14 **ESB** 8:13 25:2 Europe 10:18 16:30 17:20 Expenditure 4:17 11:1,8 18:14 25:9,13,14 26:12,23 31:17,28 51:33 F fabric 50:20 faced 15:21 facing 40:8 41:21 fact 2:31,34 8:7 15:5,21 16:13,32 20:26 24:2 36:11 37:11.14 42:29.33.34 44:4 45:17,25 48:25 54:10

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

56.32 59.2 60.30 61:12 66:26 factor 1:13 21:15 23:3 29:11 63:19 factors 7:2 facts 36:19 63:17 fail 10:32 failing 39:27 fair 10:13 22:16 31:16 37:11 70:8 fairly 32:20 41:11 58:12 63:18 fairness 17:34 familiar 27:22,25 34:14,30 35:5,19 families 6:21 17:21 33:33 34:5 42:7.9.12.23 45:19,20 47:1,21 48:6 54:13 family 13:4 34:20 42:15 famous 54:2 fan 37:12 far 6:28 21:18 26:6,12 30:15 36:26 43:29 46:22 58:21 60:9 64:5 farce 64:3 fastest 30:21 father 61:13 fault 46:26 54:9 favour 5:21,22 14:33 favourable 58:13 favouritism 46:19 fear 47:22 feature 16:14 feedback 4:19 feel 3:34 12:8 19:26 28:1 36:30 37:2 54:27 55.1 16 59.1 60.33 62:9.18 63:6 65:17 67:2.3 feeling 19:29 55:15 58:27 fees 23:21 fell 39:20 fellow 6:19 55:15 59:11 felt 32:4 36:9 41:17 few 1:18 18:14 19:6 34:29 35:18 44:25 50:9,10 52:22 53:31 54:21 field 41:4 45:34 49:10 fields 17:12 figure 6:29 15:9,30 27:9 51.20figures 9:18 10:2 16:18 18:15 19:9,11 20:5,6 22:20 26:15 27:13 41:32 47:3,20 48:15 52:28,30 63:22 file 55:2 56:18 57:31 58:6.11 59:3.31 61:4.16.22 62:14.15 63:12,13,32,34 66:9,11,16,17,20 69:16,19 filed 4:12 files 58:8 62:13 63:10 66:26 fill 25:26 30:25 31:8 38:18 41:4.5 49:9.13.19 filled 56:10 57:7 58:15.21 fills 35:11 49:10 final 33:25 53:9 59:29 finally 37:29 39:21 56:32 finance 1:13,17,34 2:1,2 4:26 5:5 10:29 13:7 14:26 15:11 26:28 43:4 finances 27:7 financial 1:33 2:28 4:18,19 5:11,23 11:30.32 25:12 26:6 57:3 financially 11:33 find 19:24 26:30 37:26 41:10 42:16 44:14

64:25,27 67:25 68:13 finding 11:31 fine 7:13 14:29 17:34 20:10,11 21:19 23:17 28:18,20 39:8 59:5 finish 17.33 30.6 38.8 finished 24:4.6 33:8 59:14 firm 9:27 first 1:21 6:29 10:5 11:13 13:24 17:23 18:8 22:6 28:14,15,20,30,31 30:33 32:4 33:6 34:10 35:10.28 37:6 38:11.13.27 39:2 41:9,22 42:2 45:34 51:12 59:21,30 60:11 70:20,22,23,30 firstly 39:32 fit 48.30 five 1:9 5:21 8:28 14:20 25:4.19 30:2 43:8 45:23 47:9.17.19 49:21 50:25 54:11 69:21 fixed 1:25 fledgling 43:4 flip 30:9 floor 50:27 flung 58:21 focus 6:31 follow 11:11 26:1 32:14 67:20 followed 15:25 16:24 following 1:1,24 3:13 4:16 40:1.34 55:22 69:11 foot 39:26 56:33 footpath 12:20 18:20 footpaths 12:20 for 1:2,9,14,29,30 2:7,12,18,22,26,34 3:4,7,20,32,33 4:3.17.18.27 5:1.2.26 6:14,15,22,30,31 7:12 8:17.19 9:11,12,13,20,21,31 10:11,14,18,26,27,28, 32,33 11:12,23,31 12:6,7,9,25,26,29,32 13:1.12.18.27.29.33 14:6,9,11,15,16,19,27 .29.33 15:1 16:2,4,8,13,21,22 force 2:33 56:33 forced 6:31 47:10 forgotten 45:2 form 4:10 8:13 17:32 33:24.29 37:29 52:1 53:25 54:34 56:23 57:28 59:5,21,24,26,28,34 60:5,6,8 61:2 62:5,14,15,33 63:1,3,9,26,27 64:1.5.10.11.29 65:17 68:1.4.18 70:1 forma 66:3 formal 9:29 32:12 formally 9:12 28:3 51:7 formed 55:23 former 54:5 forms 33:8.9.10 46:25 51:17 52:23 53:4 54:26 55:3,7,16 56:10 57:7.10.11.15 58:15.21.32 59:1,6,8,26 63:17,20,23,28 64:9,13,31 65:17,23,34 66:1 67:15 68:20 70:5,6 formula 64:8 forth 21:4

56.14 17 58.3

60:24.32 63:17

forward 9:12 11:14 13:22 15:2 20:11 30:12 31:29 32:19.30 37:15 43:16 45:29 46:3 51:14 62:12 63:7 69:10,24 forwarded 49:23 found 19.31 foundation 30:28 foundations 30:27 32:32 four 2:33 5:22 23:2 25:12 30:10 31:1,3,25 34:20 35:30 36:14 44:26 45:14,21 46:14 49:21 51:31 52:30 57:11 70.27 fourth 52.16 frame 29:32 free 17:25,26,27 freed 48:30 friends 42:18 fringes 16:27 from 1:14 2:13,24 3:23 4:19 5:8 7:19 8:7,16,29 9:5,20,33 10:26,34 11:3,27,30 12:18 13:8 14:32 15:3,22,26,28 16:1,7,31 17:3,6 18:15 19:11 20:15,22 21:11.26 23:9,10,16,19,20,25 24:29 25:10,17,22 26:26,27,29,33 27:27 28:4,10 29:19,33 30:9,26 31:5,17 32:14,17 front 17:20,21,22 41:21 frozen 67:1 frustrated 36:30 frustrating 58:3 frustration 36:29 39:13,14 44:18 full 2:11 11:12 12:9 41:24 57:24 fully 11:29 14:25 25:23 42:27 55:30 66:2 function 3:26 6:6 13:28 18:34 19:32 50:21 functional 3:27 functions 47:11 fund 3:6,34 4:7,10,11 8:26,29,31 10:14 11:15 12:21.23 15:23.27 17:9 19:10.14 20:22.27 22:7,25 23:18 26:34 27:16 29:19 46:7,8 fundamental 60:25 funded 3:11 8:27 12:10.19 15:28 16:5 17:13 22:23 24:21.33 26:3 funding 1:23 2:6 3:6,11,16 4:3,7,12 7:15,25 8:16,25,26 10:19,26,27,32 12:7,8,17 15:12,22 16:1.10.21 17:6 18:26 19:28 24:29 25:33 26:21 27:1 30:11 36:17 38:34 39:9,18 46:13 48:1,2,21,31 funds 7:6 27:20 furnished 40:12 further 20:3 22:19 30:19 56:2,34 57:32 58:28 65:1 69:25 future 19:20 20:24 35:15 39:1 43:14,30 50:1,25 51:2 53:19 58:33 65:9 Fairfield 38:25 Farrankelly 30:33 32:32 38:11,17,19 50:3 Fáil 23:16 24:15 FCA 30:34 32:20

February 25:29

21:11,16,25,27 22:22

Fein's 10.9 Fein 7:12 8:34 9:12,27 10:5 14:32 17:33 20:10 22:30 Féin 23:17,31 24:14 28:10 Fheis 20:10 21:19 Fianna 23:16 24:15 Fingal 19:20 Fitzgerald 47:16 Fortune 15:4 28:23 41:24 44:12 53:17,24,27 54:20 65:3,4 69:19,26 Fox's 20:26 61:13 64:6 FOX 11:13 12:14 15:26 23:18 29:18 37:10 61:13.17 63:23 65:27 66:30 68:21 69:15 70.15 Friday 4:23 50:12 59:27 G gap 25:26 67:10 68:16 70:1 gave 11:25 18:3 25:22 51:22 67:21,32,33 general 1:23 2:31 14:3.5 22:4 39:34 60:32 65:25 66:3 generally 27:15 38:8 53:21 55:11,23 58:25,26 65:32 generation 41:22,23 gentleman 59:30 genuine 12:32 genuinely 53:19 60:24 geographical 46:18 get 2:23 3:33 5:5 8:11,12,29,30 10:26,27,32 12:25 16:22 17:31.32 19:1 21.11 22.9 30 25:23.26.31 26:13 27:23.30 30:21.34 31:4,11,19 32:7,15,19 33:10 34:28 35:18 37:4,25,33 38:6,13,15 39:1 40:22.29.32 41:21.24.27.33 42:34.31 43:11 44:8 45:8 46:7,9,26,28,30, gets 57:3 getting 9:19 16:13,18 17:25,26,27 18:19,23,24 29:18 31:32 32:11.33 36:7,10,12 39:34 44:20,22,27 49:32 50:17 52:2 60:7,8 61:6,8 62:28 64:18 67:28 68:18,20 ghost 39:11,12 **girl** 67:31,33 girls 10:28 11:25 give 1:15,17 9:4 11:22 13:30 14:34 18:1,20 19:31 20:2 22:14 26:15 28:13 32:27 35:25 51:15 53:18 55:17 56:4 60:5 61:3 66:17 67:9.25 69:1 given 7:26 9:6 13:8 30:17.28.30 31:13 37:31 38:14 43:18 46:1 47:22,23 53:21 55:12 58:25 61:32 62:22,23,24 63:11,28,32,33 65:33 gives 50:14 giving 20:27 43:1 60:1 61:3 62:11 glad 39:21 44:20,22 45:12 47:4 glasses 52:21 global 2:9,11 8:10 25:24 globals 25:1 goes 1:30 3:33 7:5 11:24 15:15,29 17:3,4,28

47:5,27 52:14 55:33 56:2 63:10 65:34 going 1:15,27 3:5,19,33 4:6,30,32 5:8 6:1,14 7:4 9:8,23 10:5,11,15,18,20,24 11:4 12:27 13:17.23.28.30 14:10,12,15,17,21,22, 30 15:20,22 16:26 17:4,31 19:6,20 20:11 22:7 23:4.15 24:13,17,18 25:4 26:26 27:32 29:28,32,33 30:12,16 31.22.29.33.2 36:28.32 37:1.1 gold 45:7 gone 2:31 3:34 4:10,11 13:6 25:19 26:16 32:5,24,30 40:20 46:27 59:19 65:17,19 good 1:9,16 7:15,18 10:28 11:25 12:34 20:13 21:11 23:34 26:17 30:8 38:30 39:2,32 41:11 43:14 44:28 46:15 47:24 52:18 53:8 55:23 58:12 61:13 65:7 67.2 goods 5:9 goodwill 12:34 got 1:18 3:21 4:24 5:21 8:21,22 9:10,33 11:24,27 12:19 18:4,21 23:9 24:18 27:2,27 28:1,25 30:24.29 31:26.28.32 32:30 44:1,25 49:21.24 51:1,15,16,17,18,31 52:11,17,28 54:30 58:8 59:9 64:19 66:24 67:20,33 governance 55:23 grace 53:18.21 grand 4:11 8:2 grant 2:32 3:21 13:2 15:31 17:2,4,28 granted 16:15 grants 3:14 5:8 7:17,25 11:1,2,3 15:7 16:4 27.5 grateful 40:34 great 5:25 10:15 35:6 44:13,28 48:15 50:14 54.14 greater 20:30 green 41:4 grip 41:21 ground 6:27 7:28 32:6,31 36:8,10,19 50:27 group 1:33 2:28 28:1 53:9 groups 10:19 34:24 grow 9:23 guaranteed 17:10 guidance 55:9,31 58:23 65:31.34 guy 34:3 Gael 17:34 20:10,11 21:19 23:17 39:8 Gas 25:2 GALLAGHER 28:32 29:8,15 59:19 67:32 68.15 69.26 70:9.20.23.27.30 Gilmore 62:26 Glending 36:23 52:13,16,20 God 54:19 Government 2:2 3:30 6:14 7:6 8:7.12.16.26.27.31 9:8,9,20,22 10:16,26 11:4 15:22 16:31 19:28 20:1

23:10,19 26:4 28:13 31:6 37:14 39:7,8,20,24 42:34 43:7,15 44:33 45:5 47:10 55:22 Greystones 3:17 16.19 21 17.15 33.32 38:5 45:20 50:10 53:13 Η habitable 50:34 had 2:14,26,31 3:20,21 5:19,20 7:20 9:13 12:16 13:34 15:10 19:10,19 23:19 30:33 32:3 34:5 36:6 37:21 39:18.20.24 40:21 41:10 43:22 50:26 51:18,27 54:27 57:14 59:31 60:3,4,6 61:14 62:26,31 66:25 67:31 haggling 19:26 half 8:11 10:6 17:23 18:11,28 20:26,28,30 25:20 28:22 38:30 41:13 44:21 59:27 hamstrung 11:32 hand 2:17 21:25 23:19 36:11 53:11 62:2 64:20 handed 64:30 handing 39:4 handover 39:16 hands 52:14 62:10,32 64:19 hang 9:10 happen 4:32 12:22 20:23,24 38:20 41:26 44:28 54:5,9 62:29 happened 12:21 13:1 43:5 46:11 56:19 58:7 59:30 happening 9:23 19:12 36:31 37:8 38:19,25 45:13,15 50:15 53:30 55:28 57:19 64:24.26.28 65:3 66:13 happens 4:11 23:11 40:26 64:21 happier 12:26 happy 6:19 16:20 31:34 61:31 65:25,27,28 66:4 69:25 hard 7:31 11:31 14:11 18:31 19:24 26:18 36:34 38:7.28.33 39:30 47:5 48:13 54:14,17 60:9 harder 53:28 hardly 18:5 42:14 hardship 20:2 has 2:11 4:7.25 7:18.20.32 10:21 13:5 14:19 15:26 18:18 20:16 21:14,21 22:29 26:16 27:22 32:25 35:14 37:13 38:13 39:5,6 40:28 41:3 42:28,33,34 44:3,13,27 45:28 47:32 48:18 49:2 52:18,33 53:33 55:12,33 56:15,18,19 57:25 58:3,16,17,25 59:1,8 61:21,27 63:32 hasn't 21:20 44:26 53:25 54:11 hassle 57:29 68:19,22 have 1:18.22.28 2:1,12,21,29 3:22,28 4:4,5,10,11,16,18,24, 27 5:5,11,12,14,15 6:3,21,24 7:18,24,34 8.22.23 9:3,9,11,23,24,31 10:6,11,29

11:1,2,6,7,15,18,23,3 0.31.34 12:7.16.17.19.20.21.2 2,25,26,28,30,34 13:5,6,15,20,23,24,27 14:14,19,21,22,25,28 15:16,18,2 haven't 9:10 12:13 15:10 18:1 23:18 29:3 32:30.34 33:25 44:22 46:29 47:34 49:3 51:1 52:23 64:19 having 2:1 13:21 37:4 38:19 43:30 50:25 54:31 61:4,23 68:19 he'll 61.13 he's 24:2 head 1:17 8:13 45:25 50:17 headless 17:29 headline 43:32 headlines 34:3 47:26 heads 21:33 47:30 health 5:3 14:7 17:25 heap 59:33 hear 14:31 15:7 17:4.6 23:11 26:8 45:12 heard 26:11 30:19 44:21 47:34 64:5 69:8 hearing 15:3 hearts 45:7 heating 12:7 heels 11:15 height 53:30 held 4:19 hell 8:34.3 help 9:10 59:7 66:31 67:3 helped 3:24 47:28 helpful 61:19 63:33 helping 58:22 her 15:10 48:16 57:33 60:3,11 62:22 here's 19:15 here 2:11 3:26 4:11,22 6:11,23 7:18 8:33 9:10.17.28 11:5.23 13:22 14:9.15 15:19.22.34 17:1,13,14,17,34 18:2.18 19:3,12,26,27,34 20:8,9 21:28 22:20 23:3,15,21,24 24:8 28:13 31:14 35:31 36:6.32 37:4 38:2 39:10.25.26.29 41:16 42:7 43:15 44:32 46:5,10,12,15,2 highest 10:17 16:30 25:25 43:29 highlight 3:10 51:14 highlighting 4:20 hilt 9:19 10:17 him 20:23 24:32 60:2 himself 36:25 41:17 hindrance 59:6 his 23:24 24:31 42:6 57:33 59:33 70:18 history 43:3 65:19 hit 8:11 31:23 hold 4:33 22:18 59:34 70:31 holding 10:30 36:10 homeless 3:14 7:25 8:25 9:5,11 18:26 25:33 27:7.19.20.23 34:6,7,25 43:23 45:7 47:20,21,25 50:10,15 53:16 homelessness 6:18 7:15 16:4 30:2,5 33:4 34:2,6 38:28,29 47:15,22 48:14 homes 20:15 30:3 34:29 37:32 39:16 homework 70:13 honest 18:31 19:24 26:17,26 64:28

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

honour 21.11 honoured 21:20.21.22 honouring 18:3 hope 2:23 24:18 33:26 39:22,25 42:4,23 hopefully 34:28 42:4 hoping 6:28 55:15 hour 36:7 hours 33:12 house 11:18 17:10 23:24.25 28:13 32:25,33 33:21 37:2,33 38:12,20 40:33 42:16,31 43:5 44:26,27 45:3 46:10 48.24 51.5 52.34 53:2.19.20 54:8 59:23 housed 34:15.21 40:19 44:1 45:20 54:13 houses 7:1 11:21 21:2,4 35:3,5,28,30 36:23,32 37:11,17,20,21,34 38:15.19 39:1,3,4,19,33,34 40:1,3,6,20,28,29,30 41:24.27 43:3.11 44:21,25 46:14 47:31 48:23 49:27 50:2,3,4,32 52:16,17 53:8,34 54:6,10,13 housing 3:29 4:8,10,12 5:1,29 6:18,21,24 12:6 14:20,26,28 15:28 20:18 21:2.7 27:9,22 29:16,26 30:3,4,5,7,31,33 31:7 33:2,3,6,8,19,20,24,2 8.29.31.34 34.10 24 33 35:2.4.13.17.22 36:3.20.21.24.29 37:4,5,13,17,23,29 38:1,26,27 39:5,6,9,11,17,18,23, 27 40:5,13, how 1:24 3:10 5:1 8:20.21 10:1 12:23 14:12 15:10 25:5.20.30 26:13 27:6,16 28:6 31:14 36:21,23,33 39:30 40:13 41:12,31,34 44:31 48:6,20,30 52:21.33 53:3 54:27 55:15.30 56:22 58:17 59:26 60:33 61:8.9 62:2 65:12 huge 23:8,22 33:11 36:29 37:7 38:5 41:25 43:4,7 45:29 47:5,15 60:17 humanity 43:23 hundred 39:4 hundreds 56:13 hurdles 63:9 husband 60:3 hypocrite 12:8 Haddington 2:4,26,29 Hall 30:34 32:20 Halloween 26:26 HAP 2:6 3:7 16:11 38:4 40:6 42:22 43:1 46:33 47:9,12 52:32 53:6,9,10,14 Heights 30:14,16 32:3,19 HFA 2:6 3:6 High 11:18.26 21:32 31:23 34:14 51:19.22 66:21 Hill 34:14 Home 18:9 36:34 37:4,25 42:13 44:15 53:6 However 2:13 11:32 28:16 31:25 56:2 68:32 I idea 7:15 25:26 48:20 identified 42:29

identifying 1:34 idle 45:4 ignore 23:5 ignored 39:13 illegal 36:23 68:6,8 illegally 36:24 imagination 15:4 imaginative 41:5 imagine 38:12,18 40:33 69:4 immediately 22:32 impact 2:2,9,11,29 7:20,32 impacted 8:2 impacts 38:20 implement 13:7 implemented 33:25 60:21 important 7:13,30 10:30 14:4 16:1,16 18:27 34:2,34 43:26 45:25,28 57:7,24 60:14,21 64:15 impractical 62:34 impressed 44:29 60:21 improve 14:31 28:2,6 30:3 33:24 38:7,8 57:23 improved 12:27 21:6,7 33:18 54:11 improvement 14:5,6,25 18:23 improving 21:2,3 30:6 inappropriate 6:22 inaudible 33:15 41:18 42:2,6,24,25 48:29 49:4 51:13 52:33 53:15.16 incensed 13.13.14 include 26:7,12 35:7 63:28 included 22:24 26:30 50:32 68:1,4,21 includes 27:7 including 26:27 35:13 income 2:20,24 3:32 4:6.17.27 5:8 9:17 10:18 15:9 21:31 25:12 27:1 37:33 48:24 50:1 51:5 incomes 37:31 incorporated 70:17 increase 5:17 9:19 11:1,4 13:21 17:15 19:5.34 20:1.12 21:10.15.21 28:4 42:32 50:20.21 increased 12:33 13:4,5 16:21 19:34 21:20 35:4 40:3 50:19 increases 16:22 20:3 increasing 8:7 incredibly 8:17 incur 4:17 indeed 6:15 42:29 56:24 57:1 independence 48:3 independents 17:33 18:2 index 17:14 indicate 26:7 indicated 51:26 52:4 63:31 indicates 62:20 68:26 indication 41:12 51:15 indicators 5:14 individual 2:22 5:23 34:4.12 41:28 55:34 56:3.7.20 62:27 68:34 69:5.6 individuals 34:5,15,16,20 47:21 industry 45:27 inefficient 39:29 infill 38:17 influence 43:15 influencing 23:3 information 41:34 60:1,6 61:6.8.28 62:10,11,12,20,22,23,

28 63:28 66:2.15.22 67:27 68:26 69:4 informative 42:6 infrastructure 19:28 26:22 28:7 36:27 inherently 51:7 initially 49:13 initiative 35:24 initiatives 41:5 ink 18:5 inland 15:6 inquiries 54:22 inserting 62:12 inside 65:9 insinuating 69:2 insist 59.5 insofar 11:17 63:24 inspection 33:18 instance 16:2 17:23 instances 56:16 instant 33:27 institute 43:8 institutions 34:26 intended 1:3 22:11 55:28 56:19 intentions 12:34 interest 33:10 35:14 47:15 48:29 52:26 55:23 interested 35:18 52:8 interests 41:18 52:24 interrupted 24:5 interview 52:25 into 1:9 3:9 7:2 12:5 18:19 19:14,20 20:34 23:3 24:19,20,27 29:16 31:19 34:27 36:8 37:25 38:18.30 39:5 40:34,1,10 41:24 45:34 46:9.15 47:5 50:34 52:19 53:2 55:2 56:13,33 58:28 62:33 63:10 introduce 62:25 introduced 55:26 61:21 introduction 13:4 invested 7:15 investigation 41:19 investment 6:7 50:6 involved 24:25 31:11 32:11 52:13,20 57:34 ironic 54:8 irrespective 62:21 68:27 isn't 15.23 22.28 48.22 53:3 60:22 68:34 issue 14:3 18:22 19:15 23:18 24:26 28:24 36:7 39:10 41:22 45:16 46:5,6,8 47:8 50:4 55:3 56:28,30 57:12 58:33 60:17.31 61:12.20.25 62:6,23,28,33 63:25 64:8,12 67:34 68:23,29 issued 2:4,17 24:20 25:28 issues 10:4 14:1 16:10 18:17 21:3 23:20 41:9.19 42:17 45:11 46:2 47:6,18 56:18 57:6.14.18.21 item 1:10 14:4 29:25 54.23 items 14:3 18:25,26 its 3:27 16:14 28:6 58:16 itself 21:34 68:5 I'd 7:19.34 8:20 10:5.29 11:10 14:31.33 15:7.9 18:8.15 28:5.8 29:26 36:21 37:7 38:27,33 41:9,30,34 42:23,24 43:18,30 45:10 47:29 56:22 61:2 I'll 14:34 17:33 18:20 19:6 23:30 28:4 29:2.20 30:6.9.24 48:33 51:12 52:7 59:11 69:30 70:17

I'm 1:16.17 2:6 3:9.19 4:20 5:4 6:1.9 9:12.17.18 10:24 11:13,22 12:5 13:29 15:17 16:20 19:1 21:18 22:10 23:2,6 24:5,13,18 25:22 26.12 28.29 31.13 33:2 35:27 36:30 39:21 41:3 42:9.19.33 44:20.22.34 45:12 46:33,34 47:4 50:12,31 54:5,15,16,27,34 55:15 56:28 I've 1:17 14:19.26 22:19 35.33 44.20 47.7 57:14 59:2,3 Iarnrod 25:3 Incentive 3:15,19,24 7:26 8:20,21,23 25:28,30 26:14,18 Ireland 25:3 30:2 54:10 Irish 2:5.9.12.34 3:4 8:3,14 9:3 23:20,24 24:18,19,23,27,32,33 36:26 37:9 40:27 41:16 46:6,13 49:7 It's 1:24 3:22,26,34 5:1,14,28,33 6:1,3,6,7,14 7:13 8:3.13.33 9:6.8 10:7,9,14,16 11:20 12:24.25 13:5.17 14:2,9,10,11,12,13,28 ,29,30 15:9,11,20 16:33 17:17,20,28 18:3,10,17,18,31 19:27 21:23 22:11,23 25.21 22 23 25 26:5.16.17.18 31:2,22,29 32:5,29 33:7,10, J jersey 47:19 job 7:18 8:3 10:8 18:22 19:26 38:30 44:13 52:9 53:15 57:11 60:25 65:5 iobs 48:2 iov 39:19 jump 6:1 40:29 47:20 jumps 50:6 jurisdictions 46:27 just 1:17,18 2:6 3:19 4:20 5:28 6:1.2.26 7:19.31.34 8:2.3.19 9:3.4.20.21.34 10:14,19,24,33 11:2,8,10,20 12:10 13:1,6 15:6,9,18 17:33 18:20 19:6,12 20:5,7,12,14,22 21:9.25.34 22:25.30 23:6.8.16.24.34 24:6,8,16,19,25,26,30 25:1,4,24,25 26:5,13,22,30,32 27:5 Jackie 30:4,8 37:10 38:3 44:3.12 45:10 48:16,33 50:3 51:11 54:16 January 1:31 24:19 25:4 34:5 Japan 23:23,24 Joe 25:33 27:18,28 29:26 31:7 34:28 37:10 38:33 39:26,30,34 40:24 42:6.7 43:19 44:12 45:10 48:18.32 59:20 63:3 65:6 66:8 John 18:30 29:10 49:7,20 50:9 Johnny 61:13,17 July 5:20 30:19 51:19 June 40:3 49:23 51:16.18 K

keen 31.32 keep 14:30 17:31 21:33 29:2 47:30 48:11 50:28 56:8 62:25 keeping 16:20 24:26 40:8 42:19 kept 11:24,26 16:6 17:10 61:9 63:13,14 kev 1:21 15:19 keys 39:4,16 45:24 kids 42:15.17.19 kind 15:11 41:7 44:8 kindly 41:11 knew 50:26 know 3:19 6:14 8:14,22,30,33 9:5 10:4.31 11:12.22 12:4 13:12 14:12 15:1 18:17,31 19:6 20:5 22:7 25:23,33 31:6 34:11 36:21,26,29 37:1,3,7,8,12,21,30 38:5.7.15 39:1 40:6.13 41:30 44:4.24 45:6 46:16.24.29.31 47:5.14 48:5.8.18.21 49:24 51:10 52:18 54:16 55:15 knowing 12:7 knowledge 30:15 66:28 known 61:18 knows 1:16 2:34 42:7 64:10 KAVANAGH 21:30 23:32 63:15 Kelly 39:6 Kenny 20:10 **KENNEDY** 8:19 22:17.18 25:28 26.391316 Kilbride 30:14 32:23.25 Kilkenny 38:33 39:26 64:23 Kilmacanogue 30:24,30 49:13 Kilmantan 31:1 32:20 34:14 L lack 3:11 47:11 48:2 ladder 37:5 42:32 laid 55:9 lambasted 36:8 land 10:11 18:10 25:16 30:21,28 31:3 34:31 37:32 46:1 49:34 50.31landed 16:12 landlord 33:30 44:15 landlords 43:1,2 53:6,16 lands 35:17 language 65:4 large 37:31 larger 37:27 38:12 41:4 largest 14:21 last 1:33 2:11 3:23 4:23,32 6:17 7:14,20 8:11,27,29 9:6 10:24,34 11:24 12:16,33 13:16 14:3,5 15:17 16:1,5,6,7,20 17:14 19:5.11.12 20:22.29 21:12 22:26 25:19 27:19 28:4.25.28 29:27 30:17 31:32 34:8 35:12 36:26 39:15 42:33 44:7,20,21 47:32 49:12,15,32 50.6 lasts 69:21 late 1:9 49:21 61:13,17 later 15:21 54:3,11 56:4 60:2 64:27 69:1 latter 15:30 launch 53:10 law 22:6 35:14 56:34 60:25 61:20 67:20 laws 56:26

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

lay 40:26 layer 55:31 layers 43:10 leadership 45:5 leaflet 25:30 learned 27:2 lease 35:25 leasing 49:33 least 7:9 24:14 31:28 37:9 44:21 60:32 65:8 leave 19:5 23:1 28:3 29:10 59:11 65:1 67:10 68:16 leaves 2:19 leaving 28:3 67:11 70:1 led 43:19 left 37:3 42:12 47:4 50:33 64:30 legal 23:21 52:14,20 55:25 58:28 62:18,19 63:8 65:33 67:7.12.21.22 68:25,27,28 70:3,13 legalities 67:27 69:7 legally 55:25 68:7 70:4 legislation 56:32 59:9 67:14 legs 64:3 less 3:21 9:24 19:22 33:17 41:23 69:29 lesson 27:3 let's 7:31 9:21 12:15 26:25 32:3 63:22 let 23:12 24:6 27:18 46:29,30 52:24 67:17 68:17 70:10 letter 22:31 28:13 37:8 47.22 59.13 60.4 61:7 66:3 69:15 letters 69:18 letting 35:4,6 40:14 65:10 lettings 40:12,13 level 1:30 12:1 19:26 24:20 25:25 37:14 39:1 43:15 51:27 52:4 58:19 66:27 levels 43:30 61:28 leverage 11:25 35:25 levies 26:21 levy 27:6 liability 1:14 6:26 liable 5.25 liaise 24:32 libraries 17:5 library 3:15 7:26 12:25 16:3 30:34 life 36:34 45:17 light 22:29 lighting 12:19 lights 6.9 like 4:6 5:22 6:18 7:1.7.19.30 8:20 9:16 10:5,13,15,29 11:10 13:17 14:1,4,7,31 15:7,9,15 17:29 18:2,8,15 21:9 22:34 25:16 27:12 28:5 31:13 36:21 37:7 38:27.33 39:2 41:4,9,30,34 42:24 43:6,30 44:8 45:7,8,10,11,27 47:29,30 48:12 54:17 55:6,16,25,31,32 56.22 likelihood 14:16 28:21 likes 18:8 limited 50:30 limits 32:13 line 2:32 5:5 7:13 8:34 10:15,30 35:8 40:9,25 55:8 58:33 63:28 66:22 lines 59:10 68:11 link 24:27 29:32

33:7.10.28 35:4 36:21 37:4.17.24.25.26.27 40:16,17,20 42:31 43:33,34 44:1,3,5,6,7,10,30,31, 32 45:1,24 46:20 47:1,2 48:2,3,6,7 49:2 52:24.25 53:3,17,20,23,25,26 59:22 60:11,12 62:25 63:27 68:4 listen 46:5 50:34 listened 18:34 39:14 listening 19:30 23:31 43.26lists 6:21 26:27 50:13 53:8 literally 4:26 little 14:6 19:19 22:7 27:23 32:29 37:16 43:4 48:21 67:2 live 7:29 27:15 45:30 53:32 57:26 63:24 living 7:1 34:27 41:5 42:15 44:4 60:9 64:14 loaded 17:22 49:15 loads 17:20 loans 2:6 3:6 lobby 3:10 lobbying 2:28 26:6,11 48:1,9 67:32 local 1:12,13,14,18,21 2:2,6,9,14,28 3:6,10,26,29 4:16,18 5:11,19,23 6:20 7:5 8:16.34 9:24 11:22 12.20 22 23 30 13:6,14 15:4,20 17:9.11 18:33 19:3,7,9,10,13,14,15, 18,26,31 20:7,8,11,18 21:2,4,16,20,28 22:6,7,8,11 23:26,34 25:23.24.26 28:5 31:15 34:34 35:1 locally 4:1 location 11:20 30:16 logic 15:19 logical 10:7 long 7:31 13:33 20:31 22:18 33:29 42:10,26 44:20.30.31 48:11 52:21 65:20 68:7 longer 8:1 31:19 34:32 38:12 41:26 42:26 46:28 52:6,25 looked 2:9,10 7:10 17:14 21:1 22:6 41:1 42:13 64.22 looking 4:24 5:1,8 6:11,15,30 9:34 11:3.29 12:12 15:18 21:2,3,6,13 27:29 28:11 32:27 33:32 36:3 37:25 38:22 40:5,25 47:12 48:19 53.14 54.21 57.9 59:23 65:2 67:29 looks 13:17 44:22 loops 40:29.32 lose 22:13 33:10,21 52:24 53:22 59:20 losers 51:7 losing 25:20 28:18,19 53.22.26 lost 2:31 36:34 37:2,4 51:8 65:22 lot 6:34 7:1,12 11:30,31 12:24 14:5 15:18 16:30 19:29 20:34 23:12,15,22 24:7 30:25,29 32:6,11 35:5,25,34 36:2,12,15 38:12 40:4,16,17 42:28 44:13.18 45:4 47:24,26 48:11,18

list 19.10 30.31 33

50.2 53.34 54.17 55:29 56:12 57:28 60:10 62:11 63:16,34 66:28 69:14 lots 6:20 love 7:34 lovely 44:32 low 34:13,17,20,21 37:31 lower 11:21 25:26 ludicrous 57:16 lunchtime 33:11 lving 45:4 Labour 43:9 62:24,27 Lansdowne 2:5,26,29 21:10 Laoghaire 40:15 Lawless's 63:15 LAMA 62:19 63:7 68:24 LANE 27:19 29:26,27 30:14 31:2 32:20,23,25 34:29 38:33 39:26 42:6 43:19 48:33 49:4 51.11 LAWLESS 8:33 9:30 10:8 11:17 28:15,29,31 48:10,11 51:10 54:24,25 55:19,32 57:25 58:34 60:7,14 61:3 65:2.15.16 67:13,18,24,27 69:21.22.24 70:2.22 LEO 16:11 Liam 23:32 Look 1:28 5:5,22 6:12,13,17,19,26,29 7:5 11:26 12:15,28 13:1 14:22 15:2 17:1 19:12 21:24.30 25:10 28:29 36:3 41:7 42:12 46:2,3,23 47:20 49:18,24 50:6,20,27 51:21 53:1,2,3,23 54:5,13 56:23 57:20.22.24 58:28 59:3.5 60:1 61:2.29 62:14,18 63:10,12 64:21.33 65 Louth 26:32 27:2 64:24 LPT 3:13,27,32,34 4:12 5:9,19,26 6:1,6 11:29 12:5,10 16:6 20:15 29.11Luncheon 29:23 Μ made 1:23 2:12 7:14.23.28.30 8:11 10:34 14:17 15:10 23:9,30 24:13 28:12,17,22 36:16 40:13 42:27 43:18 48:29 49:34 51:30 54:14 63:30 69:2,14 mail 26:33 54:30 59:6,9,10 61:33 65:6 66:19 67:24 68:5 mailed 5:21 53:21 mails 61:33 main 14:3,28 27:27 30:4 48:27 49:11 53:15 mainly 27:27 maintain 5:9,16 12:5 18:29 27:2 33:12 40:5 68:13 maintaining 5:22 26:22 maintenance 3:13 12:7,33 20:18 25:13 29:29 40:2,10 50:19.20 major 6:22,23 13:18 39:10 45:2 majority 40:3 make 3:28 5:16 7:32 8:12,16 9:7 10:5,18 13:30.32 15:8.16.20 20.14 23.12 28 30

24:12 25:25 27:32.34

mooted 22.6

28.11 22 44.4 45.2 49:19 50:14 51:23 53:27 55:29 56:20 57:23,30 58:21,24 59:26,29 60:31 61:2,5,21,28,30 62:3 63:30 66:9,17 makes 27:9.13 46:16 55:10 57:34 66:11 making 7:29 9:29 12:28.30 52:23 53:28 55:8 58:19 61:6,34 62:34 63:21 man 23:31 54:2 manage 33:12 56:22 managed 16:1 management 5:2,4 60:22.23 68:25 managing 35:2 mandatory 57:2 many 8:20 11:5 26:13 36:22,23,33 37:30 38:29 41:12.24 43:5 44:1 48:6.20 53:31 56:11 64:19 market 25:15 33:17.30 37:1 49:27 52:5 massive 16:22 22:5,12 45:2 51:7 master 61:14 masts 25.16 material 30:25 mathematical 6:28 matter 4:11 13:11.28 54:10 60:2 69:8 matters 1:33 2:1,28 4:16 53:33 61:12 maximum 3:21,27 13:9 may 1:5 2:17 26:9 30:29 34:16 44:1.2 45:16 46:27,28 49:14 50:32 51:1 54:16 58:4 61:18 65:27 maybe 8:31 10:25 11:8 12:24 17:11 22:25,28 23:11 26:32 35:34 43:26 46:23.29 48:5 54:21 57:18.20 64:7.19.20 65:1.12 67:5,25,34 68:6,21,25 69:3 meals 17:26 mean 14:12 17:15 22:32 48.3 64.29 65.17 means 46:9,10 58:18 60:8 meantime 32:3 55:20 measure 26:18 mechanism 33:28 61:22,23 64:6 media 34:3 46:30 medicine 17:27 medium 34:13 35:26 37:18 50:31.32 meet 9:34 11:16,31 64:20 meetings 1:3,4 12:9 21:1,4 29:27 43:18 61:14,15 member 10:9 28:12 39:14 42:28.29 43:19 46:23 55:30 60:15 61:15 63:10.11.12 members 1:24 14:15 19:34 20:8,9 21:28 27:16,28 29:25 33:6 35:27 39:9 45:27 46:6 48:1.8 55:18 60:16.23 62:20.27 65:26.29 66:5.10.28 68:18,23,24,26 70:11 memory 14:22 20:13 23:34 mentioned 15:26 16:11 18:21 23:18 25:34 38:4.24 44:26.32 48:18 49:7 52:33 61:3.12 64:10.14 merits 68:18

mess 65:4 messing 16:27 met 23:13 33:20.31 35:12 36:26 37:23 40:7,27 41:17 51:30 meter 24:27 metering 24:26 method 25:8.10 methods 25:7 31:7 middle 6:27 10:18 33:6 48:7 might 6:29 13:11,23 20:14 33:1 42:14,15,16 43:15 51:4,9 54:9 58:27 60:28 61:10.18.31 70.3mightn't 21:23 54:17 58:27 migrated 2:34 24:23 mile 57:28 miles 15:5 million 2:15,27 3:5,7,17,32 4:1,3,5,6,7,11,12,13,2 5,27,29,30 5:1,8,12 6:2,4 7:4,6 8:11 9:33,34 10:6,34 11:1,2,4 15:6,7,8 17:23 18:11,15,16,28 19:11,12,13,14,23,31 20:1.26.28.31.33.34 21:5.8.9.10 23:20 25:4.20 26:27 27:12 28:22 41:30 millions 23:21 mind 13:11 20:7,12,19 24:8,9 37:13 43:3,28 56.23 25 57.16 mindset 38.1 minimum 4:3,4 27:1 66:31 ministerial 23:22 minor 48:2 minority 63:18 minus 3:27 minute 13:1 18:4 24:16 minutes 1:4,9 24:9 miscellaneous 5:4 missed 58:28 misspent 23:21 misunderstood 51:4 mobile 25:15 61:34 model 34.17 moment 2:20 3:5.22.23 5:1.8 6:18 9:34 10:3 14:13 23:23 24:28 26:27 31:25,26 32:18 33:14 34:2,12,28 42:8 43:25,33 44:4,11 47.11 15 50.34 51.1 52:11 53:9 59:8 63:9 67:34 money 7:15,24 8:15,31 9:4,5,10,11,20,21,24 10:7 12:28 13:5,20 14:33 15:28,31 16:13,15,19 17:5 18:9,16,18,19,23 19:23.26 21:2.11.25.26 22:10.14.30 23:4,20,22,26 27:21,27 28:5,12 30:29 34:25 39:21.25.29 40:4.5.10 43.4 48.30 31 monies 27:27 35:25 month's 19:27 69:9,11 month 5:32 6:27 12:25,26 23:24,25 26:26 40:19 61:15 67:10 monthly 21:4 months 10:11 19:32 33:16,27 46:10 50:14 51:32 53:18.21 54:21 62:23 67:10 70:14

more 5:28 6:11 9:4.11 10:13.21 11:5.7.20 14:6,25 15:7,22 16:13,18 17:31,32 22:14,16 30:3,5 31:7,19 32:29 34:19.29 36:30 38:7 39:21 40:5.10 41:6,23,34 47:12 48:1.21.34 49:13 52:7 54:2,29,31 55:29 56:14 59:6 62:3 63:4 65:12,26,27,28 66:4,26,33,34 67:4,9 68. morning 1:9,16,22 23:15 47:8 mortgage 27:8 37:33 59:31 mortgages 6:34 most 11:16 14:4 30:21 31:15 35:11 48:33 61:27 motions 65:21 move 31:28 32:21 37:11 42:4,17,24 49:6 52:2 53:7 54:22 moved 44:2 49:3 movement 53:8 54:1 moving 30:21 32:18 33:15 34:26 35:11 52:15 much 4:23 7:10 9:22 13:33 20:25 22:27 31:18 32:12,29 33:1,28 41:23 42:1,26,32 43:28 49.33 52.19 21 59.17 65:23 66:26,33,34 70:15 multiple 57:14,15 58:4 must 3:28 4:16 6:11 8:13 20:33 50:33 56:15 66:21 myself 3:19 11:14 21:18 25:23 30:25 36:25 47:16 53:29 57:14 64:23 myth 13:25,27 Manager 10:25 21:26 Mara 31:3 MATTHEWS 10:33 27:5,10 41:3 59:16 61:27 67:7.15 68:11,16,31 69:26,28,29,33,34 70:3,8,10,15,16,17 McDonald 9:31 39:32 53:33 Meeting 1:1,10 4:33 13:28.29 18:33 19:27 21:12.13 28:23 36:6.8 41:16.18 44:23 47:17 50:25 54:20,26 56:29 60:30 61:16 64:7,27 69:9,11,32 70:28,29,31,32 71:1 Meteor 25:2 Michael 10:21 Mickey 16:31 Minister 23:23 39:28 Ministers 39:25 Mitchell's 17:15 MITCHELL 15:25,26 Monaghan 19:21,22,24 27:1 64:24.26 Monday 69:32 70:12,28,30,33 Motion 11:13 12:10 67:20,23 70:28 Mountainview 49:7 Mouse 16:31 Municipal 1:22,23,24,29 3:16 7:26.29 8:28.30 11:5 12:9.15 16:2 18:20.25 30:20.22

35:6 36:22.24 39:19 45.23 52.28 MURPHY 11:14 47:29 N name's 59:22 name 1:16 57:32 58:11 63:3 64:29 66:15 names 58:8 nationally 14:7 56:28 nationwide 39:9 nature 55:30 near 35:15 39:1 50:1,25 51:2 nearer 44:22 nearly 20:33 33:7 44:25 necessarily 17:11,12 53:3 58:19 necessary 14:6 52:1 54:32 55:12 58:26,32 neck 56:10 need 2:33 4:3 6:22,29 9:20,21,22 11:7,26 18:9,27 19:32 20:18,27,28 21:18,22,25 24:28,33 30:15 31:2 32:13 33.2 29 31 34.28 37:23 39:5.33 40:29 41:31 42:8,27,30,32 43:10 45:4 46:28 47:19,29 48:8 52:21,29,30 53:2,3,19,20 56:6 57:10.32 59:3.5.7.8 61:29 62:18 needed 24:32 27:26 39:11 41:19 needing 52:4 needless 36:11 46:12 needs 4:4 6:31 7:10 17:10 33:20,33 34.13 21 42.16 46.25 48:6 51:14 52:30 negative 15:21 neglected 47:11 negotiations 47:18 63:7 neighbour 63:21 neighbours 48:24 neither 64:30 net 4:6 26:33 network 2:14 25:8,13,14,15,17 never 9:22 12:19 14:26 22:11 23:30 24:13 30:33 37:12 39:28 43.1 2 47.24 52.34 53:1 58:9 59:2,28 63:26 nevertheless 36:18 new 21:30 26:22 33:24 35:5 39:16 41:30 47:7 50:33 51:5,17 56:32,34 57:8 60:16 64.8 news 23:24 39:32 newspaper 5:19 next 1:14 10:11 19:10,32 31:27 32:17,23 33:24 35:7 36:15 39:3,22 40:12 43:34 44:16 48:5 50:3 51:4,17,25 52:17 54:19 58:5 59:15 60:11.12 63:21 69:8.32 70:12.28.33 nice 39:3 nicer 52:19 night 47:25 nightmare 61:19 nillv 14:30 nine 15:31 29:8,15 34:16 54:3 59:24 nobody 14:2 18:8,18 40:22 51:8 59:28 nominated 69:20 non 1:25 2:5,6,33,34 3:6 7:14 8:1 18:16 24:20 32:32 34:16 38:2 51:18.22

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

none 14:4 19:3 35:30 42:8 54:9 nonsense 17:6 nor 21:26 62:15 64:30 normal 30:27 normally 25:21 26:21 66:19 north 17:16 30:30 37:21 not 1:3 2:19.20 3:1.9 5:16,28 6:30 7:14.15.20 8:2.30 9:6,11,16,23 10:8,15,24 11:17,20,23 12:1,4,10,30 13:1,5,16,17,28 14:3,27,30 15:1 16:5,6,12,15,20 17:7.11.12.13 18:4,11,32 20:23 21:23 22:13,21,23,27 23:8,10,13,33 24:11,13,24,29 25:23 26:3,30 27:34 28:2 note 1:4 11:27 55:9,31 58:23 nothing 3:34 9:20 13:11 17:27 36:31 37:8 64:2 notice 33:18 47:23 noticed 30:25 notification 8:21,22 32:13 notifications 57:2 notified 3:28 notion 42:4 nuisance 63:19 number 1:10,25 2:14 8.22 23 25 16.10 19:18 21:12 22:22 25:15 27:24.30 29:10 30:31 31:16 34:12,27 35:28,32 39:4 40:18 42:27 45:11,23,24,25 46:2 49:4,5,6,27 54:6 56:18.19 63:15 68:1 numbers 2:31 25:15 61:34 numerous 21:33 35:31 36:9 nuts 8:10 National 5:15 17:25 22:21 25:3 26:3 27.11 29.32 35.24 46:33 47:32 Networks 25:2.3 Newtownmountkennedy 12:19 45:19 50:10 Nicky 39:6 Nicola 58:16 60:7 Nolan 11:14 November 1:14.28 4:33 5:6 26:28 70:32.33 Now 1:22.34 2:10.12.32 3:19,22 4:10,19,25,32 5:16,22 6:17,19 8:7 13:11 14:9,19 16:10,19 17:9 18:3,14 19:27 22:3.5.7.8 24:2.17.24.25 27:2.33 29:17 30:34 31:5,10 32:3,17 33:19 34:15,16,21 35:10,23 37:3,15,22 40:6 41:16 42:7,8 44:26 47:6 49:13 50:7 52:16,19, O o'clock 29:17,20 59:30 70:33 objection 56:1 obligation 15:2 33:22 obligations 56:8 obsolescence 25:9 obstacles 63:4 obvious 64:4,5 occasion 51:27

occasions 12:17 35:31,34

41:12 68:1

occupation 36:23 occupied 36:24 46:12 occupying 25:11 occur 1:5 odd 9:33 10:3 37:27 off 2:18 9:24 19:14,16 23:17 26:15 34:31 36:10 39:26 41:23 43.33 44.32 45.34 47:2 49:12 52:24 62:25 66:14 offered 34:7 offering 3:20 22:13 office 2:18,21 10:2,4 27:23 43:20 46:29 55:2 58:28 59:11.27 64:2 66:17 67:13 officer 27:22 61:7 official 1:3 36:16 61:30 officially 57:19 officials 20:34 36:3,6,8,18 39:15,17,25 58:27 61:3,19 62:31,32 63:2,25 66:1 68:9,31 70:12 old 15:31 26:22 30:34 39:2 49:4 61:13 62:31 older 50:34 once 32:7 33:27 51:16 52:17 59:3 60:22 one 1:10,14,21 2:14 5:14,31 6:29 8:20,23 11:16 13:15 14:19,21,28 16:6,14 18:1,14 20:8 21:34 22:22 26:32 27:20 28:10.14.15.20 29:8,15 30:9,23,33 31:4.16 32:20.25 34:3,15,20 35:3,19 36:7,23,28 37:12 38:34,11 39:16 40:15 41:14,23,27 43:22.29.32.33.34 44:34.6 ones 7:24 16:11 21:6 30:14 32:24,34 33:1 36:9 only 2:21 10:3 12:19 13:1,8 14:19 16:32 17:20 23:7,15 26:16 28:19 31:6 32:34 35.30 36.25 38.11 18 47:3 50:7 59:10 61:6 65:22 66:15,18 67:27 69:21 onto 36:15 37:1,4 54:15 64:1 onus 56:14 open 39:24 41:4 49:10 67:11 opener 47:29 opening 41:2 54:4 operate 34:33 69:16 operated 15:17 operating 25:12 operation 60:4 operational 25:13 opinion 38:22 62:19 68:26.27.28 opportunity 6:6,7 13:22 20:30 22:12 41:14 43:14 50:14 oppose 20:12 opposed 30:28 46:33,34 option 12:16 34:31 40:31 49:34 50:1 63:32 69:5 optional 12:22 options 35:12 order 21:5 24:27 28:17 38:14 42:30 61:5,17 69.9 organisation 55:11.33 56:3.8 58:25 60:18 62:19 65:32 68:33

organisations 57:1.2 organising 24:27 original 31:5 originally 15:31 31:13,17 32:29 34:16 52:19 other 2:33 8:10 11:1,22 14:15,32 15:8,27 16.15 18 21 17.16 22 18:2.14 19:14.15.18 20:2.22 22:17 23:20 25:1.7 26:27.33 28:2 29:29 30:6 31:7 32:14,24 33:1 40:1 42:3,14 44:23 45:15 46:7,27 48:23 50:16 52.4 53.33 54:18.22.27 56:11 60:16,28,34 61:12,32 64:17.2 others 5:22,33 15:17 29:3 30:5 31:3 37:12 61:17 otherwise 17:12 26:8 46:1 47:23 our 1:27 2:14,21,31,34 3:23.32 4:3,7,12,27,33 5:8,14,15 7:9,20 8:1,6,30 9:13,24 11:15 12:15,23 15:22 17.3 18:10.12.20.24.25.34 19:5,26,31 20:9,18,30 21:1.2.4.7.23.24.28 23:18 24:21 27:7,16 31:26 32:8,34 34:19 35:2,4 36:7 38:29,33 39:23 40:2.5.8 41:17 45.5 ours 15:30 ourselves 15:23 35:7 65:10 66:1 67:9 out 1:30 3:10 4:24 5:19 6:13,14,26 7:5,10 8:1,3 9:11 10:5,6,21 11:30 14:1 15:17.30 18:11 21:15.23 22:14,34 23:6.7.19 24:2.3 25:17.20 26:26,33 29:33 30:25 31:5 32:24,28,34 33:26 35:6,32 36:1,11,18,25,30 37:3.6.7.25 38:4.14 39.4 42.1 22.26 44:3.15 45:5.7 46 outdoor 21:13,14 outline 11:8 outlined 12:1 17:1 30:8 57:26 outside 32.24 outstanding 53:4 over 2:34 8:11 11:6 12:16 13:34 16:2 18:19 20:14 21:8,9 24:17,23 27:16,24 30:19 33:8,14,19 35:3 38:30 39:3,11,22 41.5 10 43.20 44:14,21 45:25 48:13 51:12 53:31 62:34 overall 1:25 7:10 13:13 19:6 30:28 45:16 51:20,22 52:29 overburdened 22:14 overdoing 63:6 overhaul 6.23 overnight 44:28 45:5 overturned 58:14 own 7:6,27 9:13 12:15 16:26 18:20 20:2,9 21:2 22:3,4,15 30:28 33:30 37:25,32,34 39:23 40:8.13 42:13,20 43:3 47:10 59:33 66:17 ownership 27:9 41:24 owns 43:2

O'BRIEN 6.10 11 22:29.30 28:12 44:28 66:6.8 67:18.25 CONNOR 42:2,28,33 48:28,29 58:14,15 **O'Leary** 10:21 O'Neill 23:16,31 24:1,2,5 36:21 41:17 44:25 Obviously 20:16 21:7 23:4 27:28 37:15,23 42:2.7.9 44:2 45:12 53:23 57:8 59:23 65:25 67:27 October 33:26 Okay 1:21 3:26 22:29 29:16.27 51:11 55:6 66:1 67:6 70:20 Ordinary 6:30 13:4 22:5 70:29 Oversight 5:15 Р pack 68:2,3,4,5,21 69:16 page 6:12,17,26 22:20,22 paid 7:24 13:2 15:31 19:13 21:14 pain 56:9 paper 34:3 46:30 61:32 62:2 papers 18:5 paperwork 59:32 paragraph 55:33 68:32 69:6 paramount 18:24 paranoid 65:12 park 38:25 52:8 parked 52:15 parochialism 46:19 part 21:28 26:5,14 30:7 31:33 32:8,13,15,19,30 33:15 34:30 35:19.23 39:23 45:12.28 50:6.26.33 51:6,7,8,15,16 52:10 55:30 57:11 61:21,25 67:3,4,5 68:2 partaking 45:32 particular 6:21 15:2 18:22 20:19 21:13.22 27:20.32 34:4.13.26 35:8,31 36:17 41:1,14 43:22 44:6 50:26,27 52:22,29 53:13 57:14,18 61:14,15 62:30 64:12 particularly 17:14 27:26 28:7,21 30:5 35:3 37:21.34 38:28 39:10 43:6 44:8,9,34 53:31 56:8 57:8,26 parties 18:2 partnership 34:10 parts 19:15 37:30 46:6,7 pass 22:13 32:26 67:20 passed 65:22 70:11,28 passionately 15:20 past 13:6 16:1 38:30 39:24 59:27 60:16 61:12,14 62:29 66:29 68:1 pay 2:10,15 6:31 8:3 10:13 12:26 14:1,2,6 17:23.25 19:22 21:14.32 22:1,3,4,15,21 23:32 25:34 26:34,2,3 27:11 33:17,30,31 35:7 38:27 payer 2:22 payers 3:20 paying 2:13 7:1 8:15 9:7 10:17,18,19 11:20 13:11 14:3,4 16:30 17:21 20:15 22:10 24:12 48:24 payments 40:7 pays 33:16 pedal 39:26

penalised 10:31 penalties 57:3 pence 60:9 pending 4:13 penny 17:10,27 pension 2:10,15 23:23 27:6,11 people's 9:11 13:3 people 3:10 6:13,31,34 7:1,20,23,24,28,31,32 8:17 9:3,4,6,7,10,11,14,16, 19,21,23,24 10:11,15,17,18,20 11:17,30,32 12.24 26 32 13:11,13,18,30,33 14:4,5,9,11,14,19.27. 29,32 15:2,5,16,34 16:29,31,32 17:1,7,12,17,21 18:3,24 19:16,23,29 20:3,6,11,17,27,29 21:2 per 2:27 5:32 6:3 16:19 39:3.4 41:32 percent 5:27 33:17 percentage 22:24 25:15,21 47:31 period 1:14 4:17 68:12 permission 55:2 58:9 61:3.32 permissions 57:9 permitting 33:25 person's 61:9 person 53:18 57:30 59:22 60:12 61:34 62:9,13 63:3,31 64:20 67:21 69:20 personal 55:9.12.33 56:34.3.8.10 58:23.26 59:4 61:6 68:34 personally 13:32 64:13 pertaining 64:21 phase 30:23 35:10 52:16 phone 59:22 62:33 phoned 59:25 physical 25:16 pick 21:34 45:11 picking 49:12 50:7 piece 42:6 45:28 61:32 62:2 pile 30:28 pillars 30:2 pilot 33:32 38:4,24 53:14 place 2:12 13:25 16:2 31:1,23 32:14,20 33:10,32 45:8,28,34 46:13 50:13 52:19 55:34 61:24 66:30 67:34 68:10 places 7:29.30 13:14 43:6 44:26 58:6 planned 38:20 planner's 66:10,32 planner 61:24 63:33 66:31 planners 61:18,19 66:33.34 67:3.5 planning 3:29 11:11 31:2.30 45:29 52:5 56:9.12.16.17 57:9,15,30 58:8 61:12,14,16,22 62:16,33 63:11.12.13.27.29.31 64:1,2 65:32 66:8 68:21 **plannings** 62:6 **plans** 4:23 9:32 48:30 plant 40:25,27,30 41:2,18 53:34 platforms 34:29 play 7:2 21:28 23:15 37:16 playgrounds 3:14 7:17,25 16:3 18:26

playing 15:11 17:12 47:3 67.3 pleaded 39:12 pleading 39:16 please 8:10,32 9:31 23:34 27:29 48:32 54:18 55:16,20 65:24 67:17 plenty 23:20,26 plumbers 43:10 45:3 plus 3:27 33:16 39:4 49:32 pockets 6:13 9:11 22:14 point 6:26 7:10 15:19 18:25 20:14,22 22:34 24:10,25 37:7 46:25 51.22 53.24 58.19 59:26.29 60:28 61:2.3.18.20 63:1 64:29 65:32 68:21 pointed 7:5 36:25 58:20 points 1:19 22:30 42:27 59:29 policy 34:30,32 39:8 50:33 62:20 politician 54:3 politicians 43:8 pool 1:23 pools 17:12 popular 12:4 population 16:22 25:21 35.30 populist 7:13,14,31 8:34 10:14 portrayed 1:3 poses 50:12,16 62:21 position 4:18 5:11 39:3,22 41:13,23 58:1 61.30 positive 45:15 possibility 33:9 36:3 possible 1:5 12:29 15:11 31:18,33 38:8 49:18,30 50:17 66:17 possibly 33:32 40:6 post 59:24,26 potential 25:10 potentially 19:23 38:18 power 19:19 27:16 practicalities 46:19 practice 60:28,32 praise 43:18 pre 32:12 precarious 41:23 preface 55:21 preference 41:4 preferred 34:31 premises 1:29 prepared 12:5 14:6 16:20 27:34 28:2 31:16 32:25 present 29:8.15 31:27 42:34 70:27 presentation 1:15.17 7:19 8:19 9:32 10:33 15:10 20:25 25:22 26:5 29:16,26,27 35:28 38:9,10 41:30 44:12 47:29 48:5.12.18 67:31.33 presentations 38:3 41:9 45:11 presented 22:20 47:34 presenting 34:5 presently 33:19 pressure 5:16 10:3 31:6 40.5presume 44:8 48:19.25 pretty 32:29 41:13 52:18 70:15 prevent 6:7 20:24 prevented 34:7 previous 10:1 19:30 25:12 39:7 41:23 45.10 47.4 previously 58:7 65:2 price 17:14 18:22 35:33 52:5 60:12 pride 39:19

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

primarily 35:29 principle 11:33 16:28,33 17:11.18 24:15 30:11,24 31:27 65:7 principled 24:11 priorities 14:19,28 35:13 49:3,5,16 prioritise 2:23 prioritised 50:25 prioritising 14:29 34:27 **priority** 34:24 35:12 40:22 43:29 49:11 50:30 privacy 56:24 private 18:21 33:21 35:25 37:13 41:22 43:1.11.12.13 45:27 50:22.33 53:34 privatisation 42:5,24 privileges 63:31 pro 66:3 probably 1:27,31,33 2:19 4:10.33 7:4 10:20 18:17.18 19:30 26:18 31:7 38:21 39:14,15 41:6 57:29 61:19,28,34 65:31 66:3,25 68:6 problem 7:17 11:7 26:15 29:20 36:28 39:22 40:8 44:30 53:25 59:31 60:8 64:13 65:31 66:16.27 67:4 problems 11:6 13:34 36:26 41:25,33 54:16 60:10 procedure 57:22 procedures 55:22,25 proceed 23:29 29:4 32:7.9.15 46:14 69:34 proceeding 28:29 proceedings 52:13 process 30:11 31:11,13,19 32:12,13,33 35:14,23 36:10.17 38:14 39:23 47:17 49:19 66:26.32 processes 36:12 processing 36:15 procurement 35:14 produce 14:33 produced 63:5 professionally 43:22 programme 29:29 31:5,6 35.10 36.7 39.24 27 40:24.25 41:25.33 43:5 45:3,12 50:4,5 55:26 programmes 12:1,9 29:33 progress 35:18 36:22 progressing 35:18 progression 53:7 project 32:24,33 33:32 38:5 46:7,9,11,14 53:13 57:20 projects 10:26,27,32 12:17 16:2 17:11 30:8.11.19.21 31:27,32 32:14,18,23 36:10.15 38:11.12.13 39:18 40:1.9 45:20 46:2,16 51:30,32 57:18,20 promise 10:22 promised 38:34 promoted 8:22 promotion 18:26 proper 15:23 30:15 45:8 properly 65:5 properties 2:18,20,22 3:20 5:25,27 6:34 10:2 33:14,19 34:12 35:22.23.32 36:4 48:19,20 50:13 53:15 property 1:12,13,14,18,21 3:26 6:20.29 7:5.15.27

8:34 9:27 10:13.15 11:10,16,26 12:20.22.24.31.33 13:1,3,8,13,23 15:4,20,34 16:7,20,25,26,27,28,2 9,32,33 17:1,3,14,16,20,22,27 .31.32 18:1,8,17,25,28,33 19:1.3.7.13.18.29.34 20:7,8,12 21:20 22:6,8,11 23:6,8,1 proportion 13:6 proposal 9:12,29 20:26 23:12.28.30 24:13 28:10,12,15 29:2,10 32:4 38:17 51:1 55:6,17 59:12 62:4 63:15 65:14 67:8 69:7,14,23,24,33 70:11,18,20,22 proposals 10:10 28:9,14,32 32:4 34:23,27 47:31 57:15 66:29 70:15,16 propose 10:10 12:8 22:30 28:3 proposed 9:34 14:16 28:31 29:10 35:30 38:26 42:9 65:27 69.22 70.31 proposer 70:8 proposing 9:12 11:10 14:27,32 23:13,26 24:2,14 27:31 68:15 protect 56:14 68:31 protected 58:16,17 66:24 protecting 58:15 protection 54:23,26,30,34 55:7,22 56:26,29,30,32 57:7 59:7,9,28 60:17,31 61:20 62:5,7,21 63:16,23,24,26 64:5.7.15 65:17 66:4 67:8.11.13 68:16.27.29 69:1 70:5 protocol 54:23 61:24 64:17 65:18 67:10 69:8,10,25,32 70:10,12 protocols 54:34 55:25 57:7 proven 70:13 provide 6:6 11:4,7,34 12:17,23,30 14:34 18:27 20:30 21:18,22 22:21,26 28:1 34:11,12,25,34 41:6 50:33 54:6 provided 12:7 16:19 22:21.26 41:1 54:8 provides 20:29 providing 12:2,28 36:19 43:2 54:28 provision 33:15 42:29,34 43:8.14 48:31 50:19 62.21 provisions 1:30 proximity 11:18 prudence 26:7 public 1:3 13:14,33 14:1 16:3 17:12 18:3,25 25:3 31:17,18 41:22.25 47:14 55:8,10 56:1.3.6 57:8.19.23 58:23.24 60:19,26 61:20 62:8,12,28 63:11,12,14,20,28,30, 32,34 65:5,10 66:31 67:1 68:9,19,33 69:3.5.19 publicly 12:19 39:16 pulled 29:33 punished 27:2

purchase 35:3.33 36:1 purchased 45:21 49:28 purchasing 35:3 36:3 purpose 2:32 28:23 51:13 purposes 1:2 pursue 16:13 pushing 49:10 50:6 put 2:7 5:19 6:31 7:2 8:25 11:14 12:18.20 13:22 15:21 20:34 22:9,32 23:2 28:13 30:9 31:19 32:14,32 34:11,19 40:9,28 45:8,28 46:5.8.9.15.25.30 47:14 52:25 53:20 54:34 55:6 57:31.32 58:32 60:23 62:13,15 63:4 64:1 65:10,12 66:15 67:10 68:14 69:24 70:8,11 puts 37:6 56:34 putting 3:9 7:19 9:12 10:16 15:16 18:19 32:28 33:32 35:24 38:14 40:5 46:10 51:34 52:10 58:8 61:30 68:23 Palermo 43:6 Party 20:10 62:27 Pat 26:1,15 27:29 29:10 47:16 Payment 33:3,24 54:7 Payroll 11:2,4 27:10,11 Perhaps 37:26 43:15 65:11 Plan 1:22 5:13 26:25 31.29 43.8 46.8 50:24.28 51:26 65:21 70:32 PPP 35:23 Press 59:20 PRSI 21:31 0 qualify 65:34 quality 12:26,27 21:3 quantity 32:26 42:30 46:10 queries 49:29 question 8:23,25 10:33 18:19 20:10 22:22 25:1,34 26:1,14 36:31 40:12,24 42:3 44:31 47:30 51:4,9 53:17 58:27 62:22 questions 7:34 15:18 18:14 19:6 22:19,20 23:6.13 24:18 35:27,28 38:11 39:34 42:4 48:11,27 49:3 52:22 67:21,26 quick 1:17 15:18 18:20 35:28 39:34 53:17 quicker 35:3 38:15 70:13 quickly 27:29 31:33 43:11 49:30 50:17 52:2 66:30 quiet 3:9 quite 24:12 26:17 33:7 37:31 54:27,28 56:12 60:16 62:4 63:12,30 67:18 69:6 R radar 37:29 raise 62:31 raised 16:7 19:23 47:8 ran 52:28 rang 53:21 60:3 rate 1:12 3:20,27 4:13,16,19,29 5.9 22 23 31 7.26

10:28 11:24,29 12:33

17:3 18:29 20:5,7

23:1 25:29 26:16

27:2 33:31 37:32

rateable 25:7

rated 2.14 rates 1:28.29 2:4.5.10.12.13.17.19. 22 3:4,15,19,23,24 4:18 5:9 6:13 8:20 10:1,17 13:2 15:5,6 17:2,25 20:12 21:21,32 22:1 23:10 24:19 25:28,30,31 26:13,18,34 rather 15:21 29:16 34:34 59:7 rating 35:34 reach 37:6 read 9:18 67:18,19 readdress 63:8 reading 23:23 25:22 36:28 48:15 reads 24:27 ready 29:25 real 6:29 10:27 11:20 18:7 19:2 47:18 62.23 realise 55:30 63:34 realistic 35:33 54:5 63:24 reality 11:32 13:20 34:4,7 47:27 really 7:30 8:2 10:30 11:6 12:22 14:25 18:31 26:22 27:13 31:10.18.32 36:33 37:2 38:30 39:6 46:15 50:11 55:16 56:22 58:29 59:5,6,8 62:9 63:19 64:26,27,33 65:5,12 66:6 realm 18.25 realtime 1:1,2 reapply 51:17 reason 20:23 27:33 31:10 32:6,30 46:34 66:15 reasonable 32:31 55:34 reasoning 31:21 reasons 7:4 recall 39.74 receipt 33:15,27 40:7 47:2 receipts 25:9 receive 4:17 29:26 39:27 received 4:10 25:31 26:29 34:27 62:20 67.24 68.26 receiving 45:32 47:1 recent 34:19 recently 34:23,30 35:19 36:7 45:20,21 47:7 48:29 52:18 recipients 33:29 reckon 3:33 4:4.27 recognise 7:13 27:15 42:19,22 58:17 60:24 66:21 recognised 42:16 recommend 69:14 recommendation 63:33 66:32 recommending 61:7 record 47:14 records 56:11,13,14 66:2 recoup 3:2 recreation 5:3 recycling 3:15 7:25 12:25 54:4 reduce 4:29 5:16,31 6:1,2,3,12 7:4,14,20,31 8:15 9:14.27 10:25.31 11:29 12:8,10,30 13:4,8,15,22,23 14:9,30,34 19:5,19 20:2 22:12 23:1 27:34 31:16 62:1 reduced 2:31.32 9:28 15:8.34 19:18.21 20:8 26:34 27:1 45:14

reducing 8:6,34 10:15 12:4 15:19.24 16:31 reduction 5:21,32 6:15,27 7:9 9:12 10:34 11:33 13:27,31 14:11,13,16,26,27 15:1 16:7,26 19:21 23:8.13 27:31 28:4 reductions 14:17 refer 11:3 55:31 65:33 69:10 referred 9:32 26:32 69:8 refreshed 47:30 refunding 24:24 refuse 13:16 regard 4:16 7:34 8:8,12 13:34 14:20.26.34 15:3 21:16 23:6.9 28:1 45:10 51:8 62:4 regarded 14:4 regarding 27:20 38:25 40:2 49:29 50:5 regards 18:34 19:6,15 20:7.26 36:6.9 41:16,30 45:11,13,16,27,28,30 46:5.6.22 47:4,8,15,26 48:19 52:22,32 53:13 54:26 57:15 62:10,22,23,29,34 63:11 68:29 regime 33:18 region 18:21 regional 25:3 regs 58:33 regular 49:29 rehashing 11:22 reinforced 42:34 reject 13:22 39:29 rejected 36:11,17 related 2:6,10,15 3:6 50:1 relating 24:30 25:13 relation 1:18 5:14,19 6:18 11:15 21:19 24:19 25:1.30 26:6.29.32.33 29:19 31:15 37:20 38:3,17,24,28 44:14 56:23 61:22,25 64:12,13 relationship 67:2 relationships 53:6,15 relative 25:21 relay 57:21 relaying 67:27 release 55:9,12,34 56:1,4 58:23,25 66:1 68:34 released 56:1,4 66:3 68.34 relevant 22:31 25:11 relief 1:29 relooking 50:24 **relving** 37:12 remain 44:5 70:6 remains 4:29 19:29,30 20:28 remarks 44:29 55:21 remediated 52:18 remediating 52:15 remember 13:34 16:1 20:33 27:20 32:23 39:15,16 49:32 61:4,13 remind 20:9 remit 19:5.18 31:18 remove 44:10 47:9 67:7 removed 37:24 44:7 46:31 47:2 removing 67:12 reneging 18:4 renew 29:18 renewal 25:14 rent 23:24.25 33:16,27,29,30 37:22 40:7 43:1,2 47:2

48:22.24.25 51:4.5.6 59.34 rental 30:3.6 33:3.14.24 49:27 50:1,2 52:32,33 rented 37:13,16 53:34 60:4 renting 41:24 rents 40:2 51:9,10 rep 13:33 63:30 66:9 69:19 repair 20:18 replace 13:28 64:6 replacement 25:8 49:32 reply 23:19 report 1:18 2:17 4:20 5.15 33 6.11 27.7 37:9 46:22 48:15 66:10 reports 2:4,33 25:12 26:6 61:4 repossessions 36:32 represent 20:11 21:30 28:2 41:17 68:24.28 representation 55:8.11.13 58:24 59:2.4 61:7 62:16.30 63:30 69:2 representational 55:29 representations 25:25 56:16,20 58:19 61.5 22 28 34 62.34 representative 55:10 56:1,3,7,18 63:29,32,34 68:34 69:3,5 representatives 13:14 54:32 55:8,10 56:6 57:19.23 58:23.24 61.20 62.8 13 28 63:14 66:31 67:1 68:19 represented 55:24 representing 60:25 represents 62:19 reprimanded 62:27 reps 57:9 62:13 65:5,10 68.9 22 request 11:15 40:24 61:16 63:12 requested 5:12 23:1 56:29 requests 63:29 required 27:1 51:25 54:31 58:19 61:5 67:13 requirement 4:3 17:10 55:7 56:10 59:9 60:23 62:5 67:7,9,12,15,22 68:29,30 70:1,5 requirements 56:26,34 60.30 requiring 58:15 reserve 50:21 reserved 3:26 6:6 resident 16:19 residents 12:18 20:19 38:26 resolve 3:26 resort 34:8 resources 33:25 38:13 43:7 46:9,12,15 51:1 52:26 respect 24:10 respond 24:8 53:18 55:12 responding 43:21 response 11:24,27 44:8 54:17 65:25 responsibility 11:11 14:14,15 21:23,24,28 22:19 33:28 37:22 56:26 responsible 67:19 rest 11:21 48:34 restrained 66:34 result 20:17 38:17 46:16 results 65:29 66:12

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

retained 4.34 retrograde 68:6 return 9:20.22 returned 4:27 33:9 53:25 revaluation 8:10 revaluations 2:9 revenue 3:28,33 5:1.14.25 25:10.16 review 5:13 34:19 61:21 64:33.34 reviewed 55:16.24 reviewing 55:22 revisions 2:17 revisit 50:27 rich 10:20 rid 19.1 ridiculous 43:13 right 1:15 4:4 6:2 12:4 14:22 18:7 24:6,11 26:9,16 28:14 29:21 37:12 42:18 43:16 48:26 53:29 54:13 55:1 57:2 61:9 64:30 66:8 69:27.31 70:33 rightly 14:19 rights 61:24 rigmarole 57:10 ring 59:27 61:28 69:2,5 ringfenced 34:26 ringing 40:19 58:8 64:11 rise 45.30 56.4 69.1 risk 34:6 43:33 road 2:5,26,29 5:2 15:2 21:10 32:28 52:16 54:13 63:3 roads 21:3,4,7 62:6 robbing 22:31 rocks 38:17 role 18:34 23:18 37:16 55:29,30 56:6 67:1 rolled 38:4 rolling 33:26 35:10 40:24 53:14 roof 45:25 rose 51:27 round 57:28 58:21 route 43:12 rule 60:17 62:7 rules 13:20 60:21 run 13:20 47:9,11 runner 38:2 running 17:2,29 31:4 32:34 39:1 45:8 69.17 rural 51:21 57:26 Rathdown 40:15 Rathdrum 32:3,8 51:15 Rathnew 12:20 18:21 45:21 RAS 27:8 33:14,19,21 37:20,21,22 40:6 43:1 49:32 52:32 53:6.7.8.11 Rebuilding 30:2 Reform 31:17 51:33 55:23 Roche 39:28 RTE 25:3 RUTTLE 11:14 41:9 42:28 48:13 57:25 58:10.13.20 59:13 60:9 61:12 65:27 69:12,13,20 Ryan 7:11,12 9:5 11:34 12:14 24:18,30 25:19.25 28:4 29:10 S sad 36:33 safety 5:2 said 2:11 3:4 4:32 8:33 9:33 11:10.34 14:19,22 15:10,14,32 18:1,23 19:29 20:11,29 22:19 23:9 26:5 31:4 35:10 36:12.14 41:10

42.6 23 28 43.18

44:18 49:8 51:14

53:13,33 58:3,16 59:8.29.34 60:1.5.9.19 61:27 63:21 64:10,17,18,34 65:8 66:4,8 67:13 69:13,15 salaries 21:9,10 23:22 salary 23:25 59:33,34 same 12:20 16:6 17:33 19:30 21:26 27:1 31:21 32:27 33:28 38:21 40:14,30 44:23 46:13 48:24 60:18 62:16 64:17 67:21 70:15 satisfied 55:34 56:6,15 satisfies 67:14 satisfy 35:14 60:25 66:1 68:10 save 12:25 40:16,20 60:12 saved 14:33 48:31 savings 26:30 say 2:28 3:11 4:3,4 5:14 6:11 7:9,31 8:3 9:10 10:2 11:11.13.23.26 12:14,22,24 13:11,12 14:9,10,14,29,30 16:26 17:34 18:8 21:23 22:13 26:16,30 27:30.32.34 31:22 32:3.29 36:11.31 37:11 38:7 39:8.32 40:17 44:5.28.29 45:27 46:12,22,34 47:20,29,30 50:9 51:12,3 saying 2:7,32 3:9 4:25 7:15 9:5 14:19.20 16:27 17:1 23:8 24:23.29.32 26:9 28:29 44:33 45:4 46:8 49:11 50:12 51:19 52:20 53:13 55:21 64:28 68:4 69:19 70:4 says 11:24 18:10 19:2 54:31 58:26 59:18 67:18.19 scan 57:27 scanning 69:18 scare 26:26 scenario 41:26 scenes 47:30 schedule 1:29 scheme 2:6 3:15,19.24 8:20,21,23 22:23 25:28,30 26:18 27:8 33:3,4,14,19 34:20,23,24 37.2.21.34 38:1.4.6.24 39:19 40:12,13,14,15,28,30 41:1.30 42:22 44:17 45:8 46:33 47:3,9,12 48:22,25 49:11,20 50:1 51:6,8,11 53:13 schemes 7:26 29:30 30:6 37:23.26 41:1 43:9 49:2.5.9.11.12.18 school 42:15 60:18 schools 17:26 42:17,18 seat 64:2 second 2:17 9:10 22:34 24:16 26:13 28:5.10.14 36:6 37:5 55:32 59:26 67:17,29 69:2.30 seconded 14:16 29:10 69:26 seconder 9:31 65:14 seconding 65:14 70:18 seconds 24:9 28:11 section 5:5 18:33 25:33 27:21 36:13,29 38:2.27 43:19 45:29 47:5.7.8.9.10.15.16 48:7,8,23,30 50:15

53:31 54:15 62:6,8,14 63:10.11 68:32 sections 4:22.26 36:14 55:24 63:13 sector 30:3,6 33:14,24 35:25 37:13,16 43:13 45:30 50:33 52:32,33 securing 37:21 see 3:34 5:33 6:9,12,19,20 7:1.28.29 9:17.22 11:30 12:15,28 15:9 22:27 25:23 28:5 29:32 30:22,26 31:5,10,25 33:7,8,33 34:3.4 39:7.9.10.29 40:17 42:13 43:16.27.30 44:8 45:15,29 46:7 47:8,27 48:15 49:22 50:34,21,22,31 52:9 54:14 57:25 59:21,30 60:6.9.17 61: seeing 32:6 50:5 seek 32:30 seem 9:22 16:12 44:20.27 45:1 65:11 seems 9:22 10:34 18:15 22:7 23:2,7 38:11 43:13 54:1 62:32 seen 21:8 61:4 64:15 seize 55.7 self 4:7.10 15:28 semi 1:25 send 5:15 22:31 28:13 59:4,24,25 65:6 sends 69:15 senior 67:3 68:25 sense 8.12 12.32 46.16 68.18 23 sensitive 56:9,12 57:8 64:5.16 sent 22:34 23:1 26:32 32:26 46:22 48:13 49:20 52:23 55:4 sentiments 44:13 separate 30:10 48:7 separately 8:14 series 35:24 serious 18:11,22 36:3 38:31 60:4 64:15 67:34 seriously 7:7 23:18 62:9 64:16.22 serve 33:18 49:13 serves 14:22 42:5 service 1:2,4,30 5:14 9:5 10:16 12:2 13:12 17:25,26 18:24 19:9 20:29 24:20 27:8,22 66:12.23 services 3:15 4:7 5:2,3,9 6:7 7:26 9:33 10:7,14,19,29 11:11,34 12:1,23,25,26,27,30 13:24 14:2,4,5,6,31,34 16:3.8.19 17:7 18:9.11.20 19:31 20:16,20,27,30 21:4.7.18.22.27 22:7,23 26:21 27:19 28:2 44:27 set 6:23 47:7 51:17,30 67:26 setting 1:12 34:26 47:17 seven 44:21 several 39:6 severe 50:12 sewage 40:25,27 41:2 53:34 sewerage 36:27 41:14,18 shame 39:5 shape 37:29 54:34 62:14 share 8:30 10:14 22:16 25:16 shared 27:8

sharing 57:1 she'll 30.5 she's 59:23.25 65:1 she 27:22 28:22 60:3,4 63:29 shift 37:13 shifted 25:26 shock 7:12 shocking 43:32 shooting 15:24 shop 41:5 short 4:29,30 9:17 35:26 37:18 42:7 49:16 50:31,32 shortages 10:4 shortfall 9:6,7,9,34 10:1 20:1 26:25 shortly 49:6 shot 59:13 should 3:11 6:12 7:4,31 10:13 13:29,32 14:28,29 15:9,15,24,34 16:10.12.13 18:32 19:28 20:23.24 22:8,9,21,22 23:14 24:11 25:25 26:3 27:32 43:26,29,32 44:3,30 45:2 46:28 47:12 48:25 49:29 51:20 54:21 55:34 56:7 58:16.29 60:24.32.33.34 61:8,22,25 62:15 63:6. shouldn't 20:23 shovels 36:8,19 show 31:11 32:11,17 showed 26.34 showing 19:9 51:13 62:30 shows 34:17 63:5 sick 60:3 side 27:27 28:2 29:28,30 31:14,15 36:13 49:25 61:5 sides 11:14 60:19 sign 29:20 59:34 60:2,5,6 61:2 63:3 64:11.29 66.29 signal 42:4 signature 28:13 64:18 66:20 signatures 64:18 66:21 signed 54:29 57:12,15,28 59:28 60:2 63:1,2,21 64:19 66:14 68:20 significant 14:13,23 16:4 28:5 38:34 39:22 56:12,13 significantly 35:4 signing 64:30 signs 64:10 sillv 65:5 similar 11:21 17:4 similarly 56:12,18 simple 17:13 18:10 27:33 62:4 63:18,29 65:4 simpler 57:29,34 69:16 simply 65:34 since 7:27 17:5 21:21 38:30 40:3 61:21 sincerely 43:24 single 43:19 54:16 69:2 sit 47:27 site 25:9 30:25.27.29 31.26 32.8 34.31 38:18 49:14 51:21 sites 37:29,30,34 41:4,5 49.10sits 48:23 sitting 3:9 46:30 65:21 situation 7:7 15:27 18:9 19.22 22.3 27.33 37:9 38:7,8,21,31 41:12,21,27 42:6,12 43:21 44:11.14 47:9,25 48:16 50:16

52.13 54.19 61.14 64:11.21 situations 41:11 42:8 44:17 six 12:16 36:25 44:21 53:21 70:14 sizable 33:7 40:26 size 51:26 sky 29:34 slagging 23:17 slating 39:25 slender 43:7 slide 5:25 26:5 30:8 32:17,23 33:6 slightly 5:28 41:6 68:22 slip 52:24 sloping 51:21 small 6:15 13:15.31 34:29 45:24 46:14 49:11,12,13 smaller 31:3 32:20 49:18 snapshot 15:19 snippet 39:32 snook 49.14 snooze 59:20 social 8:28 11:2.8 14:7 21:32 27:6,7 30:2,4 33:2,3,6,8,20,34 35:2 39:9,18,23 40:7 41:6,25 42:5,24,31 43.8 14 49.33 50.3 52:22 53:1,8 54:8,10 society 41:26,28 solid 57:28 solution 60:24 65:27 67:5 69:9,10 solutions 35:26 solve 37:13 39:22 60:10 some 1:5 5:33 7:34 9:9 10.25 13.27 16.13 17:9 19:19 20:9.17 21:14 27:16,25 29:18,30 30:4,11 31:28 34:2 35:12,17 36:4 37:3,26 39:34 40:3.21.22 44:8 46:1.23 47:11 48:2 49:3.24.28 51:32 52:1.20 54:15.19.27 56:16 58:27 59:5 61:31,32 64:14,30 65:1,17,28 66:19, somebody's 61:7 somebody 11:10 14:10 21:14 27:15 59:12 67:32.33 68:3 someone 53:25 59:27 64:19 65:6,8 66:11 67:11 something 6:15 7:6 11:12 12:27 14:11,15,28,29,33 15:15,30 18:18 21:9.10 22:5.11.25 42:3,5 44:18,30,32 46:30,33,34 53:29 54:21 57:21,28 58:3,28,30,33 59:5,6,12 60:15 64:16.22 66:5 68:8,10,13 69:3 sometimes 12:4 21:32 39:13 58:13 60:7 somewhere 44:20 soon 51:15 52:13 sooner 15:21 50:11.14 sorry 1:9 13:16 17:33 22:18 27:11 28:24 37:2 50:30 57:3 58:14 59:18 67:32 70:18,31 sort 37:20 40:21 42:22 45:7 58:27 68:14,20 69.13 70.8 sorted 45:5 sorting 6:23 sought 32:17,23,34 46:1 50.19

sounds 10:15 source 33:30 42:13 53:15 south 54:1 space 67:10 spaces 7:29 28:6 spat 52:8 speak 17:21 40:33 46:3 59:24.30 64:20 speakers 19:30 41:10 45:10 47:4 64:17 speaking 9:16 23:1 specific 34:24 48:5 speed 38:14 speedily 69:14 spell 10:5 spend 6:20 7:27 9:24 12:16 17:5 22:15 23:21 51:1 spenders 21:25 spending 4:25 17:5 18:23 19:26 31:18 46:10 47:25 49:8 spent 6:17 16:2 28:25,28 49.7spirit 60:21 68:16 spoken 11:5 18:18 47:7 53:22 spokespersons 10:9 spread 15:27 46:18 squirrelled 19:14 staff's 46:12 staff 2:31 3:2.7 8:6 10:4 11:5,6,7 16:12 21:8.12.13.14 24:21,24,25,28,30,32 27:12 41:10 43:10,19 45:6 46:15,24 47:4,9,11,12,25 48:12.14.16 50:24.30 52:28 62:22 69:2 staffing 3:1 11:6 24:19 43:30 47:8 stage 20:14 23:14 27:33 30:9,23,26 31:13,18,22,25,27,28, 33 32:4.6.7.8.9.15.26.30 36:15 38:13,34 40:30 44:16 46:9 47:22 51:16,22,25,28,30,31 52:1,9,11,17 61:31 66:26 stages 30:10 31:14,16,19,25 32:11 36:12 45:13.14 stamp 17:20,22,23 24:12 60:10,12 stand 9:27 13:34 24:15 51:12 65:8,9 67:23 standard 5:31 32:32 33.17 40.6 8 52.18 standards 33:18 35:5 40:7 stands 9:27 13:21 standstill 17:2,29 start 6:10 7:4 11:2,34 18:31 24:18 30:11 31:26 46:1 started 18:3 49:13 52:19.20 starting 1:10 37:11 50:31 60:28 70:31,32 stated 10:21 64:4 statement 23:10 65:32,34 statements 56:24 states 55:10 68:32 stating 50:33 62:19 statistics 34:8 stats 34:2 statutory 1:27 32:13 47:23 staying 10:28 stealth 16:30 step 68:6 steps 20:24 stick 23:34 24:10 50:4,5

31:13,21 36:1,2 37:16 44:16 45:14 46:28 49:2,5 52:15 53:18 59:13 65:9 66:1 68:2 69:14 70:6.11 stock 20:18 30:3,7 35:2 40:1,2,6,8 50:34 stole 50:9 stood 17:32 stop 9:22 15:15 stopped 13:6 39:28 42:25 story 7:23 61:6 straight 7:13 22:32 26:15 31:33 straightforward 69:17 stream 38:7 45:17 54:20 streamline 62:3 66:18 streamlined 34:30 56:15 59:6 61:23 62:1.3 65.26 67.9 streamlining 65:18 streams 45:15 streets 23:32 stress 44:18 55:28 stresses 56:6 stretch 15:4 stretched 30:30 strongly 59:2 62:20 67:2 68:26 structure 49:3 struggle 50:12 struggling 50:3 stuff 6:18 10:4 15:18 17:12 31:14 32:6 44.13 52.14 57.27 subject 56:15 submission 51:25 submissions 5:21 22:34 23:34,4,7 26:29 51:31 submit 4:23 32:4 51:27 submitted 36:13 41:32 51.18submitting 69:4 subscribers 25:15,16 subsequent 1:2 subsidies 5:9 11:1 15:7 27:5 subsidise 22:11 42:34 subsidising 22:8 subsidy 27:9 substantial 16:8 40:31 success 34:17 successful 37:31 38:1 succinctly 17:1 such 16:11 20:18 23:8,28,30 31:7 38:31 46.11 52.6 56.4 64.6 65:20 68:34 69:15 sudden 44:15 suddenly 44:1 sufficient 15:12 suggest 59:12 63:15 68:11,25 69:8 suggested 6:22 10:25 15:34 20:16 37:8 70.12suggesting 10:25 64:25 68:21 suggestion 64:7 suggestions 62:2 suitable 34:32 36:1 49:29 60:5 68:12 69:27 70.521suite 55:24 **summary** 32:25 **summer** 30:19 supplement 33:16,27,29 37:22 43:1 supplied 18:16 supplies 16:14 supply 18:12,16 29:28,30 35:21 37:16,20 42:32 support 8:8 9:18 11:33 13:2 14:25 16:20

still 4.29 8.1

16:26,28,32,33 17:18

19:19.30 20:34 21:5

24:28,32 30:29

17:2.4 20:26 22:15 23:8 24:14 27:26,27 33:3,21,25,29,33,34 34:7,13,14,17,21 50:10,20 53:1,14 54:7 59:12 61:16 62:16 supported 8:12 11:14 14:25.26 27:21.24.25 34:13.16.19.20 48:15 supporting 12:10 16:7 17:18 27:23 supports 34:11 suppose 3:22 6:1 24:31 25:1 26:25 27:15 33:26 41:12 51:12 57.10 62.3 4 supposed 8:17 21:30 31:30 sure 1:16 5:16 6:9 10:24 13:29 19:1 35:27 42:19,33 44:4 54:27 60:16 62:3 63:18 67:19 69:5 surplus 4:5 15:6.7 22:24 surprise 56:17 surprised 15:17 60:16 surrounding 38:6 57:18 survey 65:29 surveyors 32:26 46:10 suspect 15:1 23:12 swallow 19:24 swamped 27:23 swimming 17:12 sympathetic 41:11 sympathy 11:31 sync 50:17 system 15:31 23:14 24:27 40:21 51:13 61:33 64:6 66:30.33.34 67:4.11.34 68:1,12,13,20 69:9,27 70:1,5 Saturday 59:30 60:2 Seanad 42:29 September 1:7 3:28 40:28 49:22.24 51:28 Shay 16:24 18:6,8 57:5,6 68:17.18 70:7 Simon 34:19 Sinn 7:12 8:33 9:12,27 10:5,9 14:32 17:32 20:10 22:30 23:17,31 24.14 28.10 Snell's 20:22 65:14 **SNELL** 18:6,30,31 21:19 45:10 49:7 62:4 63:21 64:10,18,28 65:2 68:24,32 70:11 Sonas 27:27 Special 10:26,27,32 18:33 53:10 54:26 SPC 34:32 39:6.10.14 41:16 43:18 45:28 46:18 47:17 53:32 SPEAKER 33:2 51:12 52:22 53:21,25,28 Square 43:6 State 7:4 10:19 19:19 20:6 36:33 42:5 43:1,4 47:1,22 59:27 63:5 Steve 67:28 68:30 Strategy 34:15 47:32 Street 34:19 Sugarloaf 30:24 32:30 Т table 7:23 27:6 47:31 63.22 tackle 5:13 tactics 26:26 take 1:4 2:18 5:31 8:13 9:20,24 11:21 18:11 20:1 21:26 23:18 28:14,20 31:1 38:12 39:26 42:10 44:28 46:13 52:25 56:26

62:15 63:8.22

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

 $64 \cdot 2934$ 65:7,10,13,20 66:19 taken 6:12 15:26.28.30 20:24 28:34 29:13 43:33 62:9,32 64:16 70:22,25 takes 24:9 50:16 62:9 taking 2:12 8:16,34 9:5 10:6 16:31 28:30 37:22 45:33 46:2.3 64:25 65:8.9 talk 1:18 3:19 10:20 13:13 18:24 21:1 25:5,33 30:26 45:19,20 47:27 48:18 50.26 53.28 talked 40:24 51:25 talking 7:18.19 13:12 14:25 17:4,13 18:28 23:2,31 43:6 44:34 talks 42:33 tally 12:10 targeted 6:7 34:13.24 tasked 1:34 tasks 1:21 tax 1:12.13.14.18.21 3:26 6:12,14,20,29 7:5,6,15,27 8:34 9:1,8,16,17,18,21,28 10:13,15,17 11:10,16,17,22,26 12:20.22.24.31.33 13:1,3,5,8,13,23 14:1 15:4.20.34 16:7,20,25,26,27,28,2 9,32,33 17:1,3,7,16,20,22,27, 31,32 18:17,25,28,33 19:1,3,7,13,18,28,29, 34.2 taxation 16:29 22:4,8 taxed 9:3,19 taxes 9:7 13:34 14:2,3 16:30 17:14 18:1 21:30 taxing 10:17 taxpayer's 21:25 taxpayer 22:14 team 15:12 32:26 tease 68:7 technically 26:9 47:2 technology 59:18 tell 8:10 14:2,15 25:7 26:7 28:13 44:26 60:11 66:13 ten 6:22 24:9 34:14.15 39:33 44:7 53:25,26 59.25 tenancies 34:20 tenancy 20:15 47:23 tenants 56:11 tender 32:9 tens 56:13 tent 34:3 term 33:29 35:26 37:18 42:7 49:16 50:31,32 68:7 terms 8:14 21:15 25:20 28:6 30:30 36:13.19 41:34 52:7 text 1:1.2 5:20 texting 61:33 than 6:11 10:13 11:21 15:21,27,32 16:19 19:22 22:16 29:16 34:34 36:30 37:27 41:23 54:3.31 55:29 57:29 58:7 59:7 65:27,28 66:4,26 70:13 thanked 20:19 that 1:15,30 2:1,18,19,20,21,23,28 ,32 3:1,5,6,17,20,23 4:5 5:14,16,25,29,31 6:11,12,14,18,19,20,2 6.27.28.30.34 7:7,10,12,14,20,24,31

32.34 8:1,2,3,6,7,8,10,11,12 .15.23.27.29.30.31.33 9:6,7,8,12,17,21,27,2 931 10:34,13,18,19,20,21, 24,27,30,31 11:2,3,4,6,7, the 1:1,2,3,4,10,12,13,14, 18,21,22,24,27,28,29, 34 2:1,2,6,7,9,11,13,17,1 8,20,21,22,23,26,28,2 9,31,34 3:2,4,5,6,10,11,13,16, 22,23,24,26,27,28,29, 32.34 4:3,4,5,7,10,12,13,16, 17,18,19,22,24,26,29, 32.33 5:1,6,8,9,11,13,15,19, 20,22,23,26,27,28,31, 32,33 6:1,3,6 their 2:22 7:6,27 9:7 11:15.18.20 12:34 13:5 17:28 18:3,9 19:10,18 20:2,19 21:33 22:3,4,9,14,15,16 24:21 25:11,12,16,17 26:29 27:34,1,2 31:18,21 33:10,30,33 36:13.34 37:4,23,25,32,34 39:26 40:13,14 42:12,13,18,20 45:6,11,25,32,33 46:15 47:23 51:22 52.142them 2:23,24 3:5 4:22,24 7:19 10:21 11:16 13:14 14:1 15:3 16:27 17:4 18:1 22:10,14 24:20,25 26:15 27:25 31:4.29.32 32:19.27 34:6.7.27 35:2.6.18.19 36:30 37:26 40:28 41:11,27 43:6,11,30 44:1,10 45:4,23,25 46:3,10 47:2,24 48:33 49:22.30 51:22 52:23.24.25 53 themselves 42:31 44:14 54:6 59:11 67:11 then 1:22,27 2:15,26 3:6 5:4,27 6:13,23 9:8 11:21 12:9 13:7 17:28 18:6 20:16 22:12 23:11 24:6.19 25:9,17 27:12 28:9,20 30:34 32:8.32 33:14 34:11,28 36:27 37:1 38:24 39:20 40:31 42:14 46:13 48:31,33 49:8 56:6 57:32 60:2 62:26 63:8.18.21 67:19 69:25.26 70:1 there 3:10 4:25 5:25.33 6:13,17,19,20,26,29,3 2,34 7:12,19 8:25 9:5,32,33 10:2,3,4,7 11:6,30 13:22,23 14:13.14.22.23.27 15.2 19 23 16:10.19.22 17:9 18:18 19:11.34 20:29 21:9,15,21,23,27 22:21,24,28 23:12,16,20,26 24:17,26 25:3,7,17 26:15 27:18,19,21 28:6,1 therefore 11:20 24:23 36:1 47:10 63:7 70:1

these 7:18 12:1 13:12.34 14:16 16:5.8 18:19,26,27 19:18 20:17 21:3 22:4 25:26 29:33 30:11 32:18,28 33:9 34:2 37:22 38:15 40:29 41:1 42:9.10.12.17 43:11.24 44:10 45:32 47:21 52:5.9 54:31 56:10 57:10 58:15,21 59:1 63:16,27 64:13,19 65:19 67:26 68:20 they'll 6:10 14:2 25:11 they're 10:5,6 11:11,30 15:24 16:33 17:25,26 18:10 31:22 37:5 52.9 they've 2:4,33 5:26 30:11 they 2:17,21 3:5,21,33 4:4,23 6:22 7:34,6,13,29 8:7,16,22 9:20,22,24 10:26,31 11:6,10 12:18.25 13:12,14,15,28,29 14:1,14,31,32,33 15:10 16:5,29 17:25,34 18:1,3,4 19:10,19,32 20:11 22:34,3,9,13,15,30 24:11.21.23.28.29.32 25:5.7,8,10,11,17,22 26:33,34 27:2, thick 59:32 thing 7:28 8:10,34 11:11,12 12:29 14:9 18:1.8 21:26 22:34 34:34 36:6 41:26 48:21 51:12 52:4 57:26 62:25 63:33 65:4 67:18 68:6 things 6:20 7:19 8:17,20 11:27 12:18 14:7 16:5.10 21:19 25:19 27:31 34:29 35:3 41:12 42:10 44:17.28 52:6 54:22 57:1.2 59:33 63:22 64:24 65:20 66:3 think 1:15 7:13,17,18,28,30,31 8:8 9:4 10:14,19 11:10 12:24,26,34 13:17.32 14:13.21 15:1.4.14.18.19.24 16:8,10,13,29 17:20 18:10,29 20:18,19,28 22:15,22 23:11,14 25:25 26:17 27:17.32 29:16 33:1 36:34 37:10 38:21.29 39:5.8 41:16 42:5.27 43:16,25,26 44:1,33 thinking 22:10 54:2 56:22 thinks 65:3 third 28:11 40:24 44:1 68.32 thirds 52:34 this 1:22,23,33 2:7,27,32 3:23 4:10,19,26 5:5,17 6:21 7:13,20,23,32 8:3,10,14,18,21,26 9:1,16,18,20,21,23 10:9,11,16,17,34 11:14.17.22.23.32 12:6,18,21,29 13:2,4,17,20,28,30 14:10,19,23,26,28,32, 15:15.19.20.23.30.32 16:14,15,19,20,29,31 17:3.5.6.7.15.2 thorough 57:24

those 2.20 22 3.1 2 7.1 8:15.32 10:4.10 11:31.32 16:6.12 20:19 21:15,18,22 24:28,30,31 25:4,19,29 27:31 28:28 31:33 32:7.17.34 34:7 35:11.19 36:2.4.22.33 37:2,7,26 41:7,9,27 43:15 47:31 49:3,9,10,23 50:21 51:30,32 52:17,34 57:20 though 61:5 68:31 thought 28:12 38:1 66:7 68.2.3 thousand 33:10 46:26,29 50:2 thousands 17:21,22 56:13,14 threat 10:27 threats 38:29 three 11:23 22:19 39:33 40:32 43:33.34 44:16,26 47:9 50:13 52:1 64:2 70:27 through 5:32 8:26 12:23 19:9,13 22:23 23:4 26:3,21 30:10 31:34 32.8 11 35.12 21 37:33 40:29.32 42:10 45:14.22.29 46:18,26,29 47:15,23 48:15 49:19 57:10 60:1 61:33 62:25 63:7 64:17 throughout 13:2 19:19 20.6 45.22 23 47.3 53:7 63:5.6 throw 8:2 thunder 50:9 tied 32:29 till 40:31 time 3:23 6:21 13:29,33 14:26 15:17.21 18:3 19:27 26:25 27:19.23 28:11 31:21 32:13 34:15 35:33 37:5.6 38:21 39:11 40:30 41:10,24 42:10 44:25,28 45:1,14 46:12,15 47:11,15 48:7 49:7.8 50:14 53.7 19 54:5.16.19.21.27 55:30 57:11 60:15 63:32 65:20 66:19 67:21, timeframe 68:14 70:7,8 times 11:5 37:3 39:33 47:26 59:25 timetable 32:14 title 30:16 today's 18:33 today 3:26 4:11,33 7:18,32 8:33 9:28 13:27,30 17:17,21 18.18 19.3 22.20 28:25 43:15.19 46:6 54:25 55:6,15 60:3,32 63:7.15 65:2,7,16,19,22,23 67:20 69:24 together 35:24 46:7,8,11 54:18 60:24 66:27 token 64:17 told 2:21 4:24 8:22 10:24 15:6 32:14 35:33 40:18 44:7,15 46:6,11,13 49:5,9 51:23 59:10 tomorrow 26:28 tonnes 38:18 too 20:25 22:18 32:4 36:31.34 42:4.26 44:30 48:11 49:33 51:19,22 62:8 64:19

top 5:31 6:31 22:3 30:14,23 31:2 35:21 59:22 total 2:17 4:5 15:29 22:27 25:4 31:5 totally 11:32 12:29 15:4 46:33.34 56:9 totted 4:24 touch 46:23.31 68:25 touched 62:29 tourism 18:26 towards 1:27 4:7,12 5:28 16:21 20:31 21:16 26:18 33:22 49:15 town 21:34 22:9,10 41:14 trades 45:3 traffic 12:6 tragic 42:17 training 36:7 55:26 67:21 transcribed 1:1 transcript 1:1,2 transfer 33:21,28 35:4 transfers 40:1 transitional 34:14 transportation 5:2 travel 15:5 travelling 57:11 62:1 trawling 53:17 treated 27:5 43:24 44:9 60:33 treatment 40:27,30 41:2 53:34 trend 42:33 tribute 38:27 tried 62:24 trip 57:28 trips 58:21 trouble 50:11,12 66:13 67:28 true 9:6 39:13 47:21 48:25 trusted 62:10 try 26:30 29:32 31:4,22 42:22 44:30 58:18.21 60:24 66:16 trying 3:10 16:32 24:2 30:20.22 32:12 35:24 37:4 42:31 45:6,7 54:28 58:20 63:20 66:31,32 turned 39:21 59:32 turning 35:2 45:24 two 8:19.25 12:16 13:1.16 18:28 21:19 22:17,19,30 23:23 24:20,23 25:7 28:9,14,32 29:8,15 30:14 31:4,32 32:4 35:28 36:25 38:30 39:22 40:15.32 44:16 45:20 47:32 48:23.27.33 49:4 50:13 51:4,17,23,32 52:1,29,34 53:18 58:13 59:29 60:5,19 64:32 67:10 type 41:5 49:19 Tanaiste 62:26 TDs 47:17,19 Telecoms 25:2 Tenant 33:16,30 Thank 6:8 7:10 8:18,19,33 9:28 10:4.32 11:13 12:11.31 13:32.33 15:3,26 16:23 18:29 20:13.14 22:16.18.29 24:16 33:1 35:26,27 36:20 37:10 38:10,27 39:31,32 41:3,7,9 42:1 44:11,20,27 45:5 48:12.27 52:21 53:32 54:15.20 57:3.24 59:17,21 60:10 63:23 65:25

took 47.15

Thanks 6:9 7:12 10:33 16:25 18:31 20:25 21:29 27:28 35:28 36:21 37:10 38:2,3,10 41:2 42:2,26 44:12 45:10,27 47:28 48:10,11 54:25 55:19 57:6 58:15.34 61:27 62:4 64:4 65:4.23 66:30 69:12 That's 2:14 3:5.7.32 4:4,6,11,32 5:1,28,31 6:7,19,31 7:13,15,23,27,30 8:11 9:21 10:8,30 11:3,7 12:12,27,29 13:21.22.25.28 14:10.15 15:6.7.22.30 16:8,16 17:13 18:24 19:23 21:10 22:22,24 23:1,11,25 24:6,16,24,29 26:3,27 27:6.9 28:10,18,20,23,24 29:8,15,21 3 There's 2:19 5:25,26,28 7:1,4,6,17 9:6,9 12:12 14:26 15:6,27 17:1,3 19:11,30 21:5,8,25 22:4,10,12 23:8,14,17,20,21,22,2 6 24:6 26:7.11 27:29 30:25 31:25 32:11.13 33:7.19 34:15 35:25,32 36:21,30 37:7 38:4,17,18 40:2,4,6,7,9 42:3,14 43:28,32 44:32 46:2,6 47. THORNHILL 64:13 Tommy 15:25 16:24,25 18:34 23:9,26,30,31,33 24:2,8,10 59:28 Tone 43:6 U unable 24:30 41:27 unacceptable 2:2 unaware 44:4 unbelievable 59:32 uncertainty 69:7 unchanged 4:29 23:2 under 5:16 8:25 15:31 19:12 22:22,25 33:19,21 34:23,29 35:2.23 37:17 48:14 54.31 55.32 56.6 59:9 62:14 63:25 67:13 undermine 55:28 understand 6:17 8:2 11:29 13:29,30 25:19 28:27 40:4,21 43:7 44:8 56:7 58:17 61:24 63:26 65:6 understanding 8:27,29,31 22:24 understood 22:7 30:33 undertake 5:13 56:23,24 underway 46:3 unemployment 53:33 unfair 9:4.17 11:17 15:6 19:28 20:27 unfairest 15:32 unfortunately 18:9 19:2 39:20 46:33 47:3 52:32 56:16 unfunded 5:13 uniformity 65:11 **unique** 16:14 unit 31:1 34:14 35:10 49:19 50:10 51:20 53:10 units 27:24 29:30 30:17,23,24,29,34 31:1,3,4,7,23 32:20.27 34:19.31.34 35:11,24 36:28

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

38:5.6.7 46:3.11.19 49:13.28.29.32.33.34 50:16,25,27,33,34 51:2.32 universal 21:32 unjust 11:16 unknown 53:9 unless 11:12 16:21 35:18 41:21 57:20 58:26.29 unlikely 49:33 unnecessary 68:19,22 unpopular 12:5 unsuitable 35:34 36:1 unsustainable 15:5,20 until 5:20 17:23 26:8,18 32.7 15 19 40.26 41:33 52:10 63:34 64:7 68:13 70:6 untoward 58:30 unwieldy 51:34 upcoming 40:2 update 37:10 38:25 upgraded 18:20 upgrading 25:14 uploading 24:27 uptake 8:21 upturn 52:6 urge 42:19,24 45:13 use 25:7,11 28:18,19 31:3 35:4 38:17 41:5.32 46:15 53:14 used 4:7 13:2 22:4.11 28:6 62:29 66:9,28 users 25:15 using 6:28 63:16 utilise 30:3 35:2 utilities 8:10,13,15 25:3,4,11,26 **USC** 13:4 V vacancy 53:8 vacant 1:29 35:4.5 36:4 48:19.20 49:29 50:30 valley 38:17 valuation 2:18,21,22 5:26 10:2,4 25:8,18 valuations 2:11 25:20,24 value 2:19.21 5:29 10:2 11:20 18:18.19.22.27 25:4.5.9 27:19 33:17 valued 3:21 10:3 25:3 values 11:18,21 variation 1:12,21 4:13 18:16 varied 4:18,19 5:23 various 9:33 12:34,6 14:1,3,7 15:34 16:2.11.22 21:1.27 23:11 62:26 66:2 vary 3:27 4:13 varying 4:16 11:29 vast 42:32 verbatim 1:4 verifiable 61:32 69:17,27 70:5.21 versus 53:2 very 6:15 7:10 9:4,16,27 10:9,14 13:33 14:11,13,29 16:8 19:28 20:25 21:31,32 27:22 31:22.29 32:34,25 33:1,28 35:22 37:31 38:1,21,30,34 39:7 41:11,18,25,28 42:1,6,8,32 43:4,23 44:10,28 45:6,15 46:24 47:20 48:2 52:21 54:14 55:1 57:26 58:3.22 59:17 60:14.32 vetted 55:25 via 24:14 viable 30:21 view 15:17 16:26 17:31 24:10.11 51:22 59:4 61:20 65:32 68:21 vigorously 16:13

villages 44:26 visited 30:20 voice 48:9 voted 27:2 70:11 voting 15:1 16:8,26,28,33 17:31 67:7 69:34 70:20,23 Vance 10:24 13:33 20:29 23:6 27:30 28:8,10,21,24,25,28,3 0 29:10 Vodafone 25:2 Vote 11:12 13:27 14:11,15,27 16:26,28,32 17:17 19:20 24:11 28:29.34 29:4,6,13 63:6,17 65:2,7,10,13,16,22 69:24 70:25 W wait 40:31 64:7 waiting 6:21 48:2 53:8 waiver 54:26 55:3,7 62:5,15,33 63:9 65:23 waivers 54:31 65:19 walk 3:17 16:3 55:2 walked 23:31 want 1:18 2:7 5:17 7:28,29 9:1,27 10:26 12:13,18,23 14:1 16:25,27,28,33 20:5,34 21:14,24 23:12 24:6,8,11,12 25:33 26:26 27:7.34 28:1,3,16 31:29 32:31 34:33 40:4 43:12 44:5,13 46:23 47:8 48:11,13,16,28,32 51:13 52:8,9 53:1,32 54:15,20,23 55:18,28 59:12 60: wanted 27:28 31:34 32:11 51:26 60:3 61:16 63:15 wanting 29:28 wants 2:22 14:2 19:34 59:12,14 63:30 65:31 66:5 warts 5:5 was 1:34 2:17,32 3:17 5:19 6:28 7:4.27 8:11,20,21,27,29 9:5 10:24,25,27 12:33 13:3,6 14:3,4,5,20 15:31,32 16:7,15,20 17:5.10 18:5.21.23 19:5,14,34 20:6,9,29 22:6.7.11 23:3.5.10 25:30 26:1,14,25 27:1,19,21 28:15,17,25,28 30:2,14,17,19,20,25 31:13,14,17,18 wasn't 27:21 36:1.16 39:8.11 50:6 waste 46:12 52:6 wasted 23:21 watched 21:19 wave 33:25 53:9 way 3:22,23 6:20 9:13 10:3 12:29 13:27 20:31 21:14 23:26 24:11 27:5 31:29 32:30 37:15 41:27 42:10 43:16,20 54:34 55:28 56:15 57:29,30 58:6,15,16,18 59:1 61:9,10,32 62:1 63:4,9 66:19,22,25 68:22 69:34 ways 57:12 60:8 65:18 we'd 32:28 we're 1:9,21,27 2:14 3:1,9,20,26 4:12,24,30 6:15,18 8:1.7.17 10:17 11:3 12:1.27 13:8.17.21

14:15,25,30 15:5,6,11

16:26 17:4,13,27,29 18:9.19.22.23.28 19:26,27 20:3 21:30 23:4,23 24:17,24,26 25:20 27:25 28:24,27,29 29:28 30:6,30 31:26,32 32:18.24 33:7.9.32 we've 2:10 3:22 4:32 11:5 12:15 13:34 17:5 21:21 22:26 23:13 27:5 30:8,15,24 31:26,28 37:21 39:21,24 41:10 42:13 52:11,14 53:21,33 57:14 64:5 65:14 weak 41.25 wearing 47:19 weasel 24:2.3 website 5:20 56:24 week 1:33 3:1 4:23 5:32 6:28 17:14 34:4 40:19 51:17 weeks 24:20,23 29:28 43:34 44:16 46:10 51:18 welcome 35:29 37:11,14 42:2,3,23 60:30 welcomed 45:12 welfare 5:4 14:7 40:7 well 4:4,32 7:1,2 9:5,18 10:20,31 14:23,29 17:16 20:31 21:3.8.9.11.13.15 22:28 24:9,24 34:28 35:32 36:1 37:14 39:25 40:21 41:7,18,23 42:6 43:21 46.2 47.29 48.12 13 52:24 57:8 60:10.18 63:14 64:16 68:4,6,9 69:32 went 6:28 8:6 10:28 18:4 23:6 25:24 26:34 31:33 34:31 35:12 49:2.9.22 51:25.27 54:11 59:3 were 2:18 5:21.22 8:6 9:3.16 10:24.28.31 11:25 13:7,23 14:6 16:5,12 17:34 22:30 27:20,23,29,31,32 30:17,22 31:13.14.15.34 32:12 35:11 36:8,9,10 37:12.34 39:2.7.11.13 40:18 44:33 45:19,22 46:5,11 47:22 49:5,10 51:15,19,32 53:19 54:4 55:25 58:7,9,11,32 59:1 weren't 3:5 west 35:30.31 36:25.29.31 37:7 44:6,25,26 45:21 46:14 60:9 western 41:12 what's 9:23 15:8,22 19:12 31:11 32:3 36:22 38:25.26 45:13 50:15.32 60:21 64:26.27 66:13 what 2:23 3:32 4:5,6,11,25,26 6:14,17 7:13 8:13,14,17,21 9:34 10:11,30,31 11:3,4,8,11,24,34 12:15.28 13:1.28 14:12,13 15:9 16:1,7 17:13,17,25 18:24 19:5,31 20:33 21:1,6,30 22:10 23:9,16,17 25:1,18 26:1,18 27:6,9,19,27 30:3.6.8 32:1.32 34:3.4 37:20 38:20 3

whatever 36:14 62:6 67.20 whatsoever 46:16 when 2:31 4:33 6:12,13,26 7:5 8:6 9:16 12:5 13:3,14,29 15:11,15 16:5 17:4 18:4 19:27 21:1.12.30 22:6 23:6.11 24:12 29:3.20 30:9.25.26 32:29 33:19 36:13.34 37:16 39:2,7,28 40:27 42:29,33 43:23 44:9 47:20 49:9 50:25 52:5,20 53:17 54:4 56:17 57:30,32 58:9 59 where 6:21.31 8:26 10:5,10 11:30 12:1 14:16,32 16:11 18:9,15,31 19:15,23 22:3,30 23:3 24:24,29 25:10 27:25.32.33.34 28:21.25 29:32 30:20 31:25,26 32:17 34:11 35:24.29 36:24 37:25 39:3 40:16,17 43:5,9 44:4,14,15,17 45:34 46:11 47:9 49:10,14,18,22,24 50.2.2whereby 42:12 whether 13:30 17:17 44:9 48:18.22 61:23 62:6 65:22,34 66:34 67:14 68:5 which 1:21 4:18 6:24 7:13 8:13,16 12:33 13:2 15:23.28 16:10.12.14.18.21.22 18:21 19:6.26 20:8 24:11 30:21 31:18,33 32:9 34:12 35:23 37:5 38:21 39:13,19 41:5 42:16 43:24,32 44:7 46:1 47:10.25 49:5.11 51:17 53:22 54:30 55:10.24 56:33 57:15,29 58:14 60:21 62 whichever 64:18 65:15 while 1:4 11:23 18:34 20:2 23:5 37:32 45:15.16.24 47:34 56:9 67:30,31 68:17 whistle 10:26 who 2:14,22 3:20,21 7:14,23,24 10:16,25 11:21,29,30 12:32 13:12,15,27 14:32 15:2.16 16:7 19:16 20:2.9.15.17 27:31.34 28:1 32:27 34:33 36:10.26 37:3.31 39:17 41:27 42:28,30 43:15,23 44:6,7,14,24 45:21 46:27,28,29 47:21,27 48:3 52:5 60:16.17 62:26 63:2.10.1 whoever 66:8 whole 2:7 18:16 23:14 32:33 35:24,25 36:7,10 44:17 45:22 47:7 51:17 52:33 57:6.22 61:25 62:28 65.4 68.6 whose 55:34 56:3 66:20 68:34 why 7:4 13:21 15:8 22:13 28:30 30:33 31:10 32:6 43:7 49:14,15 57:9 60:5 62:32 63:4,17,21 64:1 65:6 66:14.18 67:1 widths 51:26 wife's 59:33

Premier Captioning & Realtime Ltd. www.pcr.ie

will 1.30 2.1 21 22 29 4:17.33 6:3 8:27 9:27 10:6.11.21 12:10,24,26 14:23,27 15:12 16:6,32 17:15,16 18:1 19:26,30 20:17 23:13 24:13,28,31 28:19 30:4.26.27 31:2.7.8 32:17,26,27,32 33:30 34:21 35:26 37:2 38:6,7,8,13,20,21 39:23 40:32 41:1,2,7 42:12 43:2,33 willing 16:32 62:3 **willy** 14:30 winners 51:7 wiser 67:8 wish 19:10 26:27 42:18 63:28 with 1:10,13,34 2:18,32 4:6 6:34 7:7,34 8:14,25 10:1,2,10 11:2,5,7,11,16,17,21, 33 12:14,15,20,28 13:1,4,7,28 14:7 15:14,18,30 16:1,11,14,27,30,33 18:19,22,33 19:1,9 20:1,3,26 22:6 23:32 24:18.20.25.32 26:26.34 27:22.25 28:8.29 29:4.28 30:4 31:23.34 32:17. within 3:27 19:31 24:26 25:22 31:21 43:34 45:33 49:27 55:24 56:25 67:16 68:12 without 10:10 12:21.22 13.21 28.4 47.12 55:2 58:8 59:1 66:3 witness 66:20 wizardry 6:28 woman 60:3 won't 5:32 10:7 22:18 35:18 39:8 42:26 44:14 45:34 48:11.34 52:7 wonder 6:19 40:12 wondered 38:1 wonderful 45:6 wondering 23:2 40:1 41:3 48:25 62:2 word 26.7 11 45.13 46.5 worded 69:34 words 24:3 work 12:29 22:6 24:30 25:17 29:29 30:20 31:21 32:11 33:11,33 34:10,33 36:12,34 38:28.33 40:17.20 43:25 45:6 47:5,24,30 48:13 50:4 52:16 53:30 54:17,18,29 58:34 60:17,24 62:32 65:1,26 66:4,32 workable 65:27 69:10 worked 11:6 66:27 worker 53:15 workers 21:15 working 33:12 39:30 43:20 51:33 52:15 53:11 64:6,12 67:2 works 1:30 31:14 41:34 51:21 57:33 world 14:9 19:2 worse 10:18 15:27,32 57:3 worth 2:15 23:5 worthwhile 23:3 worthy 30:12 wouldn't 12:17,21 13:24 22:13 37:33 46:13 63.10 wrap 34:11 write 64:29 67:25 writing 57:31 58:11 61:7,23

written 55:10 58:24 wrong 5:28 7:7 16:8 25:27 44:34 70:13 Walsh's 70:15,16,17 Walsh 9:32 20:13,14 26:25 38:3 64:4 69:7,13 70:12 Water 2:5,9,12,14,34 3:4.6 5:2 8:1.3.14 13:34 16:14 17:27 21:33 22:4,22,24 23:20,32 24:18,19,20,23,27,32, 33 26:21 36:26,28 37:9 40:27 41:16 46:6.13 49:7 We'll 1:9 9:11,27 14:9 16:28 17:7 20:19 28:14,16,20 29:4,25 30:3,4 31:4 32:33 33:30 34:28,34 35:7,11,14,17 39:21 44:8 46:7.8.18 49:6.18.33 50:5,19,20,24,25.27.3 4 53:4.10.14.23.28 54:19,22 58:32,33 65:20 66:19,25 67:8 68:11 70:18 Wexford 64:23 Wherever 17:28 45:33 WHITMORE 38:10 Wicklow's 11:22 Wicklow 1:3.7 2:11,14,18,26 3:32,33 4:4,22,26 6:1,3,6,13,23,30 7:24,28 9:4.7.10.14.17.19 11:18 13:1 15:29 16:14 17:2,11,14,16,29 18:27 19:10,12,13,16,22,23, 28 20:3,7,9,27,29 21:24,34 23:7 25:24 27:21 28:19 29:26 30:20.34 32:20 33:16 34:5.14 36:26.33 37:8 Winters 12:13,14 69:30 70:18 Wolfe 43:6 Would 2:23 4:10 5:14 6:20,22,27 7:1,9,12 8:23.25.29 9:13.33 11:16.32 12:8.14.19 13:5.6.33 15:14.19 16:5,15 17:9,12 18:14,17 19:10 20:1,9,11,25 22:12,30,32,34 23:17 25:19.31 26:7.17.23 27:1,12 28:21,30 31:19 33:32 35:14 36:14,24 37:11,14 38:8,12,18 39:3,4 Х X's 57:32 Y year 1:14 2:11,27 3:23 5:15 6:17 7:14,20 8:11,27,29 9:6 10:24,27,32,34 11:24 12:21,33 13:15,17 16:1,2,5,6,7,20 17:16 19:5,10,11,12 20:34 22:26 23:21 25:29 26:19 27:19 28:4,26,28 30:17 31:32 34:25 35:7.12.25 38:4.30 43.8 45.2 22 49:12,15,20,32 50:31 54:9,1 years 2:31 4:10 6:22 10:1 12:17 13:16,34 14:20

21:9,12 23:23

$\begin{array}{c} 25:4,12,19\ 35:18\\ 37:30\ 38:30\ 39:4,6,22\\ 40:18,32\ 41:10\ 42:33\\ 44:7,21\ 47:32\ 50:7\\ 52:24\\ 53:22,23,25,26,31\\ 54:3,11\ 69:21\\ \textbf{yet}\ 6:9\ 7.6\ 15:10\\ 19:13,22\ 20:1\ 25:34\\ 32:23\ 33:9,25\ 42:23\\ 44:22\\ \textbf{yield}\ 50:32\ 51:2\\ \textbf{you'l}\ 30:22\ 31:25\ 35:7\\ \textbf{you'd}\ 23:12\\ \textbf{you'l}\ 30:22\ 31:25\ 35:7\\ \textbf{you're}\ 1:15\ 7:15\ 9:5,34\\ 10:18,22\ 14:20,22\\ 16:26,28\ 17:18,26,31\\ 18:7\ 23:23\ 24:4,6\\ 28:11\ 44:15\ 59:14,19\\ 60:9\ 65:14\\ \textbf{you're}\ 28:1\\ \textbf{you're}\ 28:1\\$	$\begin{array}{c} 8:3,10,18,19,20,31,33\\9:11,24,28,29,32,33\\10:2,4,15,20,32\\11:7,13\\12:11,31\\13:32,33\\14:1,2,12,20\\15:3,5,26\\16:23,28\\17:1,23,31\\18:29\\20:5,6,13,14\\22:16,18,25,28,29,32\\23:6,31,4\\22:16,18,25,28,29,32\\23:6,31,4\\22:16,18,25,28,29,32\\23:6,31,4\\22:16,18,25,28,29,32\\23:25,21,23,23\\23:25,22,23,22\\23:25,21,23\\23:25,22,22,22\\23:25,25,12,26,1\\28:11,13\\29:18\\30:15\\33:20,21,31\\38:13,22\\43:3\\46:7,8,9\\63:7,28,34\\66:15,17\\\mathbf{yourself}\\47:14\\\mathbf{yourself}\\47:14\\\mathbf{yourself}\\47:14\\\mathbf{yourself}\\47:14\\\mathbf{yourself}\\55:0;6,24\\51:10\\64:32\\66:25\\67:18\\69:24,29\\\mathbf{Yes}\\9:6,30\\12:24\\18:6\\53:6\\63:29,31\\70:30\\\mathbf{yist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf{xist}\\17:30\\\mathbf$	Z 24:7 27:17 28:18,27,28 51:11 58:10 67:12,24,28,31 70:6,8,9,21 000 3:1,7,14,15,16,17,21 5:27,28,29,31 6:2,19,27 7:17,26 8:25,26,27,29,30 16:2,4 18:21,22 22:21,24,26,27 23:7,25 24:29 25:29 26:3,9 33:8 37:17 38:18 47:1,2 52:23 100 3:32 5:25,27,31 6:2,34 11:24,26 16:33 17:17 39:3 47:1 112 47:23 11am 70:31 120 34:5 47:21 129 23:7 13th 51:16 140 54:13 145 22:26	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{145k} \ 26:23 \\ \textbf{150} \ 3:14 \ 5:27 \ 6:19 \\ \ 8:25,26 \\ \textbf{160} \ 39:1,33 \\ \textbf{165} \ 52:29 \\ \textbf{170} \ 4:14 \\ \textbf{171} \ 2:19,20 \ 10:2 \\ \textbf{190} \ 2:18 \\ \textbf{195} \ 3:14 \ 7:17 \\ \textbf{1st} \ 1:14 \ 34:4 \ 53:10 \\ \textbf{200} \ 3:14 \ 5:27 \ 6:27 \ 7:17 \\ \textbf{16:4} \ 22:24 \\ \textbf{2007} \ 54:3,4 \\ \textbf{2008} \ 21:21 \\ \textbf{2010} \ 62:24 \\ \textbf{2011} \ 52:19 \ 54:11 \\ \textbf{2012} \ 1:13 \\ \textbf{2013} \ 54:8 \\ \textbf{2014} \ 18:4 \ 20:6,8,10 \\ 24:19 \ 54:9 \ 55:22 \\ \textbf{2015} \ 5:11 \ 31:5 \ 34:16,31 \\ \textbf{2016} \ 16:7,15 \ 2:4,9,17,27 \\ 3:13,20 \ 18:17 \ 25:4 \\ 33:8 \ 35:11 \ 45:2 \\ \ 49:20 \end{array}$	2017 1:21,29 2:7,12,21 4:13,25,27 18:11 24:23,29 27:2 31:5 2018 2:27 17:16 31:5,6 35:11 56:34 2019 54:14 2020 40:25 2021 35:10 40:24,26,31 20th 5:20 217 34:5 47:21 22nd 51:31 230 52:29 231 3:7 250 3:1,14,15,21 8:2 16:4 17:15 24:29 38:18 252 52:29 25th 51:19 26th 1:7 5:20 275 3:16 22:26 28th 51:31 29th 49:23 51:18 300 3:15 5:28 17:15 30th 3:28 321 40:18 350 5:29 50:2 400 2:20 10:2	40s 43:3 45:9 420 22:21,27 26:1,3,9 420k 27:11 4300 20:15 500 33:14,19 41:30 563 4:14 580 3:16 7:26 585 6:30,31 5pm 71:1 5th 40:28 600 16:2 600k 27:11 641 33:8 6th 49:23 703 25:4 752 2:20 10:2 7th 70:31,32,33 80s 23:32 60:16 886 33:7 44:31 52:34 8th 51:28 900 36:32,33 37:27 46:24 939 36:21
---	---	--	--	---	---

84